O1 13 2011

552448
SECRETARY

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

In the Matter of	)	PUBLIC
THE NORTH CAROLINA [STATE] BOARD OF DENTAL EXAMINERS,	)	DOCKET NO. 9343
Respondent.	) ) )	

## RESPONDENT'S MOTION TO STRIKE (IN PART) REBUTTAL REPORT OF PROFESSOR JOHN KWOKA

NOW COMES Respondent, by and through the undersigned attorneys, pursuant to Rule 3.31A(a) of the FTC Rules of Practice for Adjudicative Proceedings, and respectfully moves the Administrative Law Judge for an Order striking (in part) the Rebuttal Report of Professor John Kwoka in the above-captioned matter. In support of this motion, Respondent shows the following:

- 1. The Expert Witness Report of Professor John Kwoka was provided to Respondent by Complaint Counsel on November 26, 2010.
- 2. Respondent provided the Expert Witness Report of Dr. David Baumer to Complaint Counsel on December 20, 2010.
- 3. Professor Kwoka's Rebuttal Report was provided to Respondent on January 8, 2011.
- 4. Respondent moves to strike the following matters and information presented in Professor Kwoka's Rebuttal Report, all of which do not rebut matters set forth in Dr. Baumer's Expert Report:

- page 1 all paragraphs under heading I
- page 2 paragraphs 1 3 under heading II
- page 3 paragraph 2
- page 5 paragraphs 1 and 2 under heading III
- page 7 last sentence of paragraph 4
- page 8 first paragraph
- 5. Counsel for Respondent has conferred with Complaint Counsel about this Motion to Strike (in part), and Complaint Counsel have indicated that they will oppose this motion.

WHEREFORE, Respondent respectfully requests that the Administrative Law Judge:

- 1. Strike (in part) the expert witness rebuttal report of Professor John Kwoka as requested above; and
  - 2. For such other and further relief as deemed just and proper.

This the 13th day of January, 2011.

ALLEN AND PINNIX, P.A.

/s/ Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.

Noel L. Allen Alfred P. Carton, Jr. M. Jackson Nichols Attorneys for Respondent Post Office Drawer 1270 Raleigh, North Carolina 27602 Telephone: 919-755-0505

Telephone: 919-755-0505 Facsimile: 919-829-8098

Email: acarlton@allen-pinnix.com

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 13, 2011, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Federal Trade Commission using the FTC E-file system, which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Donald S. Clark, Secretary Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room H-159 Washington, D.C. 20580

I hereby certify that the undersigned has this date served copies of the foregoing upon all parties to this cause by electronic mail as follows:

William L. Lanning
Bureau of Competition
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Room NJ-6264
Washington, D.C. 20580
wlanning@ftc.gov

Melissa Westman-Cherry Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room NJ-6264 Washington, D.C. 20580 westman@ftc.gov

Michael J. Bloom Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room H-374 Washington, D.C. 20580 mjbloom@ftc.gov Steven L. Osnowitz
Bureau of Competition
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Room NJ-6264
Washington, D.C. 20580
sosnowitz@ftc.gov

Tejasvi Srimushnam
Bureau of Competition
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Room NJ-6264
Washington, D.C. 20580
tsrimushnam@ftc.gov

Richard B. Dagen
Bureau of Competition
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Room H-374
Washington, D.C. 20580
rdagen@ftc.gov

I also certify that I have sent courtesy copies of the document via Federal Express and electronic mail to:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell Administrative Law Judge Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W. Room H-113 Washington, D.C. 20580 oalj@ftc.gov

This the 13th day of January, 2011.

/s/ Alfred P. Carlton, Jr. Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.

#### CERTIFICATION FOR ELECTRONIC FILING

I further certify that the electronic copy sent to the Secretary of the Commission is a true and correct copy of the paper original and that I possess a paper original of the signed document that is available for review by the parties and by the adjudicator.

/s/ Alfred P. Carlton, Jr. Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.

### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

In the Matter of				)	) PUBLIC			
THE NORTH OF DENTAL			BOARD	) )	DOCKET NO	). 9343		
Respo	ndent.			) )				
-	-				OTION TO S			
This n	natter comes	before the	undersigne	d on Resp	ondent's Mot	ion to Stri	ke (in	
Part) Expert	Witness Reb	uttal Report	of Professo	or John Kv	woka. Having	g considere	ed the	
motion, it is h	ereby							
ORDE	ERED, that	Respondent	's Motion	to Strike	(in Part) the	Expert W	itness	
Rebuttal Repo	ort of Profess	sor John Kw	oka is Grai	nted. The	matters in Pro	ofessor Kw	oka's	
Rebuttal	Report	that	shall	be	struck	are	as	
follows:								
ORDERED:								
					hael Chappell Administrative		e	
Date: January	y, 2011					_		