# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of

NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF DENTAL EXAMINERS,

Respondent.

### PUBLIC

DOCKET NO. 9343

## <u>COMPLAINT COUNSEL'S RESPONSE TO RESPONDENT'S MOTION TO STAY THE</u> <u>PROCEEDINGS AND [PROPOSED] ORDER</u>

Complaint Counsel does not oppose Respondent's Motion for a Stay of the Proceedings pending a ruling by the Commission on Complaint Counsel's Motion for Partial Summary Decision and Respondent's Motion to Dismiss for the reasons set forth below. Complaint Counsel has attached a Proposed Order incorporating reference to this Response for use in the event the Commission grants Respondent's Motion for a Stay.

- On November 2, 2010, Complaint Counsel filed a Motion for Partial Summary Decision to dismiss Respondent North Carolina State Board of Dental Examiners' affirmative defense under the "State Action Doctrine" so that the proceeding may focus efficiently on those issues as to which there is a bona fide factual controversy.
- 2. On November 3, 2010, Respondent filed a Motion to Dismiss and a Motion to Stay in this matter.

- 3. Pursuant to Commission Rule of Practice 3.22(b), the Commission in its discretion may order that a proceeding be stayed while a dispositive motion is under consideration.
- 4. Complaint Counsel's Motion for a Partial Summary Decision and Respondent's Motion to Dismiss are dispositive motions pending before the Commission. A ruling by the Commission on Complaint Counsel's motion would substantially narrow the issues to be determined at trial and would expedite the proceeding. Alternatively, a ruling by the Commission granting Respondent's motion would be dispositive of this matter.
- 5. Remaining trial preparation includes several items of general discovery, the entirety of expert discovery including expert reports and depositions, preparing the pre-trial brief, identifying exhibits, and witness preparation. An expedited ruling on the stay, followed by the ruling on the dispositive motions, may reduce or eliminate the expenses associated with this remaining trial preparation.
- 6. Complaint Counsel also notes that the Commission granted a stay after a Motion to Dismiss on state action grounds was filed in *In re South Carolina State Board of Dentistry, http://www.ftc.gov/os/adjpro/d9311/031023ordgrntrespmotostaydiscov.pdf* (Oct. 23, 2003).

2

Respectfully submitted,

Richard A. Feinstein, Director Pete Levitas, Deputy Director Melanie Sabo, Assistant Director Geoffrey M. Green, Deputy Assistant Director

Bureau of Competition

s/ Richard B. Dagen

Richard B. Dagen 601 New Jersey Ave, NW Washington, D.C. (202) 326-2628 (202) 326-3496 Facsimile rdagen@ftc.gov

William L. Lanning Melissa Westman-Cherry Steven Osnowitz Tejasvi Srimushnam

Counsel Supporting Complaint

Michael J. Bloom, Assistant Director Erica Meyers Office of Policy & Coordination

### Dated: November 5, 2010

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of

DOCKET NO. 9343

NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF DENTAL EXAMINERS,

Respondent.

### [PROPOSED] ORDER

Having carefully considered Respondent's Motion for Stay of the Proceedings and

Complaint Counsel's Response wherein Complaint Counsel does not oppose the Motion, it is hereby,

ORDERED, that Respondent's Motion for Stay of the Proceedings is granted and that the proceeding is stayed pending review of Complaint Counsel's Motion for Partial Summary Decision and Respondent's Motion to Dismiss.

ORDERED:

By the Commission.

Donald S. Clark Secretary

SEAL

**ISSUED:** 

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on November 5, 2010, I filed the foregoing document electronically using the FTC's E-Filing System, which will send notification of such filing to:

Donald S. Clark Secretary Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Rm. H-159 Washington, DC 20580

I also certify that I delivered via electronic mail and hand delivery a copy of the foregoing document to:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell Administrative Law Judge Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Rm. H-110 Washington, DC 20580

I further certify that I delivered via electronic mail a copy of the foregoing document to:

Noel Allen Allen & Pinnix, P.A. 333 Fayetteville Street Suite 1200 Raleigh, NC 27602 nla@Allen-Pinnix.com

Counsel for Respondent North Carolina State Board of Dental Examiners

### **CERTIFICATE FOR ELECTRONIC FILING**

I certify that the electronic copy sent to the Secretary of the Commission is a true and correct copy of the paper original and that I possess a paper original of the signed document that is available for review by the parties and the adjudicator.

November 5, 2010

By: <u>s/ Richard B. Dagen</u> Richard B. Dagen

5