

**Compiled Peer Review Comments w. Responses on the
Dietary Guidelines for Americans, 2010 –12/08/10**

| Chapter | Page No. | Line No. | Comment | Response |
|---------------------------------|----------|----------|--|---|
| General Overall Comments | | | | |
| | | | General Comment: I find the absence of specifics about eating out and navigating the retail food environment to be a big gap. Perhaps this will come at the next phase, for translation to consumers. However, more acknowledgment, other than incidental references to eating out or restaurant portions, of the challenges in the retail food environment (both packaged and restaurant foods) would strengthen this. I suggest adding an appendix and then referring to it in the report text as appropriate. | Deleted “communities”. |
| | | | This is a general recommendation rather than one for the policy document: create lower-literacy (simple, clear) versions of the key messages so they are accessible to less educated audiences and still maintain scientific integrity. | |
| Executive Summary | | | | |
| | ES | | Overall, I do not find any sections that are unclear or inaccurate. The Exec Summary is written at a very high readability and comprehension level (but you probably already know that). | |
| | ES-1 | 3 | I think ‘wise’ food choices is a value judgment. Can this be said in another way, e.g., adherence to recommendations for food choices? | Changed “wise” to “informed”. |
| | ES-1 | 3 | Find a better word than “wise” ... perhaps “informed”... I asked my patients what a wise food choice was and they could not come up with an answer | Changed “wise” to “informed”. |
| | ES-1 | 4 | ..”reduce THEIR risk of chronic” | Changed “the” to “their”. |
| | ES-1 | 7 | This reads very well. My only suggestion is on line 7, consider omitting “communities” from this sentence (communities don’t “live” in the US); the same rewording would apply in Chapter 1, line 213. | Deleted “communities”. |
| | ES-1 | 7 | I think racial and ethnic, or racial/ethnic is preferable to “races”. Although the Census Bureau uses the same term, black and white and Asian and Indian people are not really different races in an anthropological sense and I would prefer not to perpetuate this myth. This language also appears in the introduction. | Changed sentence to read: “...accommodate the food preferences, cultural traditions, and customs of the many and diverse groups who live in the United States.” |
| | ES-1 | 11 | Remove “Similar to the 2005 edition” or rewrite this to explain what is similar....The longer sentence in the introduction is okay but this | Deleted opening phrase as suggested. |

| | | | | |
|--|------|----------------|--|--|
| | | | abbreviated sentence is confusing. | |
| | ES-1 | 18 | Add “affecting all segments of our society, men, women and children,” after “obesity” | Added “affecting men, women, and children in all segments of our society” after “obesity.” |
| | ES-2 | 31 | Delete “Maintain” and replace with “Achieve” | “Achieve” suggests reaching a point and then stopping. In using “Maintain” we are conveying a behavior that persists over time that allows a person to reach a healthy weight (“achieve”) and keep it there over time (“sustain”). |
| | ES-2 | 31 | Delete “achieve” and replace with “attain” | |
| | ES-2 | 32-33 | Delete “continued attention to” and replace with “established a lifestyle that involves” | Text is not intended to cover lifestyles in general but to focus on attention to the specific issues of calorie intake and expenditure. |
| | ES-2 | 37 | Here and throughout, although I know that the term ‘nutrient-dense’ is common, I think it might be one to phase out given that “calorie-dense” is not good and nutrient-dense is, and people will not necessarily be able to make that distinction. Just a comment in case this comes up as you go forward. I am not sure what the alternative would be—nutrient-rich, perhaps. ...Not sure. | At this point there is no generally agreed-upon pre-existing definition of nutrient-dense foods, but the DGAC provided their own definition—in part to counter the multitude of definitions and formulas that are proliferating among the nutrition community. Selecting nutrient dense foods was a major theme of the DGAC report. The discussions of this concept have been refined for clarity and consistency throughout the document. |
| | ES-2 | 38 | How is sodium related to nutrient density? Throughout this document, nutrient density is really used related to calories | To clarify, text revised to read “Americans currently consume too much salt and calories from solid fats, added sugars, and refined grains.” |
| | ES-2 | 38 “Solid Fat” | Replace the confusing term “solid fats” with saturated fats and trans fats, throughout document. “Solid fats” cannot be identified with the Nutrition Facts label and is not consistent with other Federal and IOM expert panel documents. (Solids fats could be interpreted to be those in all animal-source protein). | Solid fats also was a major concern of the DGAC report. The repeated use of solid fats is intentional. Calories from solid fats constitute almost 20% of total calorie intake, but without adding to essential nutrient intake. Additionally, solid fats tend to be higher in saturated and/or trans fatty acids which have clear health related risk. |
| | ES-2 | 38-39 | To be technically accurate, it isn’t the sodium, solid fats, sugars and refined grains that displace nutrient-dense foods. Point would be better made as “Americans currently consume too much food high in sodium.....” and next sentence, This type of food displaces more nutrient-dense foods and makes it difficult..... | Edited so that the sentence reads, “Americans currently consume too many foods and beverages that are high in.....” |
| | ES-2 | 39 | Add “many calories, too” before “solid fats” | See revision above. |
| | ES-2 | 42 | Early in this paragraph “nutrient dense” needs to be <u>defined</u> – as “nutrients per calorie?” rather than nutrients/100g or per serving. This is important, not only to increase public understanding of this concept (i.e. it is important to get all your nutrients while consuming less calories) but because vegetables and fruits, which you have defined on line 42 as “nutrient-dense”, actually have a low density of most nutrients per gram or portion consumed. | See note above. The term “nutrient dense” is defined initially in chapter 1 and further described in subsequent chapters. |
| | ES-2 | 44 | You modify milk as fat free or low fat, so you probably should modify nuts and seeds with “unsalted” | “Unsalted” is unnecessary when describing nuts in a neutral fashion (such as a source of protein or dietary fiber). When used in a recommendation, “unsalted” has been added. |
| | ES-3 | 47 | Delete “sources of” and replace with “in providing” | Edited as suggested. |
| | ES-3 | 47-48 | Delete “consumed in less than recommended amounts.” And replace with “under-consumed but the data regarding efficacy and safety regarding this approach are not conclusive. Adverse events have been reported and caution is needed in making such recommendations.” | This seems to add considerable technical detail that is inconsistent with the rest of the discussion. |

| | | | |
|-------|---------------------------------|---|---|
| ES-3 | 49 | I feel uneasy about a “vegetarian” diet being championed here as embodying the DGs in the sense that many people equate “vegan” with “vegetarian”, and it is not possible to meet requirements for many nutrients from vegan (or many lacto-ovo vegetarian) diets unless fortified foods or supplements are used and ONLY the most nutrient-dense foods are selected (as per the USDA analysis in the DGAC report which confirms this fact). “Vegetarians” simply do not recognize this fact – so either delete the reference to vegetarians here or expand somewhat on the term “adaptations” to make it clear in this important summary what adhering to such a dietary pattern requires. e.g. “vegetarian adaptations of these to ensure they are nutritionally adequate”..... My goal here is to discourage vegans, in particular, from using the current statement to defend this dietary pattern as being safe – and they will, I assure you – potentially jeopardizing pregnancy outcomes and young children in particular. | This statement refers to the USDA vegetarian food patterns, which do meet nutrient needs if followed according to the guidance provided. Elsewhere, the document notes that fortified sources of calcium and B12 should be included. Chapter 4 also describes research on vegetarian patterns, which shows that they can be a healthful way to eat. |
| ES-3 | 49-50 | It is important to tell the readers that DASH is good for more than HTN control. I routinely have patients tell me that DASH isn’t for them since their blood pressure is ok. | The discussions of the DASH Eating Plan and the DASH trials have been clarified to describe them in terms of both blood pressure reduction and contribution to overall health. |
| ES-3 | 54 | As stated it sounds as if all cheese, and juice pose a risk. Change to “milks, cheeses and juices that have not been pasteurized”..... | Edited as suggested. |
| ES-3 | 56 | Include FISH.. many people do not think of them as animal food | Edited as suggested. |
| ES-3 | 65 | Add bullet point “Everyone should know how many calories they need each day and where to find out their need” | This point is discussed in the text of Chapter 2. |
| ES-4 | 67 | Add “Individuals and families should” before “control” | This suggestion would make this bullet point not parallel with the others. |
| ES-4 | 72,86 | Reverse order. Put positive behaviors before negative/restrictive behaviors. See my comments on chapters 3,4 | These sections match the order of the chapters. |
| ES-4 | 72 | Add to subheading “/ Limit/ Avoid” after “Reduce” | This chapter title has been changed to Foods and Food Components to Reduce. |
| ES-4 | 74-81 Foods to Reduce | Make the section Foods to Reduce consistent with Foods to Increase. Bullet reduction in foods that are the major sources of Saturated Fat and trans fat.(see 3-5,106-109).trans fat (3-6,131) added sugars (3-10, 207-209)—and so forth. | The Key Recommendations listed here correspond to the order of sections in the chapter. |
| ES-4 | 76 | Be consistent throughout the entire document. Use dietary cholesterol | Edited as suggested. |
| ES-4 | 83 | Delete “and only by adults of legal drinking age”? Just put “in moderation and only by adults-up to...”. As stated it stands out as a legal issue only which does not fit the purpose of the DGs. | This recommendation has been edited to delete the second sentence about heavy drinking. |
| ES-4 | 84-85 Alcohol | Confusing message. Is it ½ drinks women and man per day? Or is it on any single day, no more than 3 drinks for women/ 4 drinks for men? | See comment above. |
| ES-4 | 86 | Delete “Increase” in subheading and replace with “Consume Instead” | Chapter title has been changed to Foods and Nutrients to Increase. |
| ES -5 | 93-94 Milk and milk products | Increase intake of low-fat or fat-free milk, and milk products, including milk, yogurt, reduced fat cheese, etc.—by replacing whole milk products and cheese | This point is discussed in the text of Chapter 4. |

| | | | | |
|--|------|------------------------------|--|--|
| | ES-5 | 95 Protein foods | Since egg intake is not encouraged ad lib, do not include in list; show in food group. | Eggs are included because they are an important source of protein. The recommendations in the USDA food patterns show how the amounts of various types of foods can be balanced to meet needs within caloric limits. The amounts of all food categories are listed, not as “limits” but as recommendations. Inclusion of eggs is fine, but because of their high cholesterol content the amounts in the patterns are balanced. Amounts in the USDA patterns are based on proportionate consumption within the protein foods group. (i.e. percent of protein group amount assigned to eggs represent the same proportion in which eggs are consumed among all protein foods in the population). |
| | ES-5 | 95-96 Protein foods | This bullet is sufficient without lines 97-100. | Lines 97-98 (seafood recommendation) reflects a key recommendation of the DGAC. Lines 99-100 (substitution of lower solid fat for higher solid fat choices) reflects a major theme of the DGAC report and DGA, namely that reducing solid fat not only helps people achieve appropriate calorie intakes but can reduce chronic disease risk. |
| | ES-5 | 96 | “beans and other legumes, soy...” | The term “legumes” is used on first mention of beans and peas in the text of Chapter 4. |
| | ES-5 | 97-98 Seafood | If seafood intake is to be increased, it should be prepared without breading and should not be fried. | The Key Recommendations are intended to be brief and concise. The chapters and appendices provide additional guidance on details such as preparation methods. |
| | ES-5 | 99-100 Protein foods | Delete this bullet. The identification of foods higher in solid fats would be open to interpretation since there is no scientific/chemical definition of solid fats. | This recommendation reflects a major theme of the DGAC report. |
| | ES-5 | 103 | Be specific. Is a “nutrient of concern” too little or too much | The use of the word “more” earlier in the recommendation makes it clear that these are nutrients of concern because they are consumed in lower-than-desirable amounts. |
| | ES-5 | 103-104 Nutrients of concern | Add modifier low-fat or fat free milk and milk products. | Full-fat milk and milk products also provide vitamin D and calcium. Restricting this to only fat-free and low-fat milk and milk products would be misleading. The suggestion to consume fat-free and low-fat milk and milk products is made repeatedly in the remainder of the document. |
| | ES-5 | 107 | Most people won’t have any idea what heme iron is. “Choose foods (lean meat and poultry).... This is still tricky of course because elsewhere the DGs suggest replacing such foods with fish etc. (Isn’t fish a similarly good source of iron even though it isn’t heme?). It will not be understood what is meant by “additional iron sources” and examples need to be provided here. | The Key Recommendations are intended to be brief and concise. The chapters provide explanatory details. The primary audience for this document is professionals, not consumers and they should be familiar with the term. |
| | ES-5 | 107-108 Heme iron | Give examples of food high in heme iron that are consistent with DGAs. | The Key Recommendations are intended to be brief and concise. The chapters provide explanatory details. The primary audience for this document is professionals, not consumers and they should be familiar with these sources. |
| | ES-6 | 110-111 Folic Acid | Give examples of foods that are major sources of synthetic folic acid. | The Key Recommendations are intended to be brief and concise. The chapters provide explanatory details. The primary audience for this document is professionals, not consumers and they should be |

| | | | | |
|-------------------------------|------|----------|--|---|
| | | | | familiar with these sources. |
| | ES-6 | 111 | Add bullet point: "Do not drink alcohol if pregnant or pregnancy is planned." | The Key Recommendations are intended to be brief and concise. The chapters provide explanatory details. This point is explicitly made in Chapter 3. |
| | ES-6 | 116 | Add to check local marine advisories for rivers, lakes, sounds. | The Key Recommendations are intended to be brief and concise. The chapters provide explanatory details. |
| | ES-6 | 124 | Add "for the entire family" after "eating patterns" | The DGA is directed to all Americans, including individuals who do not live within a family structure. |
| | ES-6 | 125-127 | "Eating pattern template" Please clarify. The meaning of this bullet is unclear. | "template" deleted here. |
| | ES-6 | 127-128 | "Account for all foods/beverages..." Please clarify. The meaning of this bullet is unclear. | This recommendation is discussed in detail in Chapter 5. |
| | ES-6 | Footnote | "mcg" needs to be defined I imagine as "micrograms" was used in the text. Should this read "supplements taken with meals and fortified foods"? | This footnote has been deleted because the bullet was removed. |
| Chapter 1 Introduction | | | | |
| | | | Generally good overview. | |
| | | | This section is substantially strengthened over previous DGAs. | |
| | | | This chapter is generally clear and accurate. | |
| | 1-2 | 27 | Add orthopedic problems | In the interests of brevity, this list includes only those diseases and conditions described in the accompanying sidebar. |
| | 1-2 | 46 | Delete "31%" – it adds nothing to "about one out of three". | Edited as suggested. |
| | 1-3 | 57 | Delete "diabetes" in the phrase "vast majority of diabetes" | Edited as suggested. |
| | 1-3 | 66 | Consider deleting the first sentence as it adds little to the DGs and tends to undermine them. | Edited as suggested. |
| | 1-3 | 69-71 | Shouldn't obesity (excess calorie intake) be stated here? Important. | This bullet covers dietary factors in addition to obesity. |
| | 1-5 | 106 | Add a description to define what a modeling analyses is | Description has been provided in a footnote. |
| | 1-7 | 144 | ...them with NUTRIENT-DENSE foods..... This will help to reinforce AND explain this concept. | Sentence already includes concept of nutrient density. |
| | 1-7 | 149 | I think you should use the term fish and seafood. I understand your definition found in page 4; but again when I tried with my patients who fish in rivers and lakes, they did not call their catch seafood... they called it "fish". If you stay with just the single word seafood, you should give your definition that it includes FISH here. | Explanatory parenthetical "(i.e., fish and shellfish) added after "seafood" |
| | 1-7 | 151 | Be consistent throughout the document and Always use DIETARY FIBER not just fiber | We have inserted "dietary" before fiber as appropriate (in some cases "fiber" refers to both dietary and functional fiber and therefore the modifier "dietary" is not correct). |
| | 1-8 | 175 | FOODS don't exclude solid fats etc...needs rewording. | This has been edited for clarity. |
| | 1-9 | 202 | ...and BY USDA's....(as stated sounds like the ARS is a component of NIH) | Edited as suggested. |
| | 1-9 | 213 | Races... | Changed sentence to read: "...accommodate the food preferences, cultural traditions, and customs of the many and diverse groups who live in the United States." |
| | 1-11 | 261-2 | This sentence is "silly" – saying that when things are related it "suggests" | Changed sentence to read: "Two factors may be associated." |

| | | | | |
|--|------|-------------------|--|---|
| | | | an association between them. The wording of this explanation needs more thought. | |
| | 1-12 | 276 and following | I could not figure out what the authoritative statements section was trying to say. This seems like a regulatory term that will not be readily understood by others.... | This section has been edited for clarity. |
| | 1-12 | 278 | IS FDAMA only about health claims or does it include other things or statements? | This section has been edited for clarity. |
| | 1-12 | | The paragraph "Development of Authoritative Statements" seems confusing and a bit 'out of the blue' located at the very end of the chapter. It might be clearer after 'development of educational materials & communication' – but on the whole, the FDAMA could use a web citation/year at the very minimum. | This section has been edited for clarity. |

Chapter 2 Balancing Calories to Manage Weight

| | | | | |
|--|-----|-----------------|---|---|
| | | General comment | This section seems to be missing a clearer explanation of the component of energy expenditure, e.g., the basal metabolism, etc. That would might help to explain the energy balance issue related to voluntary energy expenditure | Additional information was provided on basal metabolism. |
| | | | Generally accurate, but getting key messages across could be done better (see below) | (No specific change requested.) |
| | 2-1 | 3 | Add "and avoiding overweight and obesity altogether is the goal." | The importance of primary prevention was highlighted in the text. |
| | 2-1 | 4 | Delete "However," | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 5 | Replace "balance" with "relationship" | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 5-6 | Replace "through eating and drinking" with "from food and beverages" | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 6 | Replace "those" with "calories" | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 7-9 | Delete line 7 & two bullet points | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 10 | Add line "People can control what they eat and drink as well as how much they move." | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 10 | Replace "equal" with "not exceed" | The point of this paragraph is to compare weight maintenance, weight loss, and weight gain. Regarding weight maintenance, "equal" is more accurate than "not exceed". No change made. |
| | 2-1 | 10 | Make it clear when comments about calories and weight are related to adults versus children who are growing and need to gain weight | Modified for clarity. |
| | 2-1 | 11 | Start sentence "Eating too much or consuming more calories..." | Modified for clarity. |
| | 2-1 | 12 | Replace "weight loss occurs when people consume" with "eating less or" | Modified for clarity. |
| | 2-1 | 12 | Delete "they" | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 12 | Add "expend(ed) will help a person lost more weight." | Modified for clarity. |
| | 2-1 | 16 | Add sentence "The greatest risk for obesity is overweight." Add before "Once a person..." sentence. | The concept of the importance of preventing obesity was strengthened in the text. |
| | 2-1 | 17 | Add "back" after "body weight" | Change made. |
| | 2-1 | 18 and 19 | Are you saying that post obese people have a permanently altered energy metabolism and caloric need? Or is it that they are less likely to have the same % of lean mass as people who have never been obese. ...I | This sentence was deleted. |

| | | | | |
|--|-----|-------|--|--|
| | | | didn't have time to check the DGAC report but wanted to flag this to be sure there is evidence to support it. | |
| | 2-1 | 21 | Add sentence "Also, preventing overweight and obesity in childhood will help reduce overweight and obesity in adulthood." | The concept of the importance of preventing obesity was strengthened in the text. |
| | 2-2 | 23 | Put "calorie" in bold too | Change made. |
| | 2-2 | 27-29 | Add "nutrient-dense_ here. | Change made. |
| | 2-2 | 38 | Add "reduced calorie intake and" after "through" | Reduced calorie intake is captured in a separate key recommendation. |
| | 2-3 | 49 | One of the largest change HAS been | Change made. |
| | 2-3 | Table | Readers will not understand how obesity can be defined as being $\geq 95^{\text{th}}$ percentile but 10-20% are obese. I know this is difficult to explain but it should be possible to do so in a footnote. | Modified for clarity. |
| | 2-4 | 77 | I didn't see the discussion of the current prevalence of obesity in Chapter 1 | Sidebar deleted. |
| | 2-4 | 82-84 | Here and elsewhere, I did not see any or much mention of the effect of obesity on functional status (physical), or quality of life or social relationships. Was there any evidence about that? | The intent here was not to provide a comprehensive list of the effects of overweight and obesity on health (mental or physical); rather, a few examples were provided. |
| | 2-4 | 83 | Add hypertension, orthopedic problems | The intent here was not to provide a comprehensive list of the effects of overweight and obesity on health (mental or physical); rather, a few examples were provided. |
| | 2-5 | 95 | Replace "attain" with "achieve" | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 96 | Replace "to" with "in" | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 96 | Add "and role model proper lifestyle behaviors for their children and grandchildren." To the end of the sentence. | This concept is addressed in Chapter 6. |
| | 2-5 | 96 | Add first goal is to stop excess weight gain | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 99 | Add "Parents of" before children and adolescents... | The role of parents in promoting a healthy body weight was emphasized in the chapter. |
| | 2-5 | 99 | Add "help them" before "maintain" | The role of parents in promoting a healthy body weight was emphasized in the chapter. |
| | 2-5 | 100 | Add "Parents of" before children and adolescents... | The role of parents in promoting a healthy body weight was emphasized in the chapter. |
| | 2-5 | 101 | Add "help them" before "make" | The role of parents in promoting a healthy body weight was emphasized in the chapter. |
| | 2-5 | 102 | Add "overtime" after "increase" | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 102 | Phrase it so reader knows children should grow along the curve | The point was to note that, for overweight and obese children and adolescents, BMI-for-age percentile should not increase over time. |
| | 2-5 | 106 | Add "achieve and" before "maintain" | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 107 | Replace "the mother's" with "a mother's" | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 108 | Delete "and" before "improve" | Change made. |
| | 2-5 | 108 | Add "overall quality and quantity of food served to the family and improve" before "long-term health..." | This bullet is referring to the health consequences of maternal obesity prior to pregnancy. The requested addition was not addressed by the Committee in this section. This concept is addressed in Chapter 6. |
| | 2-5 | 108 | Delete " and" before infant and replace with "mother, infant and family." | This bullet is referring to the IOM Gestational Weight Gain Guidelines which are based on maternal and child health. Family |

| | | | | |
|--|------|-----|---|--|
| | | | | was not added here, but this concept is addressed in Chapter 6. |
| | 2-6 | 111 | Give the weight gain guidelines here | Readers are referred to the IOM guidelines. Due to space limitations, the guidelines were not added. |
| | 2-6 | 122 | Add places of worship | The list provides examples and is not a comprehensive list. The environment is discussed further in Chapter 6. |
| | 2-7 | 135 | Might note that fast food are found in places where they were not before (e.g. low population density, rural) | This point was not addressed by the Committee. No change was made. |
| | 2-7 | 141 | Make it "age appropriate portion size" | "Age appropriate" portion size wasn't discussed by the Committee. No change was made. |
| | 2-7 | 141 | Delete "in appropriate portion sizes" and replace with "appropriate in portion size." | Change made. |
| | 2-7 | 142 | Add sentence "Eating more meals at home can help control these variables." | Text modified to address this point. |
| | 2-8 | 170 | Replace "men and women" with "women and men" | Change made. |
| | 2-8 | 171 | Replace "2,640 and 1,785" with "1,785 and 2,640" | Change made. |
| | 2-8 | 172 | Delete "While these estimates don't appear to be excessive," with "The accuracy of" | The description of these estimates was strengthened. |
| | 2-8 | 172 | Replace "are" with "is" | The description of these estimates was strengthened. |
| | 2-9 | 174 | Delete "Thus" and start sentence with "The" | The description of these estimates was strengthened. |
| | 2-9 | 174 | Replace "may be" with "are likely" | The description of these estimates was strengthened. |
| | 2-9 | 183 | Add "These choices illustrate why certain nutrient needs are not likely being met." | This paragraph was deleted. |
| | 2-9 | 186 | Add "SSB and" and "while" | SSBs are addressed in the next sentence. |
| | 2-10 | 194 | Delete "Many" and start sentence with "The majority" | "Many" is more accurate than "the majority." |
| | 2-10 | 195 | Add "often" after "most" | Change made. |
| | 2-10 | 196 | Add "and few, if any, nutrients" after "calories" | Change made. |
| | 2-13 | 213 | Delete "Limiting" and start sentence with "Calorie" | [There isn't a sentence in this section that starts with "limiting."] |
| | 2-13 | 213 | Delete "fundamentally" and replace with "fundamental to achieving and" | Change made. |
| | 2-13 | 214 | Delete "Understanding" and replace with "Knowing your" | Additional text was added regarding "knowing" calorie needs. |
| | 2-13 | 214 | Delete "knowing" and replace with "and the" | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-13 | 214 | Add "is essential" after "food sources of calories" | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-13 | 214 | Delete "and recognizing" | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-13 | 215 | Start sentence with "Understanding the" | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-13 | 215 | Delete "are all" and replace with "is" | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-13 | 216 | Delete "concepts when" and replace with "conceptually to" | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-13 | 217 | Add sentence "Most Americans are unaware of how many calories they need each day or where they are derived in their daily intake." | Text added. |
| | 2-13 | 220 | Add genetics | Genetics is addressed in the first paragraph of the chapter. |
| | 2-13 | 227 | Add sentence "Due to reductions in basal metabolic rate that occurs with aging," as the introduction to "calorie needs generally..." | Change made. |
| | 2-14 | 243 | Add "see MyPyramid.gov for individualized levels." | Text modified for clarity. |
| | 2-15 | 277 | I would delete the "because protein is found in many foods". It could just as easily be the dietary pattern that prioritizes protein foods... | Change made. |
| | 2-16 | 283 | It's not clear what is meant by "...in relation to unsaturated fats." | Change made. |

| | | | | |
|--|------|---------|---|--|
| | | | Because a ratio of saturated to unsaturated fats is not specified, this might be reworded as, "...and not enough unsaturated fats." | |
| | 2-17 | 302 | Add "(AMDR)" after "Range." | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 305 | Acceptable Macronutrient Distribution Ranges." (should be plural) | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 308 | Delete "shown" and replace with "documented" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 311 | Delete "of" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 311 | Add "relevant to body weight." After "factor" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 312 | Delete "are" and replace with "contribute" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 312 | Add "of total calories as" after "45 percent" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 313 | Add "of total calories as" after "35 percent" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 313 | Delete "not" and replace with "no" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 315 | Add "AMDR" before "ranges" | Change made. |
| | 2-17 | 316 | Reference (no final s) | Change made. |
| | 2-18 | 332 | Add "Replace refined carbohydrates with" and delete "increase" | The "replace" concept is addressed in Chapter 4. |
| | 2-18 | 334 | Add "but consistent" after "Moderate" | The Committee's conclusion did not address the consistency of the literature. |
| | 2-18 | 341 | Add "excess" after "provide" | Change made. |
| | 2-18 | 341 | And "or no" after "few" | Change made. |
| | 2-18 | 343 | Clarify by rewording to, "...been met and without exceeding daily calorie limits." (add "and") | Change made. |
| | 2-18 | 346 | Add "(4oz serving)" after "appropriate" | This sentence was deleted in this chapter. Juice guidance is provided in Chapter 4. |
| | 2-18 | 346 | Provide information on appropriate amount. | This sentence was deleted in this chapter. Juice guidance is provided in Chapter 4. |
| | 2-19 | 360 | "milk products DOES not play.." | Change made. |
| | 2-20 | 375 | As I noted above, I worry about the concept of calorie density in a context where nutrient density is used frequently in the positive (and calories are nutrients). | Nutrient density and calorie density were added to the glossary to help clarify the distinction. |
| | 2-20 | 390 | Delete "are" and replace with "have been developed as" | Change made. |
| | 2-20 | 391 | Start sentence with "To date," | The Committee's conclusions do not include "to date." |
| | 2-21 | 396 | "fat, so lean , low-fat" | Change made. |
| | 2-21 | 397-398 | How is a discussion of mono unsat and poly unsat foods related to a discussion of calories. This is what confuses consumers. If talking calories in this section, talk calories and note where things may make a difference in the calories. Patients tell me they stopped eating trans fat but still can't lose weight. | The point is to note that calories are the important factor for body weight, but the type of fat consumed influences other health factors. |
| | 2-22 | 422 | "higher screen time" (or "more" ...) | Change made. |
| | 2-24 | 466 | Define Acceptable Macronutrient Distribution Range and give it here | AMDR is defined earlier in the chapter, and the AMDR ranges are provided earlier in the chapter. |
| | 2-24 | 466 | Delete "Acceptable Macronutrient Distribution Range" and replace with "AMDR" | Change made. |
| | 2-24 | 469 | Add "Self-" in front of "Monitor" both in bullet point and sentence. | "Monitor" was preferred over "self-monitor" as the most plain language term. |
| | 2-24 | 469 | Delete "helps" and replace with "has been shown to help" | Change made. |
| | 2-25 | 475 | Consider adding reference to take out food as well | The Committee did not address "take out food". |

| | | | | |
|----------------------------------|--------|---------------------------|--|--|
| | 2-25 | 475-482 | This is the first time the chapter emphasizes portion sizes. Portion size should be emphasized earlier (and often). The idea of excess 'quantity' gets lost in the heavier emphasis on different types of foods in this chapter | Portion size is also discussed earlier in the chapter. Additional text has been added to emphasize portion size. |
| | 2-25 | 483 | Add "energy balanced" before breakfast | Change made. |
| | 2-26 | 496 | Use weight management, not weight control, throughout the document | Change made. |
| | 2-26 | 499 | Is there any evidence related to time of eating... eg... no closer to bed time than.... hours? | Time of eating was not considered by the Committee. |
| | 2-26 | 511 | Use high blood pressure, high bad cholesterol, high triglycerides (or fat in the blood) | The audience for the policy document is health professionals. The clinical terms are used and defined in the glossary. |
| Chapter 3 Foods to Reduce | | | | |
| | | | Make this Chapter 5. Put the positive chapters: foods to increase; building healthy eating patterns; Evidence suggests that Americans get turned off by being told what not to eat | Order not changed this late in the review process. |
| | Sodium | | Doesn't really fit the 'displaces other good nutrients' context Not sure (?) | Unclear as which line number is being commented on. |
| | 3-1 | Title | Change to "Foods to Limit, Reduce or Avoid" | Changed to Foods and Food Components to Reduce. |
| | 3-1 | Line 1 – title of chapter | Change to "Foods and Food Components to Reduce" – Foods to Reduce is much simpler but the Key Recommendations relate to food components, rather than specific foods; while specific foods that should be reduced are identified throughout sections of Chapter 3, these foods are not included in the Key Recommendations | Changed to Foods and Food Components to Reduce. |
| | 3-1 | 5 | Delete "have" and replace with "consume" | Edit made. |
| | 3-1 | 8 | Add "such as snacks and desserts" after "trans fatty acids" | No change made. These details are discussed on the trans fat section and would be treating TFA different from other nutrients. |
| | 3-1 | 14-15 Alcohol | This section appears to promote moderate alcohol consumption. Rearrangement of sentences might bring clarity and perspective. For example, it is estimated that perhaps 26,000 deaths from CVD and diabetes are due to moderate alcohol consumption. On the other hand, moderate alcohol intake is associated with increased risk of breast cancer. Finally, excessive alcohol consumption is responsible for an average of 79,000 deaths per year in the USA. | Although these statistics were provided in the DGAC report, the sentence on estimate on moderate consumption has been removed. |
| | 3-1 | 15 | Add orthopedics | Further details on consequences of obesity are discussed elsewhere in the document. |
| | 3-1 | 15 | Add mention of cancer; we need to disseminate the fact that obesity is a major risk factor for several important cancers. | Added to say "certain cancer" as stated in Chapter 2. |
| | 3-1 | 16 | "solid fats including..." (delete comma) | Comma deleted. |
| | 3-1 | 18 | Add "fewer and" after "that eating" | No change made. Less is more grammatically correct. |
| | 3-1 | 20 | Delete "intake" and replace with "levels" | Edited to "levels". |
| | 3-2 | 25-41 Key Recommendations | This section needs clarification. Suggestion: Provide nutrient recommendations in first three bullets: saturated fat, cholesterol and trans fat. Use remaining bullets to give examples of foods to reduce that are major sources of saturated fat, trans fat and added sugars. | No Change made. Recommendations are to be clear and brief. Examples of foods are provided in the chapter section. Second sentence of alcohol recommendation removed. |

| | | | | |
|--|--------------|---------------------|--|---|
| | | | Clarify recommendation on alcohol intake. (Choose one of the statements: either one/two drinks or on any given day no more than three/four drinks.) | |
| | 3-2 | 26 | Add "or trans" after "saturated" | No edit made. 10% does not include trans. |
| | 3-2 | 26 | Acids | Edit made. |
| | 3-2 | 26-27 | This sounds odd; can't a person reduce consumption without 'replacing' sat fat with MUS and PUFA's? Remove phrasing 'by replacing them with...' | This was a DGAC recommendation –D3-23 in the DGAC Report. |
| | 3-2 | 32 | Delete comma after "trans fats" to improve accuracy | Comma deleted. |
| | 3-2 | 34 | Add "such as cakes, pies, cookies, doughnuts and SSB" after "added sugars" | No change made. Key recs should be consistent. The chapter sections provide specific examples of foods. |
| | 3-2 | 37 | Replace "include" with "contain" to improve accuracy | Edit made. |
| | 3-2 | 39 | "consumed in moderation AND ONLY BY ADULTS".... and delete "and only by adults of legal drinking age" | Legal drinking age is consistent with language used by CDC. No change made. |
| | 3-2 (sodium) | Lines 46-50. | Doesn't talk about choosing same foods in lower sodium varieties. Also is not really aligned with new IOM report which says added salt when eating makes little difference in total sodium intake Revise to align with new IOM sodium report which emphasizes potential for changing processed & prepared foods as key to sodium reduction | Discussion in sodium section. |
| | 3-3 | 52 | Somewhere in this document give the calories per gram.. 4 calories per gram cho, protein, 9 calories for fat and 7 calories for alcohol | No change made. This is discussed in chapter 2. |
| | 3-3 | 59 | Delete "control" and replace with "reduce" | A person may not need to reduce their calories to manage their body weight. No change made. |
| | 3-3 | 59 | Delete "calories" and replace with "calorie intake" | Edit made. |
| | 3-3 | 61 | Add "that are" after "fewer foods" | Edit made. |
| | 3-4 | 83-88 Solid fats | This discussion is misleading. Butter or stick margarine are solid at room temperature but so is a piece of salmon or tuna. Solid fat is imprecise terminology. | This discussion is consistent with the DGAC report. No change made. |
| | 3-4,5 | | Discussion on % cal from fat misses the point that with high(er) calorie intakes, the % may go down but total amount of fat is still excessive Include comment on this point, review the % cal fat discussions | This information is not in the DGAC report and the recommendations are based on % calories. No change made. |
| | 3-5 | 91 | To have an average of 34 percent in a range when the upper limit is 35 is not really within the range. The average of 34 implies that many people have intakes above 34. This statement mixes the issue of ranges that are targets for individuals vs. the population average. I think what is needed here is a statement about the percent of people who have an intake within the targeted range, rather than the average. | Agree. Deleted "which is within the recommended range". |
| | 3-5 | 95 | Delete "needs" and replace with "uses" | Edit made. |
| | 3-5 | 95 | Delete "and" and replace with "but" | Edit made. |
| | 3-5 | 96 | Add "more than" after "it makes" | Edit made. |
| | 3-5 | 98 | Add "blood" after "total" | Added blood before total since LDL is measured in blood too. |
| | 3-5 | 98 | Add "levels of" before "low-density" | Added but before total cholesterol. |
| | 3-5 | 99 | Delete "in the blood." | Deleted |
| | 3-5 | 99 | What is the evidence that total cholesterol is considered a risk... thought we had moved to looking specifically at the splits, since a high HDL | Total cholesterol still recognized as a risk factor (NHLBI). No edit made. |

| | | | | |
|--|-------|-----------------------------|--|--|
| | | | (good) could make a Total high | |
| | 3-5 | 104 | Fatty acids contribute an (se of intake and diet in same sentence redundant) | Removed "intake". |
| | 3-5 | 104 | Add "currently" after "intake" | Based on 2005-2006 data. Not current. No edit made. |
| | 3-5 | 105 | Delete "some" and start sentence with "Major" | Removed "some" since sentence says "include". |
| | 3-5 | 105 | Also for saturated fat, it would be good to indicate the percent of people who exceed 10% rather than the average intake | No change made. This information was not provided in the DGAC report. |
| | 3-5 | 107 | What kind of pizza? | Not specified based on way food groups were collected. |
| | 3-5 | 109 | Add fatty fish | Not listed in Figure 3-4. No change made. |
| | 3-5 | 109 | Delete "limit their" and replace with "reduce or avoid" | "reduced" already used at beginning of sentence and "avoid" it not being used. No change made. |
| | 3-5 | 110 | Add "with" after "replace them" | "with" added. |
| | 3-5 | 110 | At end of line, insert "with" to read: "...and replace them with foods..." | "with" added. |
| | 3-5 | 110 | Replace them WITH... | "with" added. |
| | 3-6 | 111 | Delete "Many of the major sources" and replace with "Instead, many of these major food sources" | Edit made. |
| | 3-6 | 112 | Delete "limit" and replace with "help reduce" | Edit made. |
| | 3-6 | 113 | Add "and solid shortening" after "butter" | Edit made. |
| | 3-6 | 113 | Add "vegetable" before "oils" | Added |
| | 3-6 | 113 | Add lard | Added but examples moved up in Fats section. |
| | 3-6 | 114 | Delete "Oils that are rich in monounsaturated fatty acids" with "These" | This would be confusing since prior sentence also discussed PUFAS. No edit made. |
| | 3-6 | 116 | Add sentence "Both types are preferred over solid fats." | Solid fat is about calories- the discussion in this section is related to heart disease. No edit made. |
| | 3-6 | 116 | Where does peanut oil fit in | It is an oil based on figure 3-3. |
| | 3-6,7 | Trans fatty acid discussion | Mention that foods w/o trans fats may replace the fat w/ sugar and thus be high in calories – so not to look at simply avoiding this nutrient in isolation | Calories are discussed under solid fats and added sugars. No change made. |
| | 3-7 | 144 | Delete "needs some" and replace with "uses" | Edit made. |
| | 3-7 | 144 | Delete "and" and replace with "but" | Edit made. |
| | 3-7 | 144-145 | Add "more than" before "enough" | Edit made. |
| | 3-7 | 145 | Delete "cholesterol in their diet" and replace with "to eat sources of dietary cholesterol." | Edit made. |
| | 3-7,8 | 151-153 | It would be more useful to state the % EXCEEDING recommendations rather than average intake. | This was not provided in the DGAC report. |
| | 3-8 | 152 | Again, the average is less interesting than knowing what % have intakes above the recommended level | This was not provided in the DGAC report. |
| | 3-8 | 155 | Define low (what %) | Not defined in DGAC report. |
| | 3-8 | 155 | Add comma after "low" to improve scientific accuracy | Edit made. |
| | 3-8 | 160 | Add after "healthy people," "but can be detrimental among the growing numbers of adults and children with T2D." | This is about diseased populations. No edit made. |
| | 3-8 | 161 | Delete "s" after cholesterol | "s" deleted |
| | 3-8 | 167-189 Solid fats | The term "solid fat" is imprecise and is unacceptable in a science-based document. | This was a major discussion topic in the DGAC report. No change made. |
| | 3-9 | 179-185 | Does this repeat? – | Comment unclear. No change made. |

| | | | | |
|--|------|--|--|--|
| | 3-9 | 192 | Delete both uses of “e.g.” | Edit made. |
| | 3-10 | 210 | “compromising ITS nutrient adequacy.” | Edit made. |
| | 3-10 | 213 | Should include “diet” beverages as these are “sweetened” and not captured under “unsweetened”. | “diet” added. |
| | 3-10 | 216-219 Calories from solid fat | Please clarify the statement that combines a discussion of solid fat and added sugars and suggests that these components contribute little or nothing to overall nutrient adequacy. Several foods (3-9, 180-183) that are major sources of solid fat are important sources of vitamins/minerals. | Edit made to “without contributing importantly to overall....” which is similar to the DGAC report (D2-9). |
| | 3-10 | Reducing sugar | It seems like some statement is needed about non-caloric sugar substitutes which can help many people reduce sugar intake in an acceptable way – beverages being a key place for this (not just water & unsweetened beverages) | DGAC report (D5-31) says that the literature to support replacement of these substitutes is not available. No edit made. |
| | 3-11 | Througho ut | Suddenly adds blank lines between paragraphs | No change made. An issue for later editing of the document. |
| | 3-11 | 224 | Revise to read “solid fats and added sugars combined ”. | Using the word “and” implies “combined”. No change made. |
| | 3-12 | 236 | Add fat meat seasoning | Edit made to include fat-containing meat seasonings. |
| | 3-12 | 238 | Delete comma after “sodas”. | Comma deleted. |
| | 3-12 | 256 | Could the equivalent dietary fiber ever be added back? If not, revise to avoid that implication. | Fiber is not being discussed as being added back, only certain vitamins and minerals. No change made. |
| | 3-13 | 259 | Add discussion/definition of intact fibers | Not relevant to this chapter. No change made. |
| | 3-13 | 264-265 | Move this sentence elsewhere as does not fit in the middle of this paragraph. | This fits with the previous sentence in being part of the USDA food patterns. No change made. |
| | 3-14 | 287-289 | Perhaps these percentages need checking. It is highly unlikely that only 4% of women consume more than one drink per day AND 4% consume 4 drinks or more | As stated in DGAC (D7-1), it is an average of more than No change made. |
| | 3-14 | 289-290 | There appears to be an inconsistency with the definition of “heavy or high-risk drinking” in this text and the one used in the sidebar, lines 303-304. | The text meets the definition of heavy and high risk drinking in that the amounts cited are higher than the formal definition. No edit made. |
| | 3-14 | 312 | Does this mean moderate alcohol consumption of any type? Spirits? Or just red wine? | Based on the definition provided in the sidebar at the beginning of the chapter. |
| | 3-14 | 314 | Revise to avoid implying that alcohol consumption is a prevention strategy; change the word “prevent” | Sentence deleted based on other comments. |
| | 3-15 | 320 | Is the association with excessive drinking independent of its role in increasing body weight? | The DGAC report (D7-1)) says that for CVD, the effect is independent of BMI. There is no mention of the other endpoints; however, the association with body weight is only moderate (DGAC D7-6). |
| | 3-15 | 325 | Per JNC 7, the effect is small and only for those who are heavy drinkers | The DGAC report (D7-3) does not report on the degree of reduction. |
| | 3-15 | 331 | Delete “drinking alcohol if they choose to drink at all.” And replace with “considering whether they should drink alcohol. There are not known benefits to mother and known potential risk to baby.” | This statement is not completely accurate – there are some benefits of moderate drinking to the mother. The point is to be cautious of drinking which leads to the next sentence about how to be cautious. No edit made. |
| | 3-15 | 332 | In middle of line, change “breast-feeding” to “breastfeeding” (without -) for consistency with rest of text | Edit made. |
| | 3-15 | 334 | Delete “if she then waits at” and replace with “but she then needs to | Edit made. |

| | | | | |
|------------------------------------|------|---------------------------|---|--|
| | | | wait “ | |
| | 3-15 | 334 | Delete “Or” and replace with “Alternately,” | Edit made. |
| | 3-17 | 359 | Revise to read...”to help achieve a dietary pattern that will meet their nutrient needs” | Edit made. |
| | 3-19 | Fig 3-2 | I am not sure how useful this (and the following) figures are as intake is really spread over a wide range of foods and 31.9% is an undefined “other”. | This information comes from the DGAC report. |
| | 3-20 | Fig 3-3 | Can trans fats be added to this figure? | No. Most of these would not contain trans fats. |
| Chapter 4 Foods to Increase | | | | |
| | 4-1 | Line 1 – title of chapter | Change to “Foods and Nutrients to Increase” – Foods to Increase is simpler but the Key Recommendations also include nutrients | No change. |
| | 4-1 | Title, Line 1 | Delete “increase:” and replace with “Consume and Substitute for Nutrient Dense Choices” | No change. |
| | 4-1 | 3 | Delete “do not” and replace with “choose not to” | No change. |
| | 4-1 | 5 | Add “while other foods that supply only calories are consumed in higher amounts that recommended.” After “recommended” | No change. |
| | 4-1 | 5 | Can we leave “oils” out of this list? They do NOT provide any of the nutrients that are stated (in next sentence) to be a public health concern AS A RESULT. And oils are pretty much empty calories and this statement could be confusing. | No change. |
| | 4-1 | 6 | Add “below recommended amounts and” before “low enough” | Not needed. |
| | 4-1 | 6 | Vitamin E is not listed as a nutrient of concern, nor is it mentioned in this chapter. Should there be a sentence saying why the high prevalence of inadequacy was not considered of public health importance? | The DGAC Report stated that intakes of vitamin E are below recommended levels, however, nutrients were only identified to be “of concern” if there was a public health issue clearly apparent and there was not one for vitamin E. Due to space limitations this was not described in detail in the PD. A reference to the DGAC Report is included in reference to other nutrients like vitamin E that are not of public health concern. |
| | 4-1 | 8 | Add B12 in older adults | Not needed |
| | 4-1 | 9 | Delete “describes” and replace with “identifies better” | No change |
| | 4-1 | 9 | Delete “should be emphasized” and replace with “can” | No change |
| | 4-1 | 15 | Balancing calorie needs with caloric expenditure. | No change |
| | 4-2 | 26 | Add “every day” after “fruit intake” | No change |
| | 4-2 | 24-42 | Clarify the message that the foods to increase are meant to replace other foods (not increase caloric intake); consistently. | Already stated in line 25. |
| | 4-2 | Lines 29-30. | Of course most people will have no idea at all of what ‘half of all grains as whole grains’ means. Not sure, but this quantification is a different message than all the others that say increase, choose a variety, etc. It’s not a very actionable message. P 4-9 shows how to do this but if people do more than just eat bread, it is hard to translate. | This document is intended for a professional audience, most of whom will understand what half of all grains means. The message is different because the action is different—a substitution . |
| | 4-2 | 31-32 | Identify preferred dairy choices as low fat or fat free. | Done |

| | | | | |
|--|-----|--|--|---|
| | 4-2 | 33 | Add "other" before "protein" | Wouldn't make as much sense when key rec stands alone. |
| | 4-2 | 35 | Delete "choosing seafood in place of" and replace with "substituting it for" | No change. |
| | 4-2 | 37 | Add "such as fried chicken, meats with gravies, or other butter cooked dishes" after "higher solid fats" | Not adding example. |
| | 4-2 | 37-39 | The statement on solid fats is meaningless, e.g., how does one identify the content of solid fat in any protein food--whether the choice is chicken or beef or pizza or chicken burrito or tuna casserole or clam chowder? | Described previously. |
| | 4-2 | 38 | Add "such as broiled chicken, fish or lean meat" after "lower solid fats" | Not in key recs. |
| | 4-2 | 39 | Clarify the statement use oils to replace solid fats, e.g., replace butter, shortening and stick margarines with oil. | Not adding examples. |
| | 4-2 | 39 | Add "vegetable" before "oils" | Not needed here. |
| | 4-3 | 45 | I know this is not for the public, but a footnote about what is meant by heme iron would be useful | Done |
| | 4-3 | 45 | See comment in the Summary on need to explain "heme" iron. Also mcg in footnote and "fortified foods taken with meals" comments in Summary chapter, | Further description of heme and non-heme iron was added. |
| | 4-3 | 45-61 Recommendations for Women who are Pregnant or Breastfeeding | This section is without context. A summary of key recommendation for a healthy dietary pattern (4-2) should proceed specific food and nutrient targets. In particular, the advice to consume 8 to 12 ounces of seafood is abrupt, without mention of scientific evidence and is not paralleled with quantitative advice on seafood for the general population (4-2). | Key recs, not discussion. |
| | 4-3 | 57 | Amount and kind to be recommended by ob | Discussed later. |
| | 4-4 | 60-61 Individuals Ages 50 years of Age and Older | Summarize key recommendations (4-2); mention nutrients of concern for older Americans. Also, the science summary (4-20) is not persuasive. Do other expert health policy groups recommend B12 fortified foods? | No change needed here. |
| | 4-4 | 75 | Change to "...sodium are considered nutrient-dense." | No change needed. |
| | 4-5 | 83-86 Vegetables and Fruits | Clarify statement that summarize evidence that links vegetable and fruit intake with reduced risk of CVD—as part of a dietary pattern that is low in saturated fat. No particular food conveys health benefit independent of an overall healthy dietary pattern. | Added general statements about individual recs being in the context of an over health eating pattern. |
| | 4-5 | 94 | White potatoes are ignored, not discussed or mentioned in either foods to increase or decrease. Please make a specific statement about potatoes since they are a significant food item in the diet | A footnote in the USDA food patterns appendices was elaborated on. Further description was not added to the text. |
| | 4-6 | 115-120 | Clarify whether the sentence (117-1120) pertains to all, or ages 2 to 30. | No change needed. |

| | | | | |
|--|------|--------------------------|--|--|
| | | Fruits | | |
| | 4-6 | 129 | Add “a serving of 100% juice is 4 oz. No more than 1SV per day is recommended for children (NHLBI Pediatric Guidelines). | No change. |
| | 4-7 | 152-153 | Add “Fortified grains” in this sidebar on definitions of grains; “fortified” and “fortification” are used throughout the text, so including a definition would be beneficial; also include “Fortification” definition in the glossary (Appendix 16) | A definition of “fortification” was added to the glossary. |
| | 4-7 | 158-162 Whole Grains | Clarify statement; moderate evidence suggests that whole grains foods as part of a healthy dietary pattern that is low in saturated fat may reduce the risk of CVD | Conclusion statements do not specify this. |
| | 4-7 | 161 | Add “within calorie limits” after “whole grains” | No change. Evidence statement. |
| | 4-8 | 169 | What about intact fibers? | Further details on this topic is not addressed in the evidence available. |
| | 4-8 | 170-172 | This is a confusing message about sources of folic acid. Because fortified whole grains other than breakfast cereals are almost non-existent, women may assume they need to eat more fortified refined grains. Isn't the correct advice that women who may become pregnant should get 400 ug/d from either fortified foods or a dietary supplement? That's what is stated on 4-19, lines 431-432. | This statement is about people who choose to eat all of their grains as whole grains; thus, it does not imply fortified refined grains as the comment denotes. |
| | 4-9 | 188 | IS whole grains | Done |
| | 4-9 | 201 | gramS | NA |
| | 4-10 | 205-208 | Is the evidence for all milk or for low fat milk | Milk |
| | 4-10 | 213 | Delete “current” | No change. |
| | 4-10 | 213-224 | Chapter 2, Page 2-9, Lines 185-187 and Chapter 3, pages 8 to 9, Lines 172-174 appear to give a mixed message with the text here in Chapter 4. While it cannot be denied and should not be hidden that milk contributes to total energy intake, milk is presented with other sugar-sweetened beverages and juice drinks that are different from the nutrient-density of milk. Can this section in Chapter 4 be revised to reinforce that milk is important to include in the diet and that the energy consumed from milk is appropriate and/or include the concept of within energy needs and/or discuss fluid milk as a beverage selection rather than energy-dense, non-nutrient-dense beverages such as sodas or fruit drinks? | This is addressed thoroughly in chapter 5. |
| | 4-10 | 220 | Change to “...habit of drinking lower-fat milk, as...” | Not ALL children need lower fat yet, but all that apply to the document's recs do. |
| | 4-11 | 225-6 | Not true – it is critical for vitamin B12 to be added too. Also “Therefore THEY ARE considered...” | grammatical edit made. |
| | 4-11 | 227 | What about other milks like almond and rice | No change. |
| | 4-11 | 230 | Begin sentence with “In addition” | No change. |
| | 4-11 | 232-233 | This is a new concept for many people – should reiterate or explain. | Solid fats and oils sections reiterate and explain further. |
| | 4-11 | 232-233 Protein Foods | The DGA 2010 unique definition of solid fats currently cannot be applied in the food market, home or eating out. | No change. |
| | 4-11 | 237 | See my comment in executive summary about FISH | Say “animals”. |

| | | | | |
|--|--------------|-------------------------|---|---|
| | 4-11 | 246 Protein Foods | Clarify what is meant by a balanced variety of protein foods. | Previous sentence links to chapter 5 for that. |
| | 4-12 | 258, 270 | Are these raw or cooked | Not eating raw seafood is addressed in the Food Safety Appendix. A footnote was added to indicate the seafood recommendations are in ounces of cooked, edible portions. |
| | 4-12 | 271 Seafood | Add...increased intakes are recommended by replacing some meat or poultry. | Change not made here. This point is found in the key recommendation. |
| | 4-13 | 272-282 Seafood | This section needs to be carefully assessed to determine that it is consistent with the review of scientific evidence (D3-34, Figure D3.2b); Clarify whether the populations are individuals with existing CVD and whether the risk reduction is in total CVD events, or CVD death. It can be interpreted that the recommendation pertains to persons with preexisting CVD (D3-34) Also, seafood recommendations must be described as part of a healthy pattern that is low in saturated fat. Clarify whether other U.S. health professional expert groups recommend quantitative amounts of seafood intake, Characterize the recommendations—when, what populations/subgroups, what amounts and with what objective. | Added general statement. |
| | 4-13 | 280 | Give amounts for children | There is a cross-reference to Ch. 5 for this purpose. |
| | 4-13 | 282 Seafood | The DGA state that moderate consistent evidence shows that the benefit of consuming a variety of seafood outweighs risk. Nowhere else is the evidence for the benefit of any dietary component described as consistent. Is this accurate, or is the statement used because of a risk hazard concern. | No change requested. |
| | 4-13 | Seafood | The science section (D-3,38 – D3 -41) does not clearly summarize conclusions regarding seafood intake in mothers and infants and whether benefit in visual and cognitive development is sustained in childhood. (Excluding studies with supplements, it appears that there is one randomized clinical trial and 7 prospective cohort studies). The scientific evidence review should characterize recommendations by other health professional expert groups for quantified amounts of seafood intake for pregnant and breast feeding women. | The evidence is in the DGAC Report. |
| | 4-14 | 293 | I think it is important to note that contamination occurs in lakes, rivers, sounds and that individuals should check marine advisories | Is in footnote already. |
| | 4-14 | 300 | Add cooked | Footnote added. |
| | 4-15 | 328 | Add “should be avoided” after “considered solid fats” | No change. |
| | 4-15 | 333 | Add “such as olive oil, sunflower oil or canola oil” after “vegetable oils” | Repetitive |
| | 4-15 | 338 | Vitamin E is not listed as a nutrient of concern, nor is it mentioned in this chapter. Should there be a sentence saying why the high prevalence of inadequacy was not considered of public health importance? | See previous response . |
| | 4-15 to 4-20 | Nutrients of concern. | Seems a bit disconnected from the foods discussion that precedes it. Possibly add a table showing which foods are major sources of which nutrients in this section | No space. |
| | 4-16 | 354-356 | This is not quite the correct definition of an AI. Suggest the following, | No change. |

| | | | | |
|--|------|---------|---|--|
| | | | taken from p. 11 of the 2006 DRI book from the IOM: “The AI is expected to meet or exceed the needs of most individuals...” | |
| | 4-16 | 356 | Change “Blacks” to “African-Americans” to be consistent with other sections | Done |
| | 4-16 | 357 | Can we really say that all Blacks and individuals with hypertension benefit from <i>increasing</i> their intake? What about those whose intake is already at 4700 mg/d. Perhaps the sentence should say, “... especially benefit from ensuring that their intake of potassium meets the AI.” | Says “suggests”. |
| | 4-16 | 359 | Provide mean intake (information as in line 383) or reader will have no idea how big the shortfall is. | Not needed, show %. |
| | 4-16 | 364 | Name potatoes here | No change. |
| | 4-17 | 370 | This is an unusually worded definition of dietary fiber. Suggest, “Dietary fiber consists of non-digestible carbohydrates and lignin.” | Not needed. |
| | 4-17 | 372 | Many people will not understand “laxation”. | No change. |
| | 4-17 | 374 | Add “such as oats and barley” after “whole grains” | Added examples in side bar. |
| | 4-17 | 378 | Delete “increase intake” and replace with “consume” | Done |
| | 4-17 | 379 | Add “instead of refined grains or sugary foods” after “high in fiber” | No change. |
| | 4-17 | 380 | Delete “and” and replace with “processed but” | Keeping it simple. |
| | 4-17 | 380 | Give names or examples of added fibers | Information not available on definitions of added fibers at this time. |
| | 4-17 | 381 | Delete “is unclear if added fiber provides” and replace with “whether” | No change. |
| | 4-17 | 381 | Delete “as” and replace with “can be derived as in” | No change. |
| | 4-17 | 382 | After “naturally occurring sources” add “depends in part upon the overall nutrient quality of the food itself and the overall diet. Adding fiber to an otherwise nutrient poor food such as sugar-sweetened beverages, candy snacks, or dessert cannot compensate for the other missing nutrients or the excess calories typically provided by such choices.” | No change. |
| | 4-17 | 385 | Add “currently” after “but” | Done |
| | 4-17 | 386 | Add sentence “Choosing whole grain versions of these foods is one option.” | Not needed. |
| | 4-18 | 397-398 | Replace “Dietary Reference Intakes” with either “recommended intakes” or “Adequate Intakes”. Note that “AI” is used in line 404, but isn’t previously mentioned in the section on calcium. | Calcium content updated to reflect current RDA. |
| | 4-18 | 399 | Add “especially including non-fat milk that is higher in calcium than whole milk” after “milk products” | No change needed. |
| | 4-18 | 410 | Likewise, replace “DRI” with “Adequate Intake.” | Content updated to reflect current RDA. |
| | 4-18 | 410 | Note there is emerging evidence of benefit in other things such as reduction of fatigue, reduced risk of cancers | No change. |
| | 4-19 | 411.... | This paragraph on vitamin D is very inadequate. It needs to make clear that UV light is insufficient in winter in most of the US (vs. current sentence on line 411), and people with darker skin make far less from sunlight and are at greater risk of deficiency. We need to EXPLAIN WHY THERE IS A PROBLEM and who has it. Actually lines 408-409 are inadequate too because of the many roles of vitamin D now identified- these need to be mentioned – we are rarely concerned with rickets. | Content updated to reflect 2010 DRI report on vitamin D. |
| | 4-19 | 416 | In yolk or white? | No change. |

| | | | | |
|---|---------|-------------------|---|---|
| | 4-19 | 417 | Reword to, “consider vitamin D supplementation to increase their intakes.” | Content updated to reflect 2010 DRI report on vitamin D. |
| | 4-19 | 417 | Add “wish to” before “consider” | Content updated to reflect 2010 DRI report on vitamin D. |
| | 4-19 | 419 | Add “but seeking guidance from health care providers is important to determine the proper dosage.” After “elderly populations” | Content updated to reflect 2010 DRI report on vitamin D. |
| | 4-19 | 430 | It’s confusing to mention the EAR in this context. Suggest, “...about 22 percent of women still have inadequate intakes of total folate.” | NA |
| | 4-19 | 431 | Child bearing rather than reproductive | NA |
| | 4-20 | 435 | Important to mention that B12 is only found in animal source or fortified foods. Vegans and many other vegetarians who reduce their intake of animal products need fortified foods or supplements. | Mentions crystalline form. |
| | 4-20 | 437 | The term “crystalline form” won’t be clear to all readers. Suggest, “...but the crystalline form used for fortification and in dietary supplements is well absorbed.” | No edit needed. |
| | 4-20 | 439 | How much | Proposed the question. |
| | 4-21 | 443 | Delete “do not eat the variety and amounts of foods that provide nutrients while avoiding excess calorie intake.” Add “eat an excess amount of calories from non-nutrient dense foods. This contributes to overweight but under-nutrition.” | No edit. |
| | 4-21 | 444 | Start sentence with “Instead” | No edit. |
| | 4-21 | 444 | Delete “increase their” replace with “substitute with” | No edit. |
| | 4-21 | 446 | Add “achieve satiety (feel full)” after “can help to” | Not here. |
| | 4-21 | 451 | Change to “...make choices that minimize intakes of...” | Done |
| | 4-21 | ? | Add a discussion of water | Water is discussed in chapter 5. |
| Chapter 5 Building Healthy Eating Patterns | | | | |
| | | | Make this Chapter 4. See above. | No change. |
| | | Throughout | Emphasize portion size and total calories as well as food and nutrient types. Fig 5-2 is good though a bit tricky to digest | “within calorie needs” is mentioned on page 5-1, line 7, and throughout. |
| | | | It would be helpful to say something about people not always eating consistently from day to day, but they can balance out over a period of days or across a week... | Text says “average” so no change. |
| | 5-1 | Title | Add “for the whole family” to the title | No change to title, added to first sentence. |
| | 5-1 | 2-26 Introduction | This is generally useful information; there is some redundancy and the word “template” is over used. | Term “templates” is new, so it is used 3 times for clarity. |
| | Fig 5-1 | | Nice figure but the big elephant isn’t shown – calorie intake- same for Table 5-1.Can this be added to the figure (and table)? | Calorie intakes dealt with in chapter 2, and they do not show over consumption due to underreporting. So it would not be useful on this figure. |
| | 5-1 | 5 | Add costs | Edit made. |
| | 5-1 | 7 | Add “for each member of the family throughout the lifecycle” after “within calorie limits” | Added “families” to first sentence of chapter. |
| | 5-1 | 17 | Add “for individuals of all ages and their families” after “beverage choices” | Added “families” to first sentence of chapter. |

| | | | | |
|--|-----|---|--|---|
| | 5-2 | 21 | Add “including foods you like and” before “meets: | The template doesn’t include specific foods, just general choices. Don’t see that this is relevant here. |
| | 5-1 | 21-23 Key Recommen- dations | Clarify the objective in the first two bullets. The advice suggests a very structured process. Perhaps one objective is to try one of the eating pattern guides, since these are designed to meet nutrient needs/calorie levels; Another objective might be to use these guides to identify which foods, amounts and variety fit into an overall healthy way to eat. | In the absence of any other comments on the key recs, not making an major modifications. |
| | 5-2 | 23 | Add “the calories distributed by” before “all foods” | NO change-- It’s the foods, not just their calories. |
| | 5-2 | 24 | Add “for each member of the family” after “eating pattern” | Added “families” to first sentence of chapter. |
| | 5-2 | 36 | Define prospective studies | Not sure this is needed here—we do not define the other types of studies in the paragraph. |
| | 5-2 | 41-45 Research about Healthy Eating Patterns | If mentioned, the last sentence might say that the Japanese and Okinawan dietary patterns have been summarized and characterized by other expert groups (NRC Diet and Health Report, 1989). | This type of detail is for the DGAC report, not the policy document. |
| | 5-2 | 42 | “vegetarian eating patterns FOR ADULTS. | Edited |
| | 5-3 | 48 | Add “multiple” before “clinical” | Trials is plural—implies multiple. |
| | 5-3 | 48 | Add “among men, women and children” after “trials” | No change. |
| | 5-3 | 49 | Add “feeding” before “studies” | Redundant given rest of sentence. |
| | 5-3 | 50 | Add “free living people, eg” after “conducted in” | Redundant given rest of sentence. |
| | 5-3 | 54 | This was a little bit confusing. In the original DASH study, one of the two test diets was low fat, the other was not. So you could say “One of the diets in the original DASH study was lower in fat—the use of ALSO wasn’t clear to me. ALSO in relation to what. | Edited |
| | 5-3 | 60 DASH | Clarify that the comparison is to the same eating pattern but with a typical (higher) sodium intake. | Edited |
| | 5-3 | 62 | Is this true for everyone or only those with elevated BP? | Edited to clarify that only hypertensives and pre-hypertensives were in the study. |
| | 5-3 | 63 | Change “cardio-vascular” to “cardiovascular” (without -) for consistency with rest of text | Edited |
| | 5-5 | Part on vegetarian s | Please make it clear that there is a risk of some nutrients lacking in vegetarian diets e.g. vitamin B12. This paragraph makes it sound like everything is wonderful about vegetarian diets and there are no nutritional issues to be concerned about, even for children. Also it lumps vegan and lacto-ovovegetarian together in these glowing comments lines 95-103. Meeting nutrient requirements is possible only if fortified foods are consumed, as demonstrated later – but this needs to be stated here as well. | This section is on the research. The issue related to B12 is covered later when recommendations are made. |
| | 5-5 | 91 | Add “Technically,” before “vegans” | No change. |
| | 5-5 | 98 | Note not automatically low in calories or fat | This describes the findings of research studies that on average were lower. |
| | 5-5 | 101 | Delete “They” and replace with “Vegetarians generally” | Edited |
| | 5-5 | 107 | Not sure what the word abundant means in this context | No change. |

| | | | |
|-----|--|--|--|
| 5-6 | 114 | Should the statement be “Some tend to be low in sodium”. It says most. I don’t know what list of diets you have in mind, but the Asian diets and some aspects of Mediterranean diets might be relatively high sodium—at least the Asian diets. | Edited |
| 5-6 | 115 | First time you use the term constructed eating patterns. Perhaps give DASH as an example and the basis on which it was constructed | Listed DASH as example. |
| 5-6 | 118 | Add bullet point: “Know how many calories they should consume each day to prevent weight gain (parents should know how many calories their children need as well)” | This is a summary from research and eating patterns—the concept “know your calories” doesn’t fit into this list. |
| 5-6 | 119 and following list | Can you set this up side by side to drive home the point that the reductions and increases are complementary | They don’t all have side-by-side counterparts. |
| 5-6 | 119 | Add “for all members of the family” after “healthy weight” | Added “families” to first sentence of chapter. |
| 5-6 | 119 | Be careful how this is worded to not discourage appropriate weight gain in children and teens | Edited to reflect comment. |
| 5-6 | 119-133 Common Elements summary | Use wording for previous key recommendations, with similar emphasis on foods to decrease and increase. | This is to be a summary and therefore the statements are shorter. Reference is made to the other chapters. |
| 5-6 | 120 | Delete “consume” and replace with “choose” | Consume seems more direct--no change. |
| 5-6 | 120 | Add “in moderation” after “foods” | Recommended amounts is more direct than moderation. |
| 5-6 | 122 | Add “or avoid” after Reduce | Advice is not to totally avoid—just to reduce to within allowance. |
| 5-6 | 122-133 | Reorder with the positive first followed by the negative or restricted | Reduce statements first, followed by increase as in chapters 3,4. |
| 5-6 | 123 | Add “vegetable” before “oils” | Not all oils are from vegetable sources (cottonseed, peanut). |
| 5-6 | 125 | Add “in all forms, such as sucrose, fructose, etc (see list of names for sugar)” after “added sugars” | Added sugars are defined in glossary—this would add unnecessary length here. |
| 5-6 | 127 Common Elements | Delete sentence that provides advice specific to men and teenage boys. Consistent rationale should be used for the general population | Deleted |
| 5-6 | 128 | Delete “Increase intake” replace with “eat more” | No change. |
| 5-6 | 128 | Add “instead of foods that contribute solid fats and added sugars” after “fruits” | This is to be a summary and therefore the statements are short. Reference is made to the other chapters for further details. |
| 5-6 | 129 | Add “such as oats, oat bran, barley, brown rice” after “whole grains” | This is to be a summary and therefore the statements are short. Reference is made to the other chapters for further details. |
| 5-6 | 132 | Why are SoFAS combined? Would rather see them separated | Not combined on this list—do not understand comment. |
| 5-7 | 134 | Add “at all” after “consumed” | No change. |
| 5-7 | 136 | Add “at all ages” after Americans | No change. |
| 5-7 | Lines 138-139 | Change to “...fatty acids from oils, nuts, and seafood and other...” (remove parentheses) | Edited |
| 5-7 | 142-143 Graph Usual intake as percent of | Increase intake of no-fat and low-fat milk, and reduced fat cheese, instead of whole or reduced fat milk and whole fat cheese. | This graph compares actual consumption to recommendations, so it has to be all milk products, not just low fat. |

| | | goal or limit | | |
|--|-------------|-------------------------------|--|---|
| | 5-7 | 144 Graph SoFAS | SoFAs should be saturated fats and added sugars. | The data is for solid fats—saturated fats are shown in another line. |
| | 5-7 | 160 | I suggest “Combined into an appropriate pattern WITH APPROPRIATE PORTIONS...” or something to indicate that quantity still matters. | No change. |
| | 5-8 | 162 | Add “(excluding palm oil or coconut oil)” after “vegetable oil” | No change. |
| | 5-8 | 169 | Move “only” before “accommodate” | No change. |
| | 5-8 | 169 | Add “(no more than 10%)” after “limited number” | 10% is not correct—that range in chapter 3 is 5 to 15%. |
| | 5-8 and 5-9 | 169 and 172 And Figure 5-2 | I really like these explanations; they provide a very concrete way of understanding what the issues are related to excess calorie intake | Thank you. |
| | 5-8 | 173 | Add “lowfat or whole milk,” after “include” | Used chocolate milk instead for this example on request from FNS. Whole milk is shown in figure 5-2 Also wanted to balance sugar vs. fat foods, and there are now 3 examples with fats, 3 with sugar. |
| | 5-8 | 176-177 Calories from alcohol | Consider calories from alcohol beverages as part of total calorie intake. (Otherwise, dietary guidance gets complicated. What calorie level of added sugars is suggested?) | Edited per another comment to mention total calories. |
| | 5-10 | 195 | Add “(for skim) (150 cal for whole)” | Deleted all mention of calories based on another comment. |
| | 5-10 | 195 and 200 | Confusing to assign a calorie level to the combination of different types of milk...I think this means that weighted proportions consumed yield these calorie levels, but I think this should be clarified. | Deleted all mention of calories based on another comment. |
| | 5-10 | 203 | Add sports drinks and energy drinks | Edited |
| | 5-10 | 204-5 | As per my comment in the Summary, make it clear that it is only unpasteurized cheeses and juices that are the problem – change order of words as previously suggested. | No change—not on these lines and elsewhere is clear. |
| | 5-10 | 208 | Terminology “add to total water intake” sounded at first like it was problematic. I would use “contribute to” total water intake | Edited |
| | 5-11 | 222... | Could you include a range of water intake from fluids that is considered to be adequate for most adults? | If we do it will be taken as a specific recommendation—which is what we are trying NOT to do. |
| | 5-11 | 229 | Revise the part about “neither physically active” since it seems to contradict the messages that people should be physically active...Pairing being physically active with heat stress gives a mixed message. | Related edits made. |
| | 5-11 | 243 | WHEN, or DURING THE TIME THAT would be better than WHILE, which some people take to mean “although” I find the statement “reducing the amount of time sugars and starches are in the mouth” to be a bit obscure. Can it be made clearer in terms of what the recommendation is for consumption? | Edited to "during the time that". |
| | 5-11 | 254 | Add safe transit from store (minimum time, keep cool items cool) | This detail is in the appendix on food safety. |
| | 5-11 | 254 | Not sure you ever define “cross-contamination”, although it is described on the next page. | Cross-contamination is defined on lines 72-74 of Appendix 3 and also in the glossary. |
| | 5-12 | 279 | Delete “are often contained in” and add “commonly called | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |

| | | | | |
|--|---------------|-----------|--|---|
| | | | phytopchemicals attempt to duplicate” after “supplements” | |
| | 5-12 | 281 | Add sentence “Research has shown that while supplements can be useful in replacing deficient nutrients in some cases these can have adverse impact on health.” | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-12 and 5-13 | 281 | I thought this section understated the fact that trials of supplementation (e.g., vitamin E and folate) and the older antioxidant supp trials hinted at harm. There is a statement on the next page that says don’t exceed the UL but I wonder if the DGAC also noted that adverse effects were suggested at lower levels. Perhaps the UL determinations have already accounted for this, but I wanted to flag it for double checking. | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-12 | 284 | Add “that are deficient in those nutrients” after “special populations” | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-12 | 284-286 | Delete sentence. In light of new data suggesting possible adverse CVD impact, I would omit this sentence. | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-13 | Vitamin D | Vit D has been getting so much press AND research. Seems useful to say this is being reexamined currently in many studies of Vit D, its sources, and health/disease | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-13 | 286 | Delete “In contrast” and start sentence with “High” | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-13 | 286 | For vitamin D this should include adequate synthesis from sunlight as well. | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS and the new IOM report. This section is related to supplements—vitamin D per se is covered in chapter 4. |
| | 5-13 | 287 | Add “and often people are unaware of their current status.” After “exceeded | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-13 | 287 | Give an example of too much like you did for too little | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. |
| | 5-13 | 287 | Technically, “Upper Level” should be “Tolerable Upper Intake Level.” | Edit taken. |
| | 5-13 | 301-2 | And people with darker skin, and in winter everywhere. | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS. This section is related to supplements—vitamin D per se is covered in chapter 4. |
| | 5-13 | 301-302 | Clarify the reason that older adults produce less Vit D. In other words, clarify that it is not only lack of exposure to the sun but also the ability to make active D? | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS and the new IOM report. |
| | 5-13 | 302 | Be clear that there are many factors that make it difficult to predict how much time an individual needs in the sun to produce appropriate vitamin D (skin tone, altitude, etc) | Using wording and edits to this section from HHS and the new IOM report. This section is related to supplements—vitamin D per se is covered in chapter 4. |
| | 5-14 | 308... | Again, how can vegetarians NOT be included here? THIS IS DANGEROUS! | Added a sentence. |
| | 5-14 | 314 | Additional iron is needed in the 2 nd and 3 rd trimester... not necessarily at the first visit | Edited to delete specifics. |
| | 5-14 | 320-5 | Include yogurt and cheese as examples of lactose-free products | Added |
| | 5-14 | 336 | Mention the labeling requirements for allergens | Out of scope of this sidebar. |
| | 5-15 | 351 | Consider clarifying that it is “traditional” Mediterranean diets (not current ones). That is said elsewhere, but it bears repeating. | Added |
| | 5-17 | 382 | Add “and remember that most Americans are sedentary, so the lower levels should be selected. These can always be adjusted if needed.” | The calorie levels in the table show the activity level, so this is not needed here. |
| | 5-17 | 383-384 | This would be a good place to clarify the difference between nutrient density and caloric density. Also clarify that adding fat and sugar may not remove the nutrients that made the product nutrient dense but they | This section is about the USDA patterns. Calorie density is covered in chapter 2, Definition for nutrient density has been edited to clarify throughout the document. |

| | | | | |
|---|---------|---------|--|--|
| | | | change the nutritional profile of the overall product. As I noted earlier, also consider whether “dense” is the right word. | |
| | 5-19 | 417-421 | It must be stated that these should be calcium and vitamin B12 fortified beverages. Last sentence – reword to read “in vegan patterns especially, fortified foods should be selected to provide adequate calcium and vitamin B12” (or supplements should be advised). Where will vegans get their iron? Zinc? | Added. |
| | 5-20 | 448 | Add “for the whole family” after “eating patterns” | Added “families” to first sentence of chapter. |
| | 5-20 | 452 | Add “for the family” after “health benefits” | Added “families” to first sentence of chapter. |
| | 5-20 | 459 | Add “are currently a” after “Beverages” | Edited |
| | 5-21 | 462 | Add “Vitamin, mineral or fiber” after “dietary supplements” | We did not add this detail earlier, so it would be inappropriate in the summary. |
| | 5-21 | 463 | Add “that may be discussed with a health care provider to establish need and correct dosage” after “specific situations” | This is too much detail for the summary. |
| Chapter 6 Helping Americans Make Healthy Choices | | | | |
| | Chapt 6 | | After reading Chapter 6 I felt like it could be a lot more effective. It almost had the feel of an afterthought. I have been involved with several projects in which the environmental and policy change section came at the end— One way to make it more effective might be to organize the lists of suggested strategies into a table that groups them by levels of the ecological model. In that way, big picture issues like regs for food marketing would not get lost as just another item on the list. | In lieu of a table, corresponding segments of the Social-Ecological Model were named (in parentheses) after each action step. An introductory sentence was also added to line 83 to explain this notation. |
| | Fig 6-1 | | This looks A LOT like the figure in M Story et al. in Ann Review of Public Health 2008 but it is cited as from CDC, it was taken from Story’s framework figure. Correct the attribution, at a minimum noting “adapted from” Story, Kaphingst, Robinson-O’Brien & Glanz, Ann Rev PH 2009; 29: 253-272; figure 1. I will attach a copy with my comments | Citation revised to note adaptation from Story et al, IOM and CDC. |
| | 6-1 | 3 | Add sentence “Often, they do not think much about what influences them to make the choices they do. Many factors, other than the nutritional quality of a food, contribute to these decisions and often this leads to excess intake of calories, fat, sugar and salt.” | This idea is already inherent in the second sentence of the document. The recommended sentence was not added due to space limitations. |
| | 6-1 | 4 | Add “ignores or” before “discourages: | Phrase not added – does not appear to enhance the sentence. |
| | 6-1 | 11 | Add “and all adults need to help role model healthy lifestyles for children.” | Phrase not added – changes focus of sentence. |
| | 6-1 | 13 | Consider revising to read “...giving future generations a BETTER change to lead healthy and productive lives”. As written is could be taken to mean that all are now doomed...which overstates. | “Better” added to sentence. |
| | 6-1 | 20 | The list of individual factors includes race, but I am not able to think of ways that race actually influences food intake and activity patterns except through cultural influences or social circumstances. Perhaps only ‘ethnicity’ would work here. Also, I prefer “cultural factors” rather than | “Race/Ethnicity” was included in the original models (from which this is adapted), so we are choosing to keep it in place. However, the mention of “culture” has been removed, and the |

| | | | | |
|--|-----|---------------------|--|--|
| | | | “culture”, to avoid implying that culture is a “thing” and also that ‘culture’ is an individual-level variable. | “social norms and values” subsection has been renamed “Social and Cultural Norms and Values”. |
| | 6-2 | 25 | Add “places of worship” ; among some groups meals may be several times a week | This list is not meant to be exhaustive, but to highlight the most common settings; in the interest of space, places of worship will not be added to the text. |
| | 6-2 | 28 | Delete “own” | “Own” deleted. |
| | 6-3 | Figure 6-1 | Add “family influences” in both contributing to individual factors | Family influences are already inherent in social norms & values, and are highlighted by “homes” in environmental settings. |
| | 6-3 | Figure 6-1 | Should the box on the left containing “home, schools, workplaces, etc.”, point to “Environmental Settings” rather than to “Sectors of Influence”? The text on the previous page seems to indicate that the arrow is incorrectly placed. | Yes. Will be corrected. |
| | 6-3 | 37-38 | Are you using cultural norms as synonymous with social norms or are you saying that there are additional cultural factors....Perhaps you could use “sociocultural” as the framing, to work around this issue. | Section renamed, “Social and Cultural Norms and Values” per earlier (M Story) version of figure. |
| | 6-4 | 62 | Add “sufficient knowledge and” before “opportunities “ | Phrase not added—changes intention of sentence. |
| | 6-4 | 63-64 | Delete “Although” and start sentence with “Individual” | Edit not accepted—changes intent of sentence. |
| | 6-4 | 64 | Add “but” after “critical” | Edit not accepted (linked to comment immediately above). |
| | 6-4 | 71 | Add “and families” before “can adopt” | “and families” added. |
| | 6-5 | 79 | All foods are nutritious (ie provide calories). Why not just state this about food security, don’t make food security an i.e....or define nutritious foods | Another word for “nutritious” will be explored. |
| | 6-5 | 82 | After reading the section about this I suggest renaming the principle to something like – take a life course approach to obesity prevention” | Section renamed according to suggestion. |
| | 6-5 | Line 98 for example | Can you incorporate “attractiveness” or “acceptability” as a concept. The options must be appealing, particularly to compete with the competing alternatives (like junk food, TV and video games) | A brief sentence on acceptability was added in line 97. |
| | 6-6 | 101-112 | These strategies are uneven; some are goals (like “strive to meet objectives”, while others are specific steps to be taken. Also I am not sure that the Strive to Meet...really relates to access. Perhaps they could be restated to focus on the actions (e.g., promote nutrition assistance programs to increase food security) and could be cross referenced to an appendix with more specifics | Due to space constraints, additional appendices can not be added at this time. Minor wording changes have been made to strategies. |
| | 6-6 | 106 | Add “produce via” before “grocery” | Edit not accepted; sentence is more broad than “produce.” |
| | 6-6 | 122 | Add Bullet point “Empower individuals and families to know how many calories they need each day and how to make appropriate food and activity choices to help control weight.” | Information on “knowing one’s calories” will be included in the appendix on strategies; this level of specificity is not appropriate for these bullets. |
| | 6-6 | 134 | Implement the PA plan sounds odd at the end of this list; it is too broad to be useful here. Perhaps incorporate line 101, 112, and line 134, etc into some broader statements about the need for detailed planning...and the extent to which key actions have already been identified | Current text maintained. Some strategies are intentionally very broad (Healthy People, Nat’l PA Plan). |
| | 6-7 | 134 | What is the US National Physical Activity Plan and where does one find it? | The National PA Plan is included in the resource list at the end of the chapter (including hyperlink). |
| | 6-7 | 137 | See suggestion above about renaming this section | Addressed above. |
| | 6-8 | 147 | Add “calorie conscious” after “nutritious” | Edit is unnecessary. |

| | | | | |
|---|------------|-------|--|---|
| | 6-8 | 152 | It is not clear to me how individual foods can be consistent with the DGA.. food patterns can be, but how are foods? | Changed “foods” to “meals and snacks”. |
| | 6-8 | 157 | Want to also identify when a child crosses BMI percentiles in appropriately... even if below the definition of overweight/obese | This level of detail is not appropriate for these bullets. |
| | 6-9 | 179 | Please add a title that is specific & catchy. For example, “How to figure out how many calories for you and your family need each day in 3 minutes or less!” | Unsure if this title suggestion is for the resource list? In any event, this title is not aligned with the purpose of the Guidelines policy document (i.e. not a consumer piece). |
| Appendices: | | | | |
| | A-1 | | Please considering adding: -“Making a meal – what does it include?” -Simple recipes to achieve some nutrient goals- maybe a soup, a stew, a casserole, and a veggie dish -serving sizes for children with sample meals and calories provided | Appendix 1 is intended to assist readers in finding discussions of topics and recommendations for particular population subgroups within the chapters of the document. |
| | A1 and A-2 | Title | This is not really a summary of recommendations; it is a Key to the location of recommendations. Perhaps the title could be Key to Recommendations for Specific Population Groups | Title changed to “Recommendations for Specific Populations Groups”. |
| Summary of Recommendations | | | | |
| | | | I find there to be quite a disconnect between the discussion of environmental influences and the summary recommendations, and appendices etc. It would help at least to focus on being an active consumer and speaking out to food companies, restaurants, etc. to offer better choices – as well as advocate for government policies that encourage healthier food environments (with some specific examples). As written the eventual recommendations put all the responsibility on the consumer. | Appendix 1 is intended to assist readers in finding discussions of topics and recommendations for particular population subgroups within Chapters 2-5 of the document. Chapter 6 addresses actions that can be taken on the broader societal front to improve the food and physical activity environment. |
| Key Consumer Behaviors & Strategies to Implement the 2010 DG | | | | |
| | A-3 | | Perhaps it would help to make such headings and content more consumer-friendly and less “nutrition speak” | No change--this is not directly for consumers. |
| | A-3 | 13 | Delete “Key consumer behaviors and strategies” from title and replace with “How” | No change--this is not directly for consumers. |
| | A-3 | 34 | Delete “Maintain” and replace with “Understood” | No change to overarching concept--included as a strategy. |
| | A-3 | 35 | Add bullet point “know how many calories you and your family need each day and where/ how to find out” | No change to overarching concept--included as a strategy. |
| | A-3 | 36 | Delete “from” and replace with “by choosing” | Edited |
| | A-3 | 36 | Add “wisely” after “beverages” | Edited |
| | A-3 | 44 | Delete “increase intake of” and replace with “choose” | Edited |
| | A-3 | 44 | Add “presently” before “consumed” | No change. |
| | A-3 | 45 | Delete “increasing intake of” and replace with “more” | Related edit. |
| | A-3 | 46 | ‘Increase’ is potentially inviting added calories. Perhaps, ‘choose’ or consume (as opposed to reduce/ limit) is the better message. | Related edit. |
| | A-4 | 48 | Delete first sentence and replace with “eat less, less often” | Related edit. |
| | A-4 | 49 | Delete “reducing intake of” and replace with “eat less” | Related edit. |
| | A-4 | 50 | Add “and not by children or pregnant women.” after “moderation.” | Covered in strategy section. |

| | | | | |
|--|-----|--|--|---|
| | A-4 | 50 | Add “at all” after “is consumed” | Edited |
| | A-4 | 53 | Add “Nutrient” before “adequacy” | Section deleted. |
| | A-4 | 53 | Delete “in” and replace with “means consuming” | Section deleted. |
| | A-4 | 54 | Make “vitamin” lower case | Section deleted. |
| | A-4 | 56 | Add “means more foods that have nutrients, not just calories, sugar and fat” after “consumed” | Section deleted. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 1, column 3 | BOLD “know your calorie needs” and add details, explain how/ when | No change. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 2, column 3 | add “for children and /or adults” after “meals at home” | Change made. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 3, column 3 | Add “MyPyramidtracker.com” | To be updated, as appropriate. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 3, column 3 | Delete “Look for” and replace with “Always check” and provide example at end of this sentence | Text edited to address comment. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 3, column 3 | Add “Avoid ‘mindless eating’” and footnote Brian Wansink’s book! | No change. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 3, column 3 | Add “choose noncalorie beverages such as coffee, tea, or water before choosing caloric foods” after “control the amount you eat” | No change. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 4, column 2 | Add “or avoid” after “Limit” | No change. |
| | A-4 | Box – line 4, column 3 | Add “fruits and vegetables or” after “Choose” | No change. |
| | A-5 | Box – line 1, column 3 | Add bullet “Avoid second helpings or choose vegetables or fruits only” | This concept is addressed in another strategy. |
| | A-5 | Box – line 2, column 3 | Add “preferably as a family” after “more often” | Change made. |
| | A-5 | Box – line 3, column 3 | Add “cooked without added fat, sauces or breading” after “whole grains” | No change. |
| | A-5 | Box – line 4, column 3 | Add “children especially should reduce screen time and be physically active at least one hour per day” | Text edited to address comment. |
| | A-5 | Think about choosing healthier options when eating out | The (e.g., appetizer...) might be very misleading. Small plates are probably okay but typical appetizers often have MORE calories than some of the entrees. We use this fact all of the time in weight control counseling classes. Also, for the statement about taking some food home—perhaps a reference to the implicit food safety issue if they are not going straight home and can refrigerate the foods. | No change. |
| | A-6 | Box – line 2, column 2 | Add “ e.g. standing is better than sitting, walking is better than standing, etc.” | No change. |
| | A-6 | Box – line 4, column 2 | Add “each day” after “vegetable intake” | Not edited--for consistency with other food groups. |
| | A-7 | Box – line 1, column 3 | Delete “Use” and replace with “Choose fresh fruits, whenever possible or use unsweetened,” and also delete “as well as fresh fruits” | Related edit made. |
| | A-7 | Box – line 2, column 3 | Add “Remember these beverages add calories to your day.” After “low-fat milk” | Related edit made. |

| | | | | |
|--|-------|------------------------|---|---|
| | A-7 | Box – line 3, column 3 | Add “In addition to milk,” before “This group” | Text not in box. |
| | A-8 | Box – line 1, column 3 | Please give specific examples of what TO eat, not only what to avoid. | Text not in box. |
| | A-8 | Box – line 1, column 2 | Add “These include” and examples after “whole grains” | Added examples to column 3. |
| | A-8 | Box – line 1, column 3 | Add “choose whole oats, barley, etc” after “whole grain breads” | Added examples to column 3. |
| | A-8 | Box – line 3, column 2 | Delete “Increase intake of” and replace with “Choose” | Related edit made. |
| | A-8 | Box – line 3, column 2 | Delete “by replacing” and replace with “instead of” | Related edit made. |
| | A-8 | Box – line 3, column 2 | Delete “with oils” | Related edit made. |
| | A-8 | Grains | I found the whole grain section pretty discouraging. Is there any way to give examples of what does qualify as a whole grain? What proportion of products out there would actually qualify? | Yes, it is currently challenging. |
| | Table | first Strategies box | Insert space in “Table 2-3” | Edited |
| | A-9 | Add new line | Column 1 – “Sugar Sweetened beverages” Column 2 – “over-consumed by many Americans, especially children” Column 3 – Limit or avoid SSB. Choose nonfat milk, coffee, tea or water or non-caloric beverages. | Added in parens. Especially children is not true, and these are stratgies, not statements. Content there already. |
| | A-9 | Sodium | Minor point; “instead of salt as alternatives to salt “is redundant The statement “most foods contain sodium” seems too general. Is the point that most foods that are main sources of calories contain sodium? That would be a tighter link to the statement you make. | Edited Removed |
| | A-10 | Add new line | Column 1 – “Meals” Column 2- “Eat 2-3 meals, not just snacks” Column 3 – “Meals include, breakfast, lunch and dinner. Breakfast should include a good source of dietary fiber, as well as good sources of protein and unsaturated fat (see X). All meals should include at least 1-2 servings of fruits and/or vegetables in order to reach recommended daily amounts.” | These suggestions are for further implementation, due to space limitations. Also, do not want to add content at this time without further review. |
| | A-10 | Add new line | Column 1 – “Snacks” (define) Column 2 – “Limit” Column 3 – “Choose fruits and vegetables or low calorie foods.” | These suggestions are for further implementation, due to space limitations. Also, do not want to add content at this time without further review. |
| | A-10 | Add new | Column 1 – “Desserts” (define) | These suggestions are for further implementation, due to space |

| | | | | |
|--|------------|----------------------------------|---|---|
| | | line | Column 2 – “Limit” Column 3 – Define what is a grain based dessert | limitations. Also, do not want to add content at this time without further review. |
| | A-11 | Add new line | Column 1 – “How to cook” Column 2 – “eating at home” Column 3 – “Many people are challenged by cooking meals at home. Some easy recipes and simple techniques can be found...” | These suggestions are for further implementation, due to space limitations. Also, do not want to add content at this time without further review. |
| | A-11 | Add new line | Column 1 – “Breastfeeding” Column 2 – “Encourage breastfeeding” Column 3 – “Seek assistance from...” | These suggestions are for further implementation, due to space limitations. Also, do not want to add content at this time without further review. |
| | A-11 | Add new line | Column 1 – “Commercial Weight Control Programs” Column 2 – “Group support and motivation” Column 3 – “Seek reputable programs that involve eating foods from all food groups and changing lifestyle. Some options might be: Weight Watchers, etc” | These suggestions are for further implementation, due to space limitations. Also, do not want to add content at this time without further review. |
| Food Safety Principles & Guidance for Consumers | | | | |
| | A-12 | Box | Will some people object to guidance that requires the use of paper towels? | No change. |
| | A-12 | lines 93-95 | incomplete sentence—“Many surface that...” | Done |
| | A-17 | line 145 | I would call this “risky food handling behaviors” | No change. |
| Using the Food Label to Track Calories, Nutrients & Ingredients | | | | |
| | A-19 | Title | Delete “Using” and change to “Learn to Use” | No change made. |
| | A-19 | 205 | This sentence isn’t clear; should it say, “...of the shortfall nutrients and dietary fiber, as well as ...”? | Edits to remove shortfall nutrient. |
| | A-20 | Lines 214-218 | The description of daily value works well for nutrients for which more is better. But to say that a food with a high DV for sodium is “an excellent” source—sends the wrong message. So perhaps the description of how to use DV should differ for the eat more vs. reduce nutrients. | Examples provided. |
| | A-20, A-21 | Use label to Identify Solid Fats | Clarify in the scientific review the rationale for the DGA unique definition of solid fats (that appears not to be based on science or consumer research). The Nutrition Facts food label was selected with consumer research (FDA references) and continues to meet Federal nutrition policy objectives. | No change to be made in this appendix. |
| | A-22 | 269 | Should this say, “good source of whole grains”? (omit “or”) | Edit made. |
| | A-22 | line 274 | So are you saying that the Granola bar is a good source of whole grains that it also a good source of dietary fiber? I see the rolled oats but they are after Brown Rice Syrup. Perhaps explain the entire ingredient list to the reader? or the beginning of the list? | This is already explained. |

| | | | | |
|--|--------|----------------|---|---|
| | A-23 | 279 | Riboflavin is listed as an enrichment nutrient for grains, but I'm not aware of any grains (other than breakfast cereals) that have riboflavin added as "enrichment". Please be certain this is correct. | Not correct – added to a number of grain foods under standard of identity. |
| | A-23 | Refined Grains | Consumer research is necessary to determine whether the DGA unique definitions of terms and specificity of recommendations are conveyed by the Nutrition Facts label. For example, Figure 1 suggests that a granola bar meets recommendations for whole grain, and also meets suggested limits for "solid fats," added sugars, and sodium. Therefore, the DGA must be using implicit criteria to select foods, e.g., grams (teaspoons) or ounces. If specific in recommendations to increased intake of specific foods, e.g. seafood, then the DGA might share criteria to limit the amount of added sugars in foods. | The point here is to make the terms (SOFAs) understandable in terms of the ingredient list, not NFL. |
| | A-24 | Table 3 | Please splash this in other sections of the Report. People have no idea what whole grains are. | Added to chapter 4. |
| | A-24 | Table 3 | I was relieved to see Table 3. This could be placed earlier in the report. I don't recall that this listing was in the main part of the report. If not, consider adding it there and perhaps adding more references to this. I still think a couple of labels to show what it says when it is 100% would be helpful. | Added to chapter 4. |
| | A-25 | Title | Delete "Nutritional Goals for Age-Gender Goals" and replace with "Nutrients needs for all Americans" or something equally as simple | No change. |
| | A-27 | Title | Delete "Estimated" and replace with "How to find out what your estimated daily calorie needs are" | No change. |
| | A-27 | Table | Add "Most Americans are sedentary" | No change. |
| | A-27 | Table | BOLD "Gender/ Activity level" | No change. |
| | A-28 | Title | Add to title: "Find out what foods you need to eat each day to meet nutrient needs" | No change. |
| | A-28 | 391 | Add "A Lacto-Ovo vegetarian is..." | No change. |
| | A28-29 | Food patterns | The details are overwhelming. But I think I recollect mention of a website where this information can be manipulated. If that is the case, a prominent mention of the website with URL would be good right at the top of the page and perhaps again at the end. This would also apply to any of the subsequent tables that have an interactive website. | No change. |
| | A-31 | Table | This diet would contain ZERO vitamin B12 and very little available iron and zinc | In chapter 5, we note that fortified foods are needed for B12. Iron and zinc levels are okay—we checked them. |
| | A-31 | 400 | Add "A vegan diet is..." | A vegan diet is described in chapter 5. |
| | A-32 | 411 | Add "DASH refers to a study designated to lower blood pressure and it has been successful in achieving many other health benefits for adults and children." | The DASH research is described in chapter 5. |
| | A-42 | 600 | Riboflavin is listed as an enrichment nutrient for grains, but I'm not aware of any grains (other than breakfast cereals) that have riboflavin added as "enrichment". Please be certain this is correct. | Riboflavin is a required nutrient to be added to all refined grains that are "enriched". |
| | A-44 | 700 | Add "Grain/based dessert snack" as a definition | It is defined in footnotes in the chapters where it is used. |
| | A-45 | 709 | Riboflavin is listed as an enrichment nutrient for grains, but I'm not aware of any grains (other than breakfast cereals) that have riboflavin | Riboflavin is a required nutrient to be added to all refined grains that are "enriched". |

| | | | | |
|--|-------------|-------------|--|---|
| | | | added as “enrichment”. Please be certain this is correct. | |
| | A-45 | 710 | Add “Refined grains include foods like cake, cookies, pies, etc.” to end of definition | This is defining whole grains. Refined grains have their own entry. |
| | A-45 | 717 | Do you mean “serving size” (not service size)? | Sentence was removed. |
| | A-45 | 737 | Add “Some examples include oats, brown rice, etc,” to the whole grains definition | This content has been reiterated in the text of chapter 4 (side bar) and is not part of the whole grains definition for the glossary. |
| | Appendix 16 | | Consider adding “fortification” to the glossary. | A definition has been added. |
| | Glossary | A-40 & A-44 | If nutrient dense will be used, also add a definition of calorie dense with a cross-ref to “energy-dense” as another form of this term that is used in the field. Include the distinction between nutrient dense and calorie dense within the definition of nutrient dense—and the reverse | A definition for “calorie density” has been added, and it and “nutrient dense” are cross-referenced. |

Compiled Peer Review Comments w. Responses on DGA 2010 Sodium Section – 12/8/10

| Chapter | Page No. | Line No. | Comment | Response |
|---------|----------|----------------|---|---|
| | | | This discussion, the recommendations and summary are welcomed as an important addition to the 2010 DGA policy document. The language is moderate and the advice is sound—the quantified recommendations and the science assessment are well supported by the IOM Dietary Reference values for sodium. | No action requested. |
| | 1 | 7 | Does the statement of the recommendation apply to children as well as adults? I think this should be clarified given the discussion of children within the DGAC report and within this document. | For adolescents and adults – This is discussed in sodium section. No change made. |
| | 1 | 19 | Add “considered” after “Although” | Sodium is essential whether considered or not. No change made. |
| | 1 | 19-25 | Consider adding a clarification that sodium reduction is helpful even for people on medications. The recommendation makes specific reference to hypertension. Many people with hypertension are taking medications and will need this clarity. | The statement in the DGAC (page D6-11) is not specific for sodium, but about dietary changes. No change made. |
| | 1 | 20 | Add sentence “Most Americans eat far more than they need.” | Already stated in next paragraph. No change made. |
| | 1 | 22 | Add “whether they have high blood pressure or not” after “adults” | Change not made as this is an evidence statement. |
| | 2 | Around line 31 | Does the statement about processed foods take into account the number of meals eaten out or purchased already prepared? This whole section (and the report in general) doesn’t seem to provide much guidance about the contribution of foods eaten out. Did the DGAC find evidence about the saltiness of restaurant foods? | Bullet added about eating out. No |
| | 2 | 32 | Need to add something that states that cannot tell the amount of sodium based on taste alone. Some foods high in sodium do not taste salty while other like salty snacks may taste salty because the salt sits on the surface of the product. Definitely give the advice to | Bullet added to read the NFL. |

| | | | | |
|--|---|-------|---|---|
| | | | read the Nutrition Facts label | |
| | 2 | 34 | The wording to “lower amounts” of sodium refers to the prior sentence, but could be confusing because it sounds like low sodium foods contribute a lot of sodium. I don’t think that is what you intend to imply | DGAC says “moderately high” (D6-3) which would be lower than high. The concern was there is not a regulatory definition for moderately high, so was changed to lower which is still accurate. Sentence says lower, not low. No change made. |
| | 2 | 36 | Several places in the document you list “pizza”... there are huge variations in presentation of pizzas in this country now, so what is the pizza you refer to.. with tomato sauce, etc | The specific on pizza are not provided based on the information that was collected on this category. |
| | 2 | 36 | Add READ the Nutrition Facts label. Can you add some advice, e.g, what would be a high sodium food.. how many milligrams per serving or per calorie.. or some way to know what is a high sodium food; or by contrast, what is a low sodium food.. what amount | Bullet added. Discussed in appendix 4. |
| | 2 | 40 | Elsewhere, in the DGAC report I think, a concern was expressed about the sodium content of poultry that has been infused with salt water. Should that be mentioned? | Added sentence about not purchasing chicken that has had sodium added to it. |
| | 2 | 48 | Add “or salt containing seasonings” after “no salt” | Edited |
| | 2 | 50 | I think more needs to be said about eating out. It might be addressed later on in the report but people will not have that explanation when they read this section on sodium | Bullet added. |
| | 2 | 50 | I think this would be clearer if slightly reworded to, “Eat more foods prepared at home where you can control...” (add “prepared”, to distinguish from take-out foods that are eaten at home but prepared by others) | Included |
| | 2 | 52 | Add a caution not to replace salt with kosher salt or sea salt, the sodium reduction is only minimal This is a very frequent question/practice we are observing in our patients who have been told to reduce salt. They also see on cooking channel chefs throwing in hand fuls of sea salt and acting like that is healthy salt | There was no discussion of this in DGAC report. |
| | 3 | 54 | I would remove “because”, and just say Salt is found in a wide variety of foods and caloric intake is associated.... It seemed not quite accurate to say that the reason the association exists is because of the wide distribution of sodium in foods. I think the association is strongly influenced by the fact that many of the processed foods that are primary sources of calories have sodium—that is not the same as just saying “a wide variety”. | Removed |
| | 3 | 56 | Add “and/or substitute fresh fruits and vegetables for processed foods,” after “reduce calorie intake” | This has already been addressed in a bullet. The point here is about energy intake. No change made. |
| | 3 | 63 | I doubt that meeting the AI for sodium, “ensures that the overall diet provides an adequate intake of other nutrients.” Either omit or reword. | The AI was based in part on this. See below comment. |
| | 3 | 63 | In what way does the AI for sodium ensure an overall intake of other nutrients? This sentence did not seem correct to me. Perhaps something is missing from it. | Sentence edited to ... and ensures that the recommended intake levels can be met for other nutrients. |
| | 4 | 76-78 | I think the statement that the UL for sodium was based on the | Edits have been made to address this point. |

| | | | | |
|--|---|-------|---|---|
| | | | initial DASH trial is incorrect. The sodium intake in that trial was held constant and the BP effect was due to changes in other aspects of the diet. So, I think that the DASH Sodium study only is the one to be specifically referenced here. | |
| | 4 | 88-90 | Does the evidence show that the subgroups mentioned are more sensitive to the BP raising effects of sodium, or do the studies show that they are more sensitive to the BP lowering effects of sodium reduction? This is a technical point but I wanted to mention it, because the studies that are the basis for this statement might not have increased sodium intake to examine sensitivity. Clearly one would presumably be the reverse of the other, but it might be as easily said in terms of reduction if that was the case. | The DGAC did not do a NEL review of these groups. |
| | 5 | 93 | This statement that 2300 is the recommendation for everyone seems to contradict the statement of the recommendation, which identifies 1500 as a target for some subgroups. Also, I think more explanation is needed about what the conclusion was for children. | The IOM report states that the UL applies to all ages. It is correct that the IOM report is not consistent with the key recommendation. |