UNITED STATES OF AMERICA FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

NATIONAL BROADBAND PLAN WORKSHOP

LESSONS FOR THE NATIONAL BROADBAND PLAN FROM LOCAL

OFFICIALS REPRESENTING UNDER-SERVED COMMUNITIES

Washington, D.C.

Wednesday, December 9, 2009

1	PARTICIPANTS:
2	Panelist Presentations:
3	CALVIN SMYRE President of the National Black Caucus of State
4	Legislators, Georgia State Representative
5	ROBERT STEELE Commissioner, 2nd District of Cook County
6	(Chicago), IL
7	VANESSA R. WILLIAMS Executive Director of the National Conference of Black Mayors (NCBM)
8	
9	GUS K. WEST Board Chair and President, The Hispanic Institutes
10	
11	* * * *
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	(9:40 a.m.)
3	MR. LLOYD: Good morning. It is, I
4	think, almost 9:40, which means that we're 10
5	minutes late for a relatively short program, but
6	we're going to get started here and catch up very
7	quickly. We have at least a full morning and
8	perhaps more and different participants than we
9	anticipated, but why don't we get started?
10	My name is Mark Lloyd and please welcome
11	to I think Krista will correct me, but I think
12	this is like the 1 millionth and 12th Broadband
13	Workshop Panel that we've had here. This is
14	"Lessons for the National Broadband Plan from
15	Local Officials Representing Underserved
16	Communities," just to make sure that everyone
17	like flights, you know that you're on the right
18	ship and we're going to wind up around noon or so.
19	We have three commissioners, which is
20	actually very quite unusual for these panels,
21	who are going to make very brief opening
22	statements to get us started off. And then I'll

1 make a brief statement and then we will begin the

4

- 2 program in earnest and I'll introduce the support
- 3 and myself more properly. And we can get started.
- 4 And so, let me introduce Commissioner
- 5 Michael Copps, who has been, I think, a very
- stalwart supporter in trying to make sure that all
- 7 voices are heard as the FCC considers what really
- 8 ought to be in a National Broadband Plan that
- 9 we're supposed to deliver to Congress, I think, 70
- 10 days from now. And with that, let me introduce
- 11 FCC Commissioner Michael Copps.
- MR. COPPS: Thank you, Mark. Good
- morning to everybody. Welcome to the 1 millionth
- 14 and 12th workshop. We appreciate your being here,
- 15 appreciate our distinguished panelists. I think
- some folks have been caught up in the ravages of
- 17 rainy weather, traffic in Washington, but they'll
- 18 be coming in and I guess there's some people out
- 19 there in the virtual world who are listening in,
- 20 too, so that's wonderful.
- 21 As most of you know, we are in the midst
- of probably the most far-reaching effort that this

1 Commission has ever undertaken: To craft that

- 2 broadband plan for all Americans between now and
- 3 February 12th. We've still got a long way to go,
- 4 but these workshops have been very helpful to us
- and I think to the country generally. They've
- 6 been educational. I think more and more Americans
- 7 are beginning to understand that broadband isn't
- 9 just about some super duper technology or some
- 9 techno-geek kind of application, but it's really
- 10 central to all of the problems facing our country
- 11 whether it's jobs, economy, energy, health care,
- 12 climate change -- none of those problems has a
- 13 solution that isn't, in part at least,
- broadband-related, so it's really important.
- And it's really important, I think, to
- opening the doors of equal opportunity in this
- 17 country of ours. The good news is that it can do
- so much to open those doors of opportunity, but if
- we don't get it right, it can actually end up
- 20 making the present gaps that we have in this
- 21 country even worse. So it is really hugely
- 22 important that we get this right and benefit from

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 your advice and your counsel so we can begin to

- 2 overcome generations of derelict policy and lost
- 3 opportunities.
- So, one of the tests, really, of whether
- 5 we have a viable broadband plan will be how it
- 6 affects our diversity communities, how it affects
- our minorities, does it really work, and that
- 8 means not just getting the technology out and
- 9 available to all of the communities in our
- 10 country, but helping folks understand the
- importance of it and convincing them that they
- 12 need to adopt this.
- 13 And it also means minorities
- 14 participating in the whole process, in the
- 15 construction of the infrastructure. There's a
- 16 rightful place there, obviously, for the
- 17 creativity and knowledge that our diversity
- 18 communities can bring. So, this is just -- I
- 19 could go on and on on this, but it's just hugely
- 20 important in so many ways.
- 21 It's important, too, I think, just to
- 22 our -- this is about digital inclusion. Digital

1 inclusion includes our civic dialogue and how we

- 2 talk to one another and how we exchange news and
- 3 information, and broadband is going to become the
- 4 primary way to do this. So, you know, you all
- 5 know broadcast is important to you, traditional
- 6 media, old media. New media is going to be
- 7 vitally important, too, and we've got to make sure
- 8 that we don't visit some of the sins on new media
- 9 that bad policy has visited upon old media in
- 10 recent years.
- So, we've got a lot to do. I'm
- delighted that you're here to help. I'm glad to
- see a lot of friends here and I hope others are
- 14 listening and I look forward to your
- 15 presentations. Thank you.
- 16 Let me introduce now my friend and
- 17 colleague Rob McDowell. Rob has been to many of
- 18 these workshops. He has toiled long and hard in
- 19 trying to open up the doors of entrepreneurial
- 20 activity and economic opportunity, and his
- 21 presence here is further testimony of his
- 22 commitment to that good cause.

1 MR. McDOWELL: Thank you, Commissioner,

- 2 for that very generous introduction and for
- 3 reading it just the way I wrote it for you. I
- 4 appreciate that.
- 5 Good morning. How's everybody? It's a
- 6 sleepy, rainy morning, but this is a very, very
- 7 important topic that's not sleepy at all.
- 8 So, I've served, before I got the
- 9 Commission, in various capacities, on boards, in
- 10 commissions at the state and local level, county
- 11 level, community level. I have a brother who's a
- 12 mayor. He's the mayor of El Segundo, California.
- 13 In California they say El Segundo. But El Segundo
- 14 for (Spanish). Buenos dias y bienvenido.
- But this is a very, very important
- issue. I think one of the things we can all take
- away is it doesn't really matter what jurisdiction
- 18 folks live in, that there are underserved
- 19 communities in every single jurisdiction in
- 20 America. And hopefully, today we'll explore a
- 21 little bit more about that.
- 22 And by the way, Mark, thank you very

1 much for putting this together and for moderating

- 2 it and what a great team you've got here.
- 3 So, a lot of this boils down to -- I'll
- 4 keep this very brief -- a lot of this boils down
- 5 to supply and demand. If we have enough supply of
- 6 robust broadband technologies, innovation will go
- 7 up, prices will go down, and, therefore,
- 8 subscribership and penetration will go up,
- 9 adoption will go up.
- 10 But what can we do on both sides of the
- 11 supply and demand equation? We certainly -- if
- you're an entrepreneur, small business owner or
- wannabe, you need access to capital and that
- doesn't matter if it's radio, television, or the
- 15 Internet, and that is the number one obstacle
- 16 facing any entrepreneur regardless of what
- 17 community it may come from. So, we've been
- 18 exploring, as part of our broadband plan,
- investigation. Maybe that was the 1 millionth and
- 20 2nd workshop we did and several, actually -- was
- 21 on access to capital for companies of all sizes
- 22 and for men and women of ambition of all stages of

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 706 Duke Street, Suite 100

Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190 www.andersonreporting.net

- development in their business plans.
- So, we all need to make sure we work
- 3 towards the ubiquity of fatter and faster pipes
- 4 for all and that should spark a virtual, virtuous
- 5 cycle.
- 6 Then on the demand side, I think we all
- 7 need to look at what can we do to increase
- 8 adoption, and certainly education is a big part of
- 9 that. There's still a significant percentage of
- 10 people out there who think that they don't need a
- 11 broadband technology, and we need to change that
- mindset because it really is a technology that not
- only has penetrated faster than almost any
- 14 technology in the history of humankind, but has
- 15 really helped improve the human condition almost
- more quickly than any other technology.
- So, we can, I think, look at a lot of
- 18 programs and ideas that will help spur adoption.
- 19 What can we do at the FCC to make it easier for
- 20 folks to pull video content through the Internet
- 21 directly to their TV set? And there are a lot of
- 22 products out there already that address this. But

1 what can we do maybe to make that easier for

- 2 consumers and less complicated so you don't have
- 3 to be a techno-geek, as my distinguished colleague
- 4 has said, to wire up your TV to your computer or
- 5 whatever the case might be? So, I think,
- 6 hopefully, we'll be exploring those opportunities
- 7 as well.
- 8 What can we do to help stimulate
- 9 telecommuting? Can we give -- allow businesses to
- 10 expense the capital expenditures for a computer
- and also give them a tax incentive to help foster
- 12 broadband connections at home for their employees?
- 13 George Mason has several studies -- George Mason
- 14 University -- that shows that actually worker
- 15 productivity increases, family life satisfaction
- increases, the cost to employers decreases,
- there's less office space rent, for instance, they
- have to pay for that employee, everyone's happier,
- 19 it's win-win. But you have to change the paradigm
- 20 where employers feel the need to see their
- 21 employee working.
- Now, of course, telecommuting doesn't

work for all professions. If you're a surgeon,

- 2 you've got to be there at work. You know, if
- 3 you're a waitress, you've got to be there at work.
- 4 But there are a lot of professions where it can
- 5 help and it's also environmentally friendly, it
- 6 gets cars off the road. It means fewer tax
- dollars have to be spent building roads, et
- 8 cetera, et cetera, but it affects many, many
- 9 things. But it also would help spur demand, which
- 10 would give an economic incentive to build fatter
- 11 and faster pipes.
- So, anyway, we'll be looking at all
- these issues in the course of our broadband plan
- 14 and we look forward to working with not only the
- people here on this panel today, but throughout
- 16 the country. This is going to be an ongoing
- iterative process, as I've said many times. We're
- not going to come out with some plan that's carved
- in stone, that's going to be static for years to
- 20 come. It's going to be fluid and changing and it
- 21 should be because economic circumstances are going
- 22 to change. There's going to be new technologies

announced, probably, you know, February 18th, the

- 2 day after the plan is due to Congress, that might
- 3 change the whole game plan. So, we look forward
- 4 to working with you as partners as we go forward.
- 5 So, without further ado, I want to
- 6 introduce my distinguished colleague from South
- 7 Caroline who has an incredible record of public
- 8 service down there, public sector as well as
- 9 private sector, and brings a wonderfully unique
- 10 perspective to the Commission, the Honorable
- 11 Mignon Clyburn. Thank you.
- 12 MR. CLYBURN: Thank you. I know you're
- 13 tired, so that applause was -- that's all right,
- I'm okay. I'm secure. I'm secure.
- Good morning, everyone. This room
- 16 represents the powers that be, the powers that it
- would need to make a difference as it relates to
- 18 this particular topic. Mrs. Frasier, from
- 19 Representative Townsend's office; we've got
- 20 federal commissioners and those staff persons at
- 21 the FCC, including my good friend Mark Lloyd, who
- 22 deeply care about what we're speaking about today

in terms of serving underserved and other

- 2 challenged communities. And mayors and represents
- 3 of -- state representatives are here this morning
- 4 who recognize that something that -- it took me a
- 5 while to recognize, that no man is an island.
- 6 It's going to take all of these forces, all of us,
- 7 to realize and recognize and help uplift
- 8 communities that are challenged.
- 9 When I go home -- when we had our
- 10 broadband conference in South Carolina, one thing
- 11 -- it reminded me of a story that a lady once told
- me. I was doing some volunteer work in Charleston
- and I was frustrated at the end of the day because
- we had this incredible health conference and very
- few people attended. We had a free screening, you
- 16 know, just opportunities to, you know, get a
- 17 better handle on your present health status. And
- I know the community in which we were housing this
- 19 event, there were a whole host of people who
- 20 probably hadn't been to the doctor in years. And
- I was just wondering why. You know, we put forth
- 22 this effort, we got this here, it's free. Why did

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 the people stay home? It's because there was a

- 2 disconnect between our good will and those persons
- 3 feeling that they were a part, feeling that they
- 4 could connect with us. There was a disconnect
- 5 between the people who we care so much about that
- 6 we wanted to serve, and that's what we have here.
- 7 That's what we're faced here.
- This focus on un-served and underserved
- 9 communities and with these panelists who represent
- 10 right where the people are, this presents us with
- 11 an opportunity to get this right. That that
- disconnect that I experienced in my early twenties
- 13 about wanting to do good for the community that
- 14 did not know me from anything -- you know, why
- 15 should they trust me?
- 16 We've got people here, if we do it
- 17 right, if we do it in concert, if we recognize
- that the federal government does certain things
- 19 right, the state government, they do certain
- 20 things right, and the local government -- I'll go
- 21 ahead and say it -- they do everything right, that
- 22 if we recognize where our strengths are, where our

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 abilities are, and recognize that no man is an

- 2 island, that it's going to take all of us to
- 3 uplift all of us, then indeed we have an
- 4 opportunity to get it right.
- 5 I want to be a part of getting it right.
- 6 We have an incredible opportunity to close these
- 7 gaps, to un-widen these canyons that currently
- 8 exist in our communities. We've got an incredible
- 9 opportunity to do it right and we are starting,
- 10 continuing now, with including all of the persons
- from the various sectors who know how to do things
- 12 right in their islands, so to speak. And if we
- 13 continue this dialogue, if we continuing moving
- 14 along this path, if we continue to recognize
- everyone's strength, then indeed we will get this
- 16 right. Thank you for being a part of getting this
- 17 right.
- MR. LLOYD: So, let me start out, again,
- 19 by thanking all of the commissioners for coming
- in. There are probably fewer than 100 Americans
- 21 who've really had the opportunity to vote on
- 22 communications policy in the United States over

1 the course of the history of communications policy

- in the United States, only five commissioners,
- 3 roughly, at a time. We've had more or less over
- 4 the years, but roughly fewer than 100 who've ever
- 5 had a vote and you've just heard from three people
- 6 who have a vote in the U.S. About communications
- 7 policy.
- I do not have a vote. I am simply sort
- 9 of second level, third tier staffer without a
- 10 window here at the Federal Communications
- 11 Commission. My title is associate general
- 12 counsel. I think we did a panel before with
- general counsel sort of splayed down below me and
- my boss (inaudible) wasn't too happy about that.
- 15 It was okay.
- 16 I'm just an associate general counsel
- and chief diversity officer here. My focus is
- 18 really on working across the Commission to make
- 19 sure that I can provide whatever support is
- 20 necessary to advance the issues or interest of
- 21 diversity here at the Federal Communications
- 22 Commission.

1 This, in many ways, is a follow-up to a

- panel that was really very ably moderated and
- 3 coordinated by Lauren Kravitz on state and local
- 4 governments toolkits and best practices. There
- 5 were a number of folks who really felt that there
- was some perspective, particularly about the needs
- of underserved and un-served communities and that
- there was more conversation needed to follow up
- that earlier panel that occurred on September 1st.
- 10 So in many ways this is a follow- up to that
- 11 panel.

2

- As Commissioner Clyburn has said very 12
- 13 ably, what we really hope to hear today is from
- folks who aren't in Washington, who are in touch 14
- with what is going on in local communities, who 15
- know, understand, share the challenges that those 16
- communities face regarding broadband adoption and 17
- 18 access and what works, most importantly.
- 19 This is a listening session for those of
- 20 us here at the Federal Communications Commission.
- 21 We have, you know, pulled together really a
- tremendous body of work trying to hear from the 22

1 public about what we need to do to suggest to

- 2 Congress what ought to be our National Broadband
- 3 Plan. And so we really do hope to also, in
- 4 addition to our panelists, hear from you in the
- 5 audience and from those who are at work or at home
- 6 who are participating via Internet. And we have
- 7 really a tremendous amount of staff support from
- 8 the Office of Communications and Business
- 9 Opportunities.
- 10 Gilberto DeJesus is here. Gil, are you
- 11 -- okay, so if you could just sort of identify
- 12 yourself, and Gil will help. If you have
- questions to ask, please write those questions
- down on cards and Gil will be more than happy to
- take those questions up and bring them to me.
- 16 Christian Fiasconali is here and he is
- our online coordinator. Again, will be helping
- 18 to, again, make sure that we've got questions from
- 19 the public to present to the panelists.
- 20 And the person who's sort of going to
- 21 make sure that we actually stay on time -- tough
- job, John -- John Finney, who's going to be our

1 time, who's helping us out. So, we have able

- 2 support from the commissioners and their staffers
- 3 to folks who really sort of helped this on.
- 4 And I could not go on without mentioning
- 5 David Honig, who really, in a great degree, is an
- 6 engine behind this. David was here somewhere. I
- 7 don't know where he might have disappeared to.
- 8 So, thank you, again, David, for all your help and
- 9 support in helping to pull this panel together.
- 10 We hope to wrap up around noon, no later
- 11 than noon today. We have, I think, a full set of
- 12 bios both online and on the table up front here
- for those of you in the audience. We have a
- 14 couple of folks who may be delayed because of the
- rain who will be joining us, and we have a new
- 16 participant who may be here instead of one, but
- 17 we'll get to those introductions a little bit
- 18 later on.
- We're going to start with Calvin Smyre,
- 20 president of the National Black Caucus of State
- 21 Legislators. Representative Smyre is a
- 22 businessman. He is a foundation leader. He is

1 recognized, I think, across the country by state

- 2 legislators as one of the leaders in his area. A
- 3 Georgia state representative, executive vice
- 4 president, Corporate External Affairs of Synovus.
- 5 Do I have that correctly? And president of the
- 6 Synovus Foundation.
- 7 He was elected to the Georgia House of
- 8 Representatives in 1974 as its youngest member at
- 9 age 26. He's just a few years older than that
- 10 now. He is the president of the National Black
- 11 Caucus of State Legislators and a member of the
- 12 Assembly on State Issues of the National
- 13 Conference of State Legislators. I am not doing
- 14 his biography justice by just letting you know
- 15 that. Again, much more information about
- 16 Representative Smyre online and on the table, but
- 17 let's see if we can get to the program and start
- 18 with Mr. Smyre.
- 19 Thank you, sir.
- 20 MR. SMYRE: Thank you very much. It's a
- 21 pleasure for me to be here and I want to thank
- 22 Mark Lloyd, who I met doing a diversity meeting

1 here several weeks ago, and it's a delight to be

- 2 back at the FCC.
- And I want to personally thank the
- 4 commissioners that were present here today and
- 5 that are still here. All that I have met and have
- 6 worked with and I'm delighted that they have been
- 7 receptive and accessible to us as state
- 8 legislators and Commissioner Clyburn, Commissioner
- 9 Copps, and Commissioner McDowell, whom I've all
- 10 met and had an opportunity to talk with. So, it's
- 11 a real situation and when we produced our
- 12 broadband imperative from the black state
- 13 legislators and elected legislative women and
- 14 black mayors and local elected official and black
- 15 county officials, we were here for two days and
- 16 you all were very receptive in that regard and in
- our rollout. So we do have a working relationship
- 18 with the Federal Communications Commission. And
- 19 as president of the National Black Caucus of State
- 20 Legislators, on behalf of all of our members, I
- 21 want to take this opportunity to thank you and I
- 22 listen very intently to what you all were saying

in your introductory remarks. And Commissioner

- 2 Clyburn, I couldn't agree with you more that being
- 3 a part and getting it right sort of sums it up in
- 4 all aspects.
- 5 So, we at NBCSL want to be a part of
- 6 getting it right and with you and Commissioner
- 7 Copps and all the other members of the FCC, I have
- 8 followed you all as it relates to -- especially to
- 9 Commissioner Copps -- as it relates to his
- 10 commitment to the various diverse communities
- 11 throughout America and I'm looking forward to
- 12 working with both of you all.
- 13 Why don't you all give the FCC a round
- of applause and thank them for -- (applause). So
- 15 I'm delighted to be here and it's a privilege for
- 16 me to come and I want to thank Mark Lloyd again
- for putting and bringing all of us together to
- talk about the broadband plan from local elected
- officials representing underserved communities.
- 20 As state legislators -- and I represent
- 21 625 legislators representing 42 states, and I hope
- that we will continue to play a vital role in

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 ensuring the successful implementation of the

- 2 National Broadband Plan, particularly with respect
- 3 to our ability to understand the needs and protect
- 4 the interests of our most vulnerable communities,
- 5 those populated by low-income, rural, minority,
- 6 and underserved people.
- We are well aware of the profound impact
- 8 that increased broadband use will have on
- 9 minimizing and eradicating the social and economic
- 10 disparities that have long plagued our communities
- and our country. It is because of this impact
- 12 that I am here today.
- 13 NBCSL stands ready to take an active
- seat at the table in ensuring America's broadband
- 15 future. We want to make sure that President Obama
- is successful in his goal of achieving 100 percent
- 17 broadband adoption and use and that the Federal
- 18 Communication Commission has the tools and
- 19 partners it needs to accomplish this goal.
- 20 At NBCSL we recognize that
- 21 African-Americans are the farthest behind any
- other ethnic group with respect to home broadband

1 adoption and use with only 46 percent of

- 2 African-Americans subscribing to broadband in the
- 3 home. We can play a critical role in discerning
- 4 the hows and the whys behind this missed
- 5 opportunity. We are likewise poised to identify
- 6 new opportunities to leverage the high wireless
- 7 adoption rate among African-Americans as a mean of
- 8 spurring increased broadband adoption in our
- 9 communities.
- 10 While no one has yet been able to
- 11 completely explain why we are early adaptors of
- wireless technologies, we are prepared to dig deep
- into the trenches of our communities to better
- 14 understand the option dichotomy we now face all in
- an effort to guaranty 100 percent broadband
- 16 adoption and use by low-income minority and
- 17 underserved populations.
- In this same vein, we as state
- 19 legislators, have an invaluable role to play in
- 20 ensuring the successful implementation of a
- 21 properly developed National Broadband Plan,
- 22 especially where the plan is intended to reflect

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 the interest of low-income and underserved

- 2 individuals. An effective plan must be developed
- 3 with practical implementations in mind. It cannot
- 4 be abstract, in our opinion. Consequently, the
- 5 only way to be successful in this effort is to
- 6 engage those closest to the people who would be
- 7 implementing the plan at the front end, that is
- 8 state and local elected officials.
- 9 NBCSL applauds the FCC for recognizing
- 10 the importance of assembling grass-root and
- 11 grass-top support in coordinating the National
- 12 Broadband Plan and we thank you for holding this
- 13 hearing today.
- In closing, we want to acknowledge and
- 15 continue to support the FCC's Intergovernmental
- 16 Advisory Committee. We applaud the recent
- 17 reauthorization of the IAC and the expansion of
- 18 its charter. With about 70 days remaining until
- 19 the release of the National Broadband Plan, it
- 20 would seem that the reengagement of the IAC to
- 21 address issues such as adoption of the Broadband
- 22 Plan, and implementation of expanding broadband

1 adoption and deployment, especially in un-served

- 2 and underserved rural areas and tribal lands, is a
- 3 part and parcel of fundamental questions that must
- 4 be asked.
- 5 We ask that you continue to use the IAC
- 6 as a vehicle by -- through which the FCC will
- 7 communicate and work with city, county, and state
- 8 governments. And we recommend -- and we commend
- 9 you for your vision and desire to speak on the
- 10 variety of issues as it relates to the
- implementation of broadband.
- 12 We thank you for allowing NBCSL. I
- would ask that my entire remarks be included in
- the record, but I want to thank the FCC for
- 15 allowing us to come today to participate in this
- dialogue on broadband adoption in the underserved
- 17 communities of our nation. And we're looking
- forward to working with you as partners in this
- 19 endeavor. Thank you.
- MR. LLOYD: Representative Smyre, thank
- 21 you very much.
- Next we're going to turn to Gus West,

1 who is the board chair and president of the

- 2 Hispanic Institute. The Hispanic Institute is a
- 3 nonprofit organization serving as an educational
- 4 forum for an informed and empowered Hispanic
- 5 America. The Hispanic Institute manages several
- 6 ongoing projects including the study of Hispanic
- 7 economic conditions, media monitoring, consumer
- 8 fraud protection, citizen education and technology
- 9 and telecommunications research. And again, a
- 10 full bio is online.
- 11 And I think with that, Mr. West.
- MR. WEST: Thank you, Mr. Lloyd. On
- behalf of the Board of Directors of the Hispanic
- 14 Institute, I would like to thank the Federal
- 15 Communications Commission for inviting us to be a
- part of today's panel, particularly Commissioner
- 17 Copps and Commissioner Clyburn, who, I believe,
- has left, and -- oh, excuse me. And Mr. Lloyd,
- 19 thank you.
- 20 I would like to read from a preface of a
- joint statement that was issued this past weekend
- 22 by several of the largest caucuses of state

1 legislators. This statement was coauthored by the

- 2 Hispanic Institute and was issued during the
- 3 National Black Caucus of State Legislators meeting
- 4 in Ft. Lauderdale, Florida. I need to say at this
- 5 point that this was the work of Representative
- 6 Smyre. He brought together all these caucuses,
- 7 first of all, got them together to issue a joint
- 8 statement, and then brought the leadership of
- 9 those caucuses down to Ft. Lauderdale, Florida,
- 10 this past weekend. That's a feat in itself, so
- it's his credit and I'm just a messenger in this.
- 12 "The National Asian-Pacific American
- 13 Caucus of State Legislators, National Black Caucus
- of State Legislators, National Caucus of Native
- 15 American State Legislators, the National Hispanic
- 16 Caucus of State Legislators issue this Joint
- 17 Policy Statement in recognition of the important
- 18 role that broadband plays in all of our lives. We
- 19 firmly believe that ubiquitous broadband access,
- adoption, and use, stand to be great equalizers in
- 21 our society. As such, we must ensure that
- 22 Internet adoption and use via a broadband

1 connection becomes engrained as a social, cultural

- 2 norm in our communities. We believe this will
- 3 amplify our ability to improve economic outcomes,
- 4 increase educational opportunities, render quality
- 5 health care both more accessible and affordable,
- 6 and yield new avenues for provisions of better
- 7 public safety and provide tools that lead to a
- 8 cleaner environment.
- 9 "For our organizations and most
- 10 significantly, for the communities of the people
- 11 we represent, the broadband status quo is
- 12 unacceptable. While our constituents all have
- unique needs, we recognize that absent digital
- 14 equality and broadband opportunities, our
- 15 communities, particularly those populated by
- 16 low-income, non-English-speaking, rural, tribal,
- or otherwise underserved populations will be
- unable to fully engage in the increasingly global
- innovation economy. Because universal broadband
- 20 access and adoption are paramount to the success
- of our communities and this country, towards
- 22 access, adoption, and inclusion, a call for

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

digital equality and broadband opportunity sets

- forth our top tier, mutually agreed upon policy
- 3 recommendations as prospective aids to federal
- 4 lawmakers, regulatory bodies, and state and local
- 5 elected officials, as we all endeavor to create
- 6 and implement new opportunities for increased
- 7 broadband adoption and digital inclusion.
- 8 "We set forth principles of progress we
- 9 believe will better enable us to identify the
- 10 presence and ramifications of the digital divide
- 11 within African-American, Hispanic, Native
- 12 American, and Asian-Pacific Islander communities,
- 13 ensure that broadband connectivity is available,
- 14 accessible, and affordable for every American
- 15 regardless of geographical or social economic
- 16 situation. Incent broadband adoption and use by
- increasing its cultural value and social worth,
- and foster investment in, and a robust use of high
- speed broadband Internet service to increase job
- 20 creation and economic activity. We realize the
- 21 power of broadband. We coalesce around our
- 22 collective interests, for our communities and our

1 country we must quaranty broadband access,

- 2 adoption, and inclusion to secure America's
- 3 future."
- A full statement can be accessed on the
- 5 Hispanic Institute's website,
- 6 thehispanicinstitute.org, and I would ask that
- 7 that full statement be included in the record of
- 8 today. Thank you, Mr. Lloyd.
- 9 MR. LLOYD: Thank you, Mr. West. We are
- 10 going to turn now to Mayor Eugene Grant of the
- 11 city of Seat Pleasant, Maryland. He is also a
- 12 member of the National Conference of Black Mayors.
- 13 And I think in the program, in the announcement,
- we had indicated that we would be joined by
- Vanessa Williams, but I understand that Mayor
- Grant is going to be here and present the position
- of the National Conference instead. So, thank you
- 18 for joining us at this late date.
- 19 MR. GRANT: Thank you, Mr. Lloyd. We
- 20 appreciate your hosting of this. We also
- 21 acknowledge the presence of the FCC commissioners
- 22 and we thank them for being here. We are

1 delighted, on behalf of the National Conference of

- 2 Black Mayors, for which I am its first vice
- 3 president, as well as president of the Maryland
- 4 chapter of the National Conference of Black
- 5 Mayors, speaking on their behalf as well, and we
- 6 ask that our full remarks be included into the
- 7 record this morning.
- 8 Again, good morning, and on behalf of
- 9 the National Conference of Black Mayors, we thank
- 10 you for the opportunity to participate in today's
- 11 event. As the first vice president of an
- organization representing 650 African-American
- mayors nationwide who are responsible for the
- 14 governance of more than 48 million people here in
- the United States, it is my pleasure to speak with
- 16 you today about the importance of broadband access
- 17 and adoption to our communities.
- 18 Historically, the communities we
- 19 represent have contained high numbers of
- 20 low-income, rural, minority, and underserved
- 21 people. All too often, the members of these
- 22 communities have been unable to participate in

1 vibrant social economic life because they lack

- 2 access to the essential resources they so
- 3 desperately need. Today, with broadband access
- 4 and adoption becoming an ever present necessity in
- 5 our society, we can no longer afford to allow the
- 6 vulnerable members of our communities to lag
- 7 behind. We must ensure that they are given
- 8 adequate opportunities to access and use
- 9 broadband, the most critical infrastructure of our
- 10 day. It is, therefore, incumbent upon us as
- 11 leaders at all levels, especially local officials,
- who have daily access to the people to ensure that
- our communities are able to participate in a
- 14 digital society and reap the benefits of broadband
- 15 access and innovation.
- 16 Broadband access means better
- 17 educational and economic development
- 18 opportunities. It means higher quality and more
- 19 affordable health care services. Access alone,
- 20 however, is not enough and we must engage our
- 21 citizenry through the culturally relevant content
- 22 and affordable access opportunities to ensure

1 broadband adopts in use in underserved

- 2 communities.
- With the enactment of the American
- 4 Recovery and Reinvestment Act, the Commission is
- 5 required to establish a plan for use of broadband
- 6 infrastructure and services in advancing community
- development, worker training, private sector
- 8 investment, entrepreneurial activity, job
- 9 creation, and economic growth. Municipal
- 10 governments, such as those run by the National
- 11 Conference of Black Mayor's members, on whose
- behalf I appear today, play a critical role in
- 13 ensuring the proper execution and implementation
- of any National Broadband Plan contemplated by the
- 15 Federal Communications Commission or any other
- 16 branch of our federal government. Mayors, city
- and county commissioners, and all other officers
- 18 of local government, have the most direct access
- 19 to the American people, particularly those living
- in underserved communities. Therefore, these
- 21 local elected officials are in the best position
- 22 to access the needs of the people and implement

1 proactive solutions that immediately speak to

- 2 those needs.
- In the case of broadband access and
- 4 adoption, municipal governments are perhaps in the
- 5 best position to engage in broadband mapping
- 6 activities that help ascertain the connected and
- 7 unconnected in their communities. Likewise,
- 8 municipal governments can easily define areas in
- 9 need of the most improvement in their communities
- 10 and can, therefore, define broadband opportunities
- in a way that state and federal governments
- 12 cannot.
- One example comes to mind to the
- 14 National Conference of Black Mayors when we
- 15 consider the import and impact of municipal
- 16 governments on creating new opportunities for
- 17 broadband access, adoption, and use. Under the
- 18 leadership of city commissioner and mayor pro temp
- of Tallahassee, Florida, Digital Harmony is a
- 20 collaborative partnership pilot program designed
- 21 by the city of Tallahassee and others to expand
- 22 Internet access to underserved parts of the

community.

2	This program, in its third year of
3	operation at NIMS Middle School in Leon County,
4	Florida, addresses the socioeconomic gaps created
5	by the digital divide by providing rising sixth
6	graders from economically and economically
7	challenged communities with home access to a
8	computer an online academic curriculum, Internet
9	access, digital literacy training, and mentoring
10	and support. In year one, approximately 100 homes
11	received computers. There was a 50 percent
12	increase in program participants in year 2. And
13	in year 3, an additional 240 students have taken
14	part in the program. NIMS was chosen for this
15	pilot program because it ranked as "F" in schools.
16	Since the program's inception, however, the
17	participating students have seen an increase in
18	academic achievement and performance, and a
19	decrease in behavioral problems, and the school
20	has increased its ranking from an "F" to a "C" in
21	a matter of two years. Now it's examples just
22	like these that need to be replicated and pursued

1 nationwide as a means of enhancing educational and

- 2 economic opportunity in underserved communities.
- 3 The students who complete the three-year
- 4 Digital Harmony pilot program are expected to go
- 5 onto college and pursue greater career
- 6 opportunities. This is how we empower
- 7 communities. This is how we change lives. This
- 8 is the power of municipal governments at work for
- 9 the people we serve daily.
- Sadly, while programs like this may
- 11 exist in other parts of the country, access to
- information about them is few and far between.
- 13 Either information does not exist or it is
- impossible to find because there is no national
- database describing such program resources. Going
- 16 forward, our National Broadband Plan must include
- opportunities for a dedicated focus on identifying
- and scaling programs like the Digital Harmony
- 19 Initiative. Municipal governments can be very
- 20 helpful in this task. As front-line advocates of
- 21 America's underserved, municipal governments can
- readily identify the problems that need to be

1 solved. We are experts at dealing with the health

- 2 care disparities, education gaps, social and
- 3 economic injustice. We can tell you what we need.
- 4 We can provide baseline information and are
- 5 looking to you, the Federal Communications
- 6 Commission, to work with us to create the
- 7 solutions.
- 8 We need each other. Your technical
- 9 expertise coupled with our knowledge of our
- 10 communities is the only way to guarantee success
- in achieving 100 percent broadband adoption by all
- 12 Americans particularly for those in underserved
- 13 communities. Together, we can solve the problems
- 14 that have plagued our communities thus far.
- Thank you.
- MR. LLOYD: Looking forward to more
- 17 conversation, particularly about the Digital
- 18 Harmony program that you raised. This is a really
- 19 great example. We're really looking for those
- 20 sorts of lessons. Thank you very much for that
- 21 presentation.
- 22 Commissioner Robert Steele has come out

of the rain, and I guess all of you have, so thank

- 2 you all for sort of participating. And we had a
- 3 horrible rain day here in Washington, D.C., which
- 4 occurs every now and then in the winter. So,
- 5 thank you for those, particularly those who have
- 6 come from outside of Washington, D.C.
- 7 Commissioner Robert Steele of the 2nd
- 8 District of Cook County, everyone knows, I think,
- 9 that's Chicago, Illinois. More than 30 years of
- 10 experience as a public servant in Chicago, and is
- 11 a results-driven County Board commissioner focused
- on making meaningful and measurable contributions
- 13 to the residents of his district for all of Cook
- 14 County. Commissioner Steele is president of the
- National Association of Black County Officials.
- And so, again, thank you very much for
- joining us here this morning. Looking forward to
- 18 your presentation.
- MR. STEELE: Thank you very much. And
- thank you for having me. To the Commission and to
- 21 the staff of the FCC, thank you for inviting us to
- 22 make some comments today around the Broadband

- 1 Initiative.
- 2 I join my colleagues from the Black
- 3 Mayor's Association and also from the state
- 4 legislature and those others that we partner
- 5 together along with the joint senator to prove our
- 6 case, so to speak.
- 7 I would like to thank FCC for inviting
- 8 me to speak at this workshop. I commend the
- 9 Commission for its work on this important venture
- 10 and I look forward to the outcome. As a
- 11 commissioner of the 2nd District of Cook County,
- 12 the second largest county in this country,
- representing 5.3 million people, I am pleased to
- share what broadband means to our residents'
- 15 quality of life. I have more than 30 years
- 16 experience serving as a public servant of Chicago
- 17 and Cook County. Nationally I serve as a member
- of the National Association of County Officials,
- 19 which is over 900 counties that we represent of
- the 3,200 counties in the United States.
- 21 As the president of the National Black
- 22 County Officials, I am really committed to this

1 program of broadband imperatives to make sure that

- 2 we are getting this nationally across the country.
- 3 It is my role as a public official and the
- 4 president of the National Association of Black
- 5 County Officials, I have witnessed the advantages
- 6 of brainstorming of sharing the best practices and
- 7 approaches among local officials to deal with the
- 8 common issues of local and national concern.
- 9 Of those issues affecting our
- 10 communities, connecting our nation and ensuring
- 11 economic opportunities for underserved
- 12 populations, should be our nation's top priority.
- 13 From a recent report from the Joint Center for
- 14 Political and Economic Studies, it says, "Without
- 15 access to broadband, marginalized groups are
- ill-equipped to contribute to the nation's economy
- and they increasingly face lives of diminished
- 18 opportunities."
- 19 With people of color projected to become
- 20 the majority of the U.S. population before the
- 21 mid-century, the rate at which poor minority
- 22 communities gain access to broadband have

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 implications that go well beyond matters of simple

- 2 fairness and equality and into the realm of
- 3 strategic national importance.
- 4 Right now the nation is facing 10.2
- 5 unemployment rate and it's affecting minority
- 6 populations at a much higher rate. In October,
- 7 the unemployment rate for Hispanics was 13.1
- 8 percent and for African-Americans it was 15.7
- 9 percent.
- 10 Broadband technology is one key tool
- 11 communities can use to combat this trend. If we
- 12 utilize broadband technology access to educate
- 13 members of the minority community, we can better
- 14 equip our residents with skills needed to join our
- workforce, reduce joblessness, and enable
- 16 communities to become more self sufficient. In
- order for such initiatives to be successful,
- 18 members of underserved and underprivileged
- 19 communities must first recognize the need for the
- 20 vast benefits of broadband technology.
- 21 According to the 2009 PEW Home Broadband
- 22 Adoption study, while home-based broadband

1 adoption is growing among African-Americans, the

- 2 rate of growth has been slower when compared to
- 3 other segments and populations. Lack of interest,
- 4 price, availability, and usability were all cited
- 5 as reasons for not switching to broadband
- 6 services. With the current state of the economy,
- 7 the cost of adoption is likely to become even more
- 8 of a concern. Addressing the issue of cost with
- 9 subsidies similar of the Lifeline and Linkup
- 10 programs, which would be administered on a federal
- 11 level, but evaluated at a local level, could be
- 12 one solution.
- 13 However, one interesting finding from
- 14 the PEW research indicates that almost -- that
- 15 although minority populations were less likely to
- 16 us broadband in their homes, they were more likely
- 17 to use their phone to access the Internet than
- 18 other segments of the population. Understanding
- 19 the rationale behind the differences in usage
- 20 rates could prove helpful in developing strategies
- increasing adoption of in-home broadband.
- 22 Additionally, while the PEW study does a

1 good job of reviewing the situation, it is

- 2 critical that we develop more in-depth research
- 3 into the reasons why minority populations lag
- 4 behind in the adoption rates so we can address
- 5 them with a more targeted approach.
- 6 As community leaders, it is critical and
- 7 crucial that we provide community-based solutions
- 8 that enable individuals to integrate advanced
- 9 communication technologies into their everyday
- 10 lives. This past September, the Joint Center for
- 11 Political and Economic Studies, and a number of
- 12 national organizations representing people of
- 13 color and their communities, released a report
- outlining a series of recommendations that would
- 15 encourage broadband adoption.
- Of these recommendations, some of the
- 17 key suggestions include establishing broadband in
- 18 public institutions like schools, libraries,
- 19 churches, and community centers, creating relevant
- 20 online content and opportunities for digital
- 21 literacy training helps members of the community
- 22 better understand and value broadband as an

1 essential service that can improve their lives.

2 Broadband efforts should focus on areas

3 of importance to minority consumers, including

4 education, health care, and employment. One

5 economist program called Digital Communities

provides a good example of how a public/private

7 sector partnership at the municipal level

8 implements these three suggestions. This fall,

the Bertie County School System and the Bertie

10 County Family Resource, in a partner with One

11 Economy, to create a curriculum for teens that

12 would teach these technical and life skills needed

13 to join the workforce. The session focused on

14 digital literacy and real-world experiences.

15 Chicago launched a variation of the

project in 2004, and is currently operating across

17 six different sites. The Center for Technology

18 and Learning did a study evaluating the success of

19 the digital communication program in two cities,

20 San Jose and Miami, and found that after a year in

21 the program, 82 to 86 of participants reported

22 using the Internet at home compared to 46 percent

- of low-income households nationally.
- 2 Furthermore, after 1-1/2 years in the
- 3 program, 92 percent continue to have Internet
- 4 access in their homes with only 1/3 using the
- 5 pre-access offered by one economy, thus meaning
- 6 many households became self-supported users of
- 7 broadband. The success of these case studies
- 8 provides the helpful insight on how private/public
- 9 initiatives can be executed at a municipal level.
- 10 In a recent paper by Janice Haig and
- 11 James Prieger, assessed the achievement of various
- 12 broadband initiatives at the federal, state, and
- 13 local level. In that paper they found local
- 14 efforts have advantages to national programs.
- When local governments and community organizations
- 16 are involved in overcoming broadband adoption
- gaps, they typically begin with a much more
- 18 complete knowledge of what the barriers are in the
- 19 communities. However, that's not to say that
- 20 government efforts at the state and federal level
- 21 are not valuable.
- 22 Programs that operate on a larger scale

1 have the advantage of greater funding sources and

- 2 better data collection in evaluations tools.
- 3 Ideally, the National Broadband Plan would include
- 4 programmatic suggestions which would include the
- 5 advantage of municipal implementation accompanied
- 6 by federal support.
- 7 There are also a number of other areas
- 8 which government intervention could facilitate
- 9 broadband expansion. Law makers should ensure
- 10 that public housing developments are built with
- 11 wired broadband capabilities. The E-Rate program
- should be expanded to include digital literacy
- 13 training for students and teachers. Digital
- learning programs should be established and/or
- 15 expanded to include adult learners and community
- 16 programs.
- 17 The Universal Service Funds should be
- 18 restructure to include broadband services.
- 19 Governments should establish a national program
- 20 that promotes best practices and highlights the
- 21 elements of successful broadband programs that
- 22 should be provided to cities, counties, and state

-	
1	antinmont
_	government.

2 Governments should establish a clear 3 means of identifying, scaling, and replicating 4 successful county broadband programs. Government 5 must properly fund all county broadband programs. However, the expansion of broadband is the first and foremost matter of investment by public companies. Over the past 2 years, the nation's nearly 1,400 facilities-based broadband service 9 providers invested approximately \$120 billion in 10 modern communication networks. Government 11 12 practice and policy should work in conjunction 13 with the private sector to build upon the efforts to bridge our digital divide. 14 Finally, I would like to conclude with 15 the emphasis on the importance of broadband for 16 our communities. Clearly, President Obama and the 17 18 FCC recognize the significance of this issue, but I encourage you, the Commission, to remember when 19 20 crafting and finalizing the National Broadband 21 Plan, that the digital divide is a national concern. Let me emphasize, the resolution resides 22

- in our local communities. By embracing
- public/private partnerships and governmental
- 3 support at the local, state, and federal level, we
- 4 can achieve our goal of connected communities and
- 5 a broadband nation.
- 6 I thank you for your time and looking
- 7 forward to working with you on this effort.
- 8 MR. LLOYD: So, FCC Commissioner Copps
- 9 has been here with us for this entire
- 10 presentation. I was wondering if you had any
- 11 questions that you wanted to pose before I get
- 12 started?
- MR. COPPS: (inaudible)
- MR. LLOYD: Thank you. So, again, Gil,
- 15 I think, is passing out cards for those of us in
- the audience and I'm hoping Christian is getting
- 17 some things that are online.
- 18 Let me start by asking whether any of
- 19 you have any sense of where, given the increasing
- 20 strain on local -- whether it's city or county or
- 21 state -- budgets, where the money comes from for
- 22 either the research, the mapping, for the literacy

1 programs that you've talked about, for getting

- 2 computers in the homes of children? I hate to do
- 3 this, but because -- at least you're the only one
- 4 aside from me with gray hair on the panel,
- 5 Representative Smyre, I'm going to ask you, how do
- 6 we solve this funding problem? And are states
- finding creative ways to address this challenge,
- 8 particularly meeting the needs of underserved
- 9 communities?
- 10 MR. SMYRE: That's a good question. As
- 11 you know, of our states have budget deficits. And
- when you start talking about methodology and
- 13 fundamental and technology and things of that
- 14 nature, it somewhat is not a priority as it
- 15 relates to adoption and to the implementation of
- 16 public policy. But at the same time, I think,
- when you deal with a broadband technology and
- 18 there's a direct correlation to health care
- 19 services, to education, to job creation, to job
- 20 applications, and those are technologies that are
- 21 very much linked to applications, I think, it has
- 22 to be elevated from a public policy perspective.

1 And I think as we talk more and more about this

- 2 issue, the key is to elevate the issue and make it
- 3 a state priority as well as now the President is
- 4 making it a national priority.
- 5 So, with that in mind, I think you would
- 6 have to talk about partnerships. You would have
- 7 to talk about various collaborations, whether or
- 8 not state governments alone could carry the
- 9 burden. But I know working with the mayors and
- 10 the county commissioners of -- there's a direct
- 11 correlation on public safety, how we share various
- technology as it relates to first responders. So
- there are ways to have the linkage that is
- 14 necessary, but cost is a factor and I know that --
- 15 I know city governments and county governments are
- having difficult times, but I know at the state
- 17 level it's very difficult.
- But Mark, I think the elevation of the
- issue, making it more of a quality of life issue,
- 20 and elevating it, I think, puts it in a more --
- 21 when you put it into more of a priority, then it
- 22 puts you in more of a funding apparatus.

1 MR. LLOYD: So, Commissioner Steele, I

- think you emphasized in your testimony, the
- 3 importance of Universal Service Funding
- 4 mechanisms. Do you see the Universal Service Fund
- 5 as the way to sort of fund some of this work at
- 6 the local level? And are you engaged now in how
- 7 the Universal Service Fund is working to support
- 8 schools and libraries through the E-Rate program?
- 9 MR. STEELE: I think that's a great
- 10 opportunity for municipalities and government
- 11 agencies to partner and make sure that we have
- 12 access and partnership with the Universal Fund.
- This is an issue that's well beyond that
- one mechanism. It's a public/private partnership
- 15 as well. We have to look at those companies who
- are the communications companies around the
- 17 country to help us with this issue as well. They
- have a lot to gain from this in our partnership.
- 19 I just met with the governor of the state of
- 20 Illinois on Monday. He's committed to me. He's
- 21 going to provide some funding to the counties
- 22 around Illinois to make sure this initiative gets

off the ground and we're at the leading edge of

- 2 trying to make sure that we provide access to
- 3 those who are in underprivileged and underserved
- 4 communities around Illinois.
- 5 But that link of the public/private
- partnership is the most important link because it
- 7 says that this becomes more than just something
- 8 that the government has to do. It's important
- 9 that the public companies invest in this
- 10 partnership as well so we can grow it well beyond
- 11 the local municipalities trying to fund everything
- out of a small pool of funds. And so I think that
- 13 the partnership with the Universal Program, really
- leads us to that public/private partnership that
- we're looking to establish.
- MR. LLOYD: So, Mr. West, you talked for
- a moment about some of the special challenges, not
- only facing Latinos, but also facing Native
- 19 Americans. Are there special funding challenges
- 20 facing those communities? I -- forgive me for
- 21 sort of going on a little bit here, but I know
- 22 that the immigrant problem is not limited to the

1 Latino population, that there are African-Somali

- 2 immigrants here in the United states and that
- 3 we've got Haitian immigrants who are here in the
- 4 United States and we've got Vietnamese immigrants
- 5 here in the United States as well. But there
- 6 seems to be a special tie and concern about
- 7 whenever we start talking about funding, whether
- 8 some of this funding is going to immigrants here
- 9 who may not be legal immigrants. Are there some
- 10 special funding concerns that the Latino
- 11 population faces?
- MR. WEST: Well, yes, it's a -- you
- 13 know, it's a broader issue that I think -- that
- 14 we're all engaged in at this point. You know, for
- us it just seems inconceivable that you would not
- 16 want to include a child who is not documented in
- 17 terms of trying to get him -- he or she broadband
- 18 access. You know, after all, a society -- our
- 19 true constitution is all of us put together and
- 20 why wouldn't we want each of those parts to have
- 21 access to broadband and all the collective
- 22 knowledge that that encompasses.

1 So, it always will creep in and

- 2 obviously we're concerned that providers suddenly
- 3 become government-mandated that they can't provide
- 4 broadband to immigrants and it is an issue. I
- 5 agree, though, with Representative Smyre that it
- 6 is a priority issue.
- 7 One of the things in terms of the
- 8 funding that I'm always astonished with is the
- 9 public money. I mean, just -- when you saw the
- 10 stimulus money it was, I don't know, it was \$7
- 11 billion, I quess it was. But if you look at what
- 12 the private companies invest in broadband
- development and getting it out there, I mean,
- 14 you're talking annually \$80 billion, I believe,
- the collective broadband effort in this nation.
- So, I don't know that it's going to
- 17 happen. I've been in -- I was a sergeant-in-arms
- of our Nevada legislature, I was in city
- 19 government for five years, and then federal
- 20 government. I don't know that that funding is
- 21 actually going to be able to come from
- governmental entities. I think that the priority

1 -- I think we need to work more closely with these

- 2 public companies and try to get them, and one
- 3 thing that I see that's conflicting right now
- 4 here, particularly at the Federal Communications
- 5 Commission level, is all the discussion is about
- 6 neutrality regulation. I mean, why are we focused
- 7 on neutrality regulation when we know that
- 8 broadband access is the most important thing that
- 9 we can -- closing the digital divide, I don't
- 10 think there can be conceivably anything more
- 11 important. I think almost all leaders agree that
- 12 education is number one and all the collective
- 13 education of mankind is in the Internet, it's in
- 14 broadband, and not getting that to people, that
- has to be the highest priority. And I sort of see
- 16 the Commission, with all due respect, getting off
- 17 track here, focusing on things other than closing
- 18 the digital divide.
- MR. LLOYD: One of the challenges here,
- 20 not to be too defensive about the Commission, is
- 21 that we, unfortunately, are challenged with having
- 22 to do many things at once. And so we have a clear

1 charge: We will provide a National Broadband Plan

- 2 to Congress when Congress has mandated that
- 3 happen. Nothing will allow us to get off track on
- 4 that despite various attempts. We're going to
- 5 focus on that and really appreciate your
- 6 testimony, but we promise you that we will keep
- 7 that focus.
- 8 Mayor Grant, you spoke eloquently about
- 9 a program called Digital Harmony, and I love that
- 10 name. And if I could ask you, where did the
- 11 funding come from to provide -- you said there
- were like 150 computers to start with; I think you
- 13 mentioned over 250 children who were involved in
- 14 this program, I think the next year. Where did
- 15 the money come from to get the computers into
- 16 those homes? That's so important.
- 17 MR. GRANT: Let me first acknowledge our
- 18 president, the Honorable George Grace. I did not
- 19 mention him, that's protocol. And thank our
- 20 executive director, Vanessa Williams, who prepared
- 21 our remarks. So she's a little more qualified to
- 22 the specifics of the program.

1 However, let me say that I think it's

- 2 already been stated by my colleagues here on the
- 3 panel that the key or the answer to this
- 4 prevailing problem that we're faced with with
- 5 funding, and that is partnerships. Tallahassee,
- 6 Florida, and in their program, the Digital Harmony
- 7 program, could not have done this without a strong
- 8 public/private partnership.
- 9 It is to the advantage of the corporate
- 10 community to be engaged in the process and to help
- fund many of these initiatives. And why is that
- 12 so? Because it is an increased customer base for
- 13 them. And so, we certainly did not absolve the
- 14 federal government from being a part of the
- 15 process and funding these initiatives. Clearly,
- 16 cities like ours cannot afford it. And our
- membership, 40 percent of our membership are rural
- 18 communities. They don't have the budgets to build
- 19 the infrastructure or bring these types of
- 20 programs in.
- 21 But we are willing to partner and we
- 22 believe that there are diamonds in the rough in

1 our community and if individuals work with us

- 2 through the broadband plan to ensure that we make
- 3 it accessible for companies to come in and make
- 4 investments into our communities, make it
- 5 accessible for our communities to access the
- 6 Internet, because there's so much opportunity that
- 7 is gained.
- 8 If you look at that particular example,
- 9 where the students -- 100 families received these
- 10 computers, and as a result of that we saw a 50
- 11 percent increase in grade performance. We saw
- 12 their behaviors change. It's because they had
- 13 access.
- So now if our students are performing
- better, then the workforce also becomes better,
- and if the workforce becomes better, then the
- 17 economy becomes better. It's not rocket science
- 18 here.
- 19 Again, there's a Scripture in the Bible,
- and I'm a Scripture man, that says, "We then that
- 21 are strong must embed the infirmities of the
- 22 weak." We believe that corporate America must

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

- 1 play a strong role in investing in our
- 2 communities. We believe that the federal
- 3 government, although it's going through its own
- 4 economic challenges, that it clearly has more
- 5 money than Seat Pleasant, Maryland does, and so
- 6 those funds should be coming into our communities
- 7 to help invest for our people.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 MR. LLOYD: Thank you.
- 10 MR. SMYRE: I just wanted to follow up
- 11 with the mayor because I think he hit a great
- 12 point as it relates to the collaboration and the
- partnerships and so did Commissioner Steele. The
- 14 essence of it is that the corporate public/private
- 15 sector have got to come together on this issue and
- from a governmental standpoint, it has to be more
- prioritized, it has to be elevated more from the
- 18 governmental standpoint. Now, the public and
- 19 private sector is always ahead of the government.
- I mean, let's just call it what it is. It is what
- 21 it is. You all are ahead of us. It just takes us
- longer to comprehend and to grasp and government

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

is slow in that respect. But at the same time, I

- 2 recall even my hometown, there is a program,
- 3 "Reach One/Teach One." And an ex-basketball
- 4 player and coach, Sam Mitchell, started a program
- 5 in a housing project where he just set up
- 6 computers and, just like the gentleman has, they
- 7 have about 20 computers in the public housing
- 8 division, and every morning there's a line there
- 9 to get in.
- 10 Our library system wanted to build a new
- library and there was a debate whether do you do a
- 12 computer Internet technology room or do you do one
- on basic learning, and there was a debate on that,
- old school and new school. And so happily, new
- school, the digital people won out, and there are
- maybe 24, 25 computers in this new library. And
- every morning, I can go by there -- not every
- morning, but I've gone by there on a morning at
- 19 8:00 to see the line eking out the door. So, the
- 20 people, they're yearning for it. We've just got
- 21 to continue to educate the underserved and the
- 22 low- income and that demographic because

1 broadband, you know, we'll grab this in a New York

- 2 second and do it, but from an application and from
- 3 a technology standpoint, it's not there. It's
- 4 just -- and black elected officials, all elected
- 5 officials have to continue to talk about this over
- 6 and over and over again so that there is some
- 7 connectivity.
- 8 MR. LLOYD: So, are there -- can any of
- 9 the panelists, and I'm going to throw this last
- 10 question out because we've got lots of questions
- 11 from the -- from both online and from the
- 12 audience, but can any of the panelists point to a
- good example of a local public/private partnership
- 14 addressing the needs, particularly, of underserved
- 15 communities?
- MR. STEELE: Well, particularly in my
- 17 neighborhood, I help to sit on a board that built
- a community center where we have a clinic in the
- 19 community center, we have a child care teaching
- 20 mothers how to expand their ability to be good
- 21 mothers, we have the park district, and we have a
- 22 technology center in that one facility. And so

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 you have four other organizations in that one

- 2 building that folks can come to one facility and
- 3 have access to many different --
- 4 MR. LLOYD: And this is a public/private
- 5 partnership?
- 6 MR. STEELE: It's a public/private
- 7 partnership because it's part of the Sears
- 8 Foundation that helped us to build it. And so we
- 9 partnered -- it is actually on the land that the
- 10 Sears Corporate had their corporate offices. And
- so when we tore down one of their old buildings,
- we built this new community center with the Sears
- 13 Foundation, and put these various not-for-profits
- in there that are now benefitting the community
- and you have young people from the community who
- are teaching technology to the older adults. You
- 17 can get your computer rebuilt there.
- And I'll tell you, it's a great time for
- us right now because we're going into the 2010
- Census, so we'll know where people are, we'll know
- 21 what people are doing. So it's a great time for
- 22 us to be working on a project like this right now

1 because it gives us the demographics of where

- 2 people are at this time.
- 3 MR. LLOYD: Thank you very much for
- 4 that. Now we have roughly an hour to go. We're
- 5 going to try to wrap up in about 45 minutes or so.
- 6 And we have, I think, more questions than we can
- 7 possibly even begin to address. So I'm going to
- 8 ask you, this is -- I think I was asked sort of
- 9 starting out whether I could ask the officials
- 10 here to speak into the mic and I don't think
- 11 that's been a problem. The challenge, I think,
- 12 with all of this -- I'm a former teacher, so I
- 13 have the same sort of challenge. The challenge is
- short answers, and so, let's see if we can -- I do
- understand the challenge, so let's see if we can
- get some short answers here so we can get as much
- of the public input as possible.
- So, one question here, again, this is
- 19 not directed at anyone in particular, can anyone
- on the panel identify any organized pushback
- 21 against a national broadband?
- Is that a no? That's about as short of

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

- 1 an answer as we're going to get.
- 2 Community colleges have taken a severe
- 3 hit in the economic downturn, increased
- 4 enrollments, decreased budgets. They have --
- 5 they're all concerned about being able to maintain
- 6 current levels of broadband. Should there be some
- 7 sort of E-Rate funding extended, particularly to
- 8 community colleges?
- 9 MR. STEELE: Well, I think it's a
- 10 positive thing. Actually, I just e-mailed my
- 11 president of the community college in my district
- this morning because he and I have that kind of
- 13 relationship, we stay very close. And he has been
- 14 a very good leader in terms of his ability to draw
- 15 students into his facility and I think it's great
- positive opportunity to use that E-Rate to provide
- 17 them with some additional digital assistance. I
- think we've got to do a better job of whatever
- 19 rate -- whatever opportunity we can, to help them
- 20 draw resources where they are training and
- 21 educating the individuals in our communities.
- We've got to provide those resources to those

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

1 individuals to grow the educational opportunities

- 2 for our communities.
- 3 MR. LLOYD: And have any of the
- 4 panelists been involved in helping the local
- 5 school districts? I believe that E-Rate funding
- 6 has been limited to K through 12 school. So, have
- 7 any of you been involved in helping those local
- 8 school systems obtain E-Rate funds to see what
- 9 sort of challenge they face?
- 10 MR. STEELE: Well, I'm a founder of an
- 11 elementary school and we've applied. We have not
- 12 received the funding just yet, but I founded -- I
- have a pre-K through eighth grade school in my
- 14 community that I founded three years ago. And
- 15 actually, I just got invited to build a school in
- Dubai because of the growth, the academic growth
- of my kids in my school, that happened so fast.
- 18 Somehow the Minister of Education in another
- 19 country got wind of this and invited me to come
- over and do a school in his country. Only because
- of the economy we're not going to open the school
- 22 this January because we were planning to open it

- 1 next month.
- 2 MR. LLOYD: But you have applied for
- 3 E-Rate --
- 4 MR. STEELE: Absolutely, yes.
- 5 MR. LLOYD: -- funding for a local
- 6 public elementary school?
- 7 MR. STEELE: That is correct.
- 8 MR. LLOYD: But no funding?
- 9 MR. STEELE: No funding just yet. I
- 10 mean, again, it's competitive and so we have to
- 11 kind of reassess and go after it again.
- MR. LLOYD: Who is calculating the
- economic impact in dollars and cents of expanding
- 14 application to broadband and reducing costs?
- 15 Could these funds be used to expand access and
- 16 adoption?
- 17 Mr. West, you were running something
- 18 about the think tank. Do you have any sense of
- who's doing this work about the economic impact in
- 20 expanding?
- 21 MR. WEST: I think, I believe that most
- 22 everybody is looking at different areas in that.

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING 706 Duke Street, Suite 100 Alexandria, VA 22314 Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190 www.andersonreporting.net

1 I think that, yes, you mentioned a joint center,

- but I know the PEW is looking at it, also; all the
- 3 individual economists and all the different
- 4 providers are doing this, so they're all looking
- 5 at different portions of it. And when we studied
- 6 the issue, you know, we're polling from so many
- 7 different areas, polling data, but is the question
- 8 referring -- is the question saying that they
- 9 should use the funding that they're using for
- 10 research and use that for adoption? Is that
- 11 what's implied in that question? Do you --
- MR. LLOYD: Well, again, as I understand
- it, I think -- and to some extent, part of this is
- some of the work that the FCC is looking at. It
- is -- we talk an awful lot about the cost of
- 16 funding and I've been talking about the cost of
- funding. I've got funding on my mind. But what's
- 18 the impact? And so, if you -- what are the
- 19 benefits of making sure that all Americans have
- 20 broadband? Might that return additional dollars
- 21 that we were not anticipating to local, state,
- 22 federal governments? And so, what is the impact

of this and the savings? I just got one note

- 2 saying "the savings" helping me out just in time.
- 3 MR. WEST: I can only say that the
- 4 economic multiplier effect, trying to evaluate the
- 5 economic multiplier effect and the advantages
- 6 would be very difficult. It's endless. The only
- 7 thing I can say there.
- 8 MR. LLOYD: Commissioner Steele, you
- 9 were nodding as if you might actually have the
- 10 answer to this question.
- 11 MR. STEELE: No, no, no, no. I'll let
- 12 them stay with my colleague here.
- MR. LLOYD: All right. You have all
- 14 addressed the critical challenges and benefits of
- 15 broadband adoption and clearly outlined the needs
- of minority communities, but I want to pose a
- 17 question about another area of need: Educating
- 18 underserved communities on the value of online
- 19 tools and career success and entrepreneurship. We
- 20 all talk about digital literacy programs, which
- 21 are extremely important, but what about education
- on the value proposition of broadband

ANDERSON COURT REPORTING
706 Duke Street, Suite 100
Alexandria, VA 22314
Phone (703) 519-7180 Fax (703) 519-7190

www.andersonreporting.net

technologies, specifically for underserved youth?

- 2 MR. STEELE: You know, I hate to be the
- 3 one who talks about so much creativity, but in my
- 4 community also we developed a program for
- 5 ex-offenders and they use computer technology as a
- 6 way to help get themselves back on track because
- 7 they've been away from the community for such a
- 8 long period of time, but to give themselves skill
- 9 levels so they can go out and market themselves to
- 10 the level that they create their own business, and
- 11 their business is sold on the Internet. And so
- they have a business where they sell products,
- where they raise bees, and all the honey that they
- 14 raise bees, is now sold in face and body type
- products. And so, this organization has used the
- 16 Internet to train ex- offenders to become good
- 17 citizens, and now they're working individuals who
- 18 are now contributing, as my colleague said, back
- into the economy. And that's what we have to do.
- 20 And the Internet has provided that resource for
- 21 them.
- 22 MR. LLOYD: Representative -- I've been

- 1 saying Smyres -- it's Smyre?
- 2 MR. SMYRE: It's Smyre.
- 3 MR. LLOYD: I apologize.
- 4 MR. SMYRE: No problem.
- 5 MR. LLOYD: You had mentioned earlier on
- 6 about the importance of local communities helping
- 7 to dig in and find out what's working and what's
- 8 not working regarding broadband adoption and use.
- 9 Here's a question I would like to direct to you.
- 10 What research questions should the Federal
- 11 Communications Commission ask in discerning how
- its broadband policies might impact the closing of
- 13 the digital divide? What are the questions that
- 14 we should be asking from your point of view?
- MR. SMYRE: I think that once you delve
- off into this issue the question of accessibility,
- the question of affordability, and how it can be
- 18 successful. I think that having -- when I heard
- 19 that you were having panelists all across the
- 20 country, I was eager to participate as I am here
- 21 today just coming off our annual conference that
- 22 we had on broadband technology at Ft. Lauderdale,

and those are some questions that we have. You

- 2 know, what's going to be accessible, what's
- 3 affordability, what is funding, what kind of
- apparatus, what kind of resources are going to be
- 5 available and how is it applicable to quality of
- 6 life? So, it's those types of key component.
- 7 And, of course, in a lot of instances, funding,
- 8 and the ability to be able to implement the policy
- 9 and lots of times we partnership with the federal
- 10 government and it starts off in a partnership
- 11 fashion, but it's born on the expense of the local
- 12 municipalities and the states. So to us funding
- is key as it relates to how we implement this
- 14 policy.
- MR. LLOYD: Thank you. Mayor Grant, one
- of the challenges is that even in relatively small
- 17 communities, these are complex organizations that
- 18 you are managing. How do local officials manage
- 19 competing broadband meetings among the school
- 20 board, police, fire, rescue, libraries, and other
- 21 public services?
- 22 MR. GRANT: Well, obviously I think the

1 answer is within the question, that it is a

- 2 challenge. Every aspect of government is
- 3 competing for resources for their various
- 4 departments. Citizens are demanding or advocating
- on behalf of various departments. We don't have a
- 6 large citizen core or advocacy group necessarily
- 7 in many of our communities that are advocating
- 8 let's set up a broadband. What they're asking for
- 9 is police services, they're asking for better
- 10 schools, they're asking for various things, but
- 11 not necessarily broadband.
- 12 I think one of the previous questions
- 13 kind of alluded to that. is how do we educate the
- 14 public and how do we engage the public more so
- that they can understand that if you are having
- 16 access, if you're connected to the world --
- 17 because most of our communities are not connected
- to the world and they're barely connected within
- 19 their own communities. In these rural communities
- 20 they live so far from urban centers or city
- 21 centers where they can access information.
- 22 So, we don't have advocacy groups that

1 are necessarily coming to us in many of our

- 2 communities, particularly the smaller, rural
- 3 communities, that are asking for the broadband,
- 4 they're asking for the basic services.
- 5 MR. LLOYD: Thank you. So, here's a
- 6 question for anyone who wants to take this on.
- 7 How can the FCC make it easier for local
- 8 governments to make the hard decisions on eminent
- 9 domain for broadband decisions that will require
- 10 designation of broadband as a public focus?
- 11 So, are there -- I know there was a
- 12 recommendation about continuing to work with the
- 13 IAC, but are there any recommendations from this
- panel on what the Broadband Plan should include so
- that the FCC can help with the hard decisions
- 16 regarding questions related to eminent domain?
- MR. WEST: I would have to say, Mr.
- 18 Lloyd, that the FCC is definitely going to have to
- 19 present some sort of criteria to state and local
- 20 governments on how they should evaluate when to
- 21 use eminent domain and give them some sort of -- I
- 22 think that they are in need of some sort of

1 evaluation system and that they can use in

- 2 evaluating what qualifies as good for the public
- 3 use, is for the public versus, you know, to help
- 4 somebody -- an individual get wealthy.
- 5 MR. LLOYD: So, if I understand the
- 6 recommendation, it is that you are suggesting that
- 7 the FCC in the Broadband Plan be specific about
- 8 the criteria that local governments need to look
- 9 at in exercising eminent domain for public
- 10 purpose. That simply saying that local
- 11 government's going to exercise eminent domain is
- 12 not sufficient, but that it is important for the
- 13 FCC to lay out, here's the criteria --
- MR. WEST: These are some guidelines
- 15 that you should use in evaluating whether, you
- 16 know, whether you should use eminent domain or
- 17 not.
- MR. LLOYD: So, we had a couple of
- 19 questions here about the relationship really
- 20 between state and local governments. So this
- 21 question is, how should states prioritize their
- 22 recommendations to NTIA for local adoption,

1 computer centers, and deployment programs? So, is

- 2 there -- as distinct from the work that local
- 3 municipalities engage in, are there things that
- 4 states should be doing that might be applying for
- 5 broadband grants in relationship to NTIA funds or
- 6 Recovery Act funds, to help the local communities
- 7 adopt and fund computer centers and other
- 8 deployment programs?
- 9 MR. STEELE: Well, I think it's an
- 10 opportunity for states to look at where they can
- influence replication. I think it's quite
- important that you draw upon the ability to create
- centers where you can give visitors -- we could
- 14 come in and we can replicate this in other areas
- of our state by looking at what's been modeled in
- 16 the areas. For instance, Chicago, we know it's a
- 17 center of tourism, an attraction, and so many
- 18 people visit us there for a variety of different
- 19 reasons and so we can invite individuals to come
- 20 by whether they live in our state or not, where
- 21 they could come see our center that's working very
- 22 well. It's a way of saying, we will replicate

1 this in other areas of the state, in other states

- 2 across the United States, and that's why
- 3 replication is very important for our valuation
- 4 total.
- 5 MR. WEST: Mr. Lloyd, I just wanted to
- 6 add one quick thing to that. One of the big
- 7 concerns of the communities of color is the
- 8 politics that will come in. You know, when you
- 9 get a particular governor, if he's a -- you know,
- 10 whenever it seems political considerations come
- in, we're going to get the short end of the stick.
- 12 So anything that can go into the equation,
- 13 eliminate the politics, you know, rewarding
- 14 whoever voted for you or that sort of thing, would
- 15 help.
- MR. SMYRE: That's why I believe in a
- 17 National Broadband Policy and not allowing the
- 18 states -- because, as you said, jurisdictions are
- 19 different, politics are different. But, at the
- 20 same time, if there is a -- if there are
- 21 guidelines and a national policy, we won't have a
- 22 hodgepodge of various state laws around the

- 1 country.
- 2 MR. LLOYD: So, I've got several online
- 3 questions here. One is, are there special things
- 4 that local officials who are trying to help
- 5 underserved communities doing to ensure that 8A
- 6 contractors are included in the local VTOP -- or I
- 7 would assume Broadband Initiative Program as well
- 8 -- initiatives, in accordance with the Recovery
- 9 Act? So, are there some things that the local
- 10 officials are doing to make sure that 8A
- 11 contractors are involved in some of this work?
- MR. SMYRE: Well, at the state level, we
- try to encourage that in some areas of the
- 14 Reinvestment Recovery Act. There are some areas
- 15 where it's easier to do. In the area of
- transportation, in some vending areas we're able
- to make it applicable as it relates to some of the
- 18 contractors. But in some areas we're -- as a
- 19 state government, we don't have the applicable
- laws that will make it applicable to a contractor.
- 21 It has to be related to a linkage between the
- 22 federal government and that particular agency and

1 the one that is crystallized to me in my state is

- 2 transportation and that area, we have more
- 3 leverage and more leeway, on the other areas, more
- 4 restrictive.
- 5 MR. LLOYD: So, here's an online
- 6 question that I think came in during the time of
- 7 Mayor Grant's statement. How can a private
- 8 company looking to develop private/public
- 9 partnerships for broadband initiatives to
- 10 underserved communities -- how and where do we --
- 11 I'm assuming this is a private company asking --
- 12 how and where do we start the process?
- 13 MR. GRANT: Clearly, you start at the
- 14 mayor's office. But seriously, and I appreciate
- 15 that question because it takes me to another
- 16 direction. National Caucus of Black Mayors, 650
- of us, the largest municipality would be the
- 18 federal government. One of the smallest has less
- 19 than 100 residents in it. The majority of our
- 20 membership would be in very small, rural
- 21 communities. And so, with that understood, we
- 22 have a capacity issue and it's a serious capacity

1 issue to address some of these issues. So, that

- 2 makes the partnerships with corporate America even
- 3 more valuable to us.
- We don't have the dollars to hire a Mark
- 5 Lloyd to work for us because we couldn't afford
- 6 you, and so -- or your counterparts -- to put
- 7 together the applications, to put together the
- 8 plans, develop the plans, so that we could go
- 9 after funding that might be available. So, it
- 10 becomes very important that our corporate partners
- 11 begin to look at us as opportunities and come in
- 12 with our bids and proposals, that we can negotiate
- 13 together with to go after the funding that exists
- 14 out there to support our communities.
- MR. LLOYD: So, I think you've given the
- 16 questioner both, come to the mayor's office and
- here's what you need to bring.
- This was a question that came in during
- 19 Commissioner Steele's presentation. For what
- 20 purposes is broadband being used by these
- 21 households? And do these groups publish their
- 22 curriculum for public review?

1 MR. STEELE: I don't know if anything is

- 2 being published, but the use of broadband
- 3 primarily for these households will impact them in
- 4 the employment area, people who are looking for
- 5 jobs. I need jobs right now. And so most of the
- 6 companies, and most of the major companies right
- 7 now, are publishing their job openings online, and
- 8 so that's the best way of getting access to those
- 9 job openings.
- 10 Health care and health concerns, most of
- 11 us we get a cold or our baby gets sick, we're
- going to find out what we can do online first of
- 13 all before we go to the doctor.
- 14 And thirdly, the opportunity for most
- people who are looking for education to grow their
- skill level. They're going online because it's
- 17 the cheapest way to get your education without
- having to go to a classroom. And so, those are
- 19 the three best ways to look at what broadband does
- in your household.
- 21 MR. LLOYD: In the context of need, are
- 22 any of the panelists aware of ways to increase

1 broadband access in public housing communities

- where federal funding for centers is decreasing?
- 3 MR. SMYRE: I'll tell you, in the
- 4 Edgewood Terrace area here in D.C., they have the
- 5 program where it was a collaboration between HUD
- 6 and a couple other preservation areas and they
- focused on installing new broadband technology in
- 8 every residence and I think that would be a good
- 9 public policy that we would deploy broadband to
- 10 each individual residence if anything new is
- 11 built, that automatically has access, the Internet
- 12 capabilities and deployment of broadband
- 13 technology. And in Edgewood it had a direct
- impact on violence, crimes, on gang-related
- 15 activities, and they saw the increase of
- individual performance of all the young people in
- 17 Edgewood Terrace. So, those are some of the areas
- that we can, from a public policy standpoint, that
- 19 any new -- because if you try to go now and
- 20 retrofit, it probably would be out of the realm of
- 21 the budgetary considerations. But anything HUD
- 22 builds now and new, should be broadband deployment

and Internet access in every residence in my

- 2 opinion.
- 3 MR. STEELE: HUD currently has a
- 4 contract with a company here in (inaudible) Silver
- 5 Spring, that has 2,300 centers in public housing
- 6 across the country. So, this is not new. This is
- 7 something that's been going on for quite some
- 8 time. So, HUD does have a provider right now that
- 9 is specializing in putting computer centers in
- 10 public housing facilities across the country.
- 11 MR. LLOYD: One of the most difficult
- 12 things, I think, that any public official has to
- do is to sort of own up to the fact that there are
- 14 priorities and that we're not going to be able to
- do everything. And so I'm going to ask you each
- 16 to do this very difficult thing. I'm going to --
- 17 there are three questions here. This is a
- 18 question from the audience. I'm going to ask you
- 19 to rank the priorities for us.
- 20 Adoption, promoting adoption, making
- 21 sure that there is access, number two, or making
- 22 sure that whatever is provided is affordable. And

that might be done, I would assume, through

- 2 universal service subsidies or whatever, but
- 3 assuming limited dollars, where would you put the
- 4 priority? Adoption? Access? Or affordability?
- 5 Representative Smyre?
- 6 MR. SMYRE: Why am I always first? I
- 7 would have to say access and affordability.
- 8 MR. LLOYD: Number one and two?
- 9 MR. SMYRE: Yeah.
- 10 MR. LLOYD: Access, affordability, and
- 11 then adoption.
- MR. SMYRE: Well, it's --
- MR. LLOYD: I know it's tough.
- MR. SMYRE: Yes.
- MR. LLOYD: Okay. Mr. West?
- MR. WEST: I'm sorry, Mr. Lloyd. I
- 17 can't rank those. Every situation is different.
- I mean, every community is different. I mean, you
- 19 know, if you're in the middle of Kansas and the
- 20 middle of inner-city Chicago, there's two
- 21 different priorities, so they're all important.
- 22 MR. LLOYD: So, based on -- you would

1 say based on the particular need of the community?

- 2 MR. WEST: Yes, absolutely.
- 3 MR. SMYRE: I would say that as well. I
- 4 was -- being from Georgia, I flew to Des Moines,
- 5 Iowa, for a day with state legislators out there
- 6 and I met with the Farm Bureau, and their key was
- 7 the accessibility. I mean, you've got it -- they
- 8 have to have it in rural areas and it's a lot
- 9 different from a Chicago, so it's just -- it's
- 10 hard -- I agree with Gus. It's just hard to take
- one yardstick and measure everybody by it. But
- 12 that's just -- in that area, because of the
- density, it's having the accessible, having the
- impact of the lines and the pipes coming, to me.
- MR. LLOYD: So, one of the challenges is
- 16 -- I mean, I'm not a former political leader, but
- I am a former journalist and I'm certainly used to
- speaking to political leaders and getting answers
- 19 that sort of, well, you know, we want a little bit
- 20 of everything.
- 21 I'm going to try it with you,
- 22 Commissioner Steele. Access, affordability,

1 adoption? Which of those ought to come -- and if

- 2 we have to come up with a priority?
- 3 MR. STEELE: For me it's a little
- 4 different because I come from a major urban
- 5 environment and so for me adoption would be first.
- 6 You've got to give direction to people, so if you
- 7 don't give direction to the providers or direction
- 8 to government officials on what we're trying to
- 9 do, then you kind of leave people hanging out
- 10 there. So, you've got to give adoption as for me,
- 11 number one.
- Two, access. Who's going to be using
- it? You know, so that's number two for me is
- 14 access.
- 15 And then number three, affordability.
- Where can you use it, you know? So those are my
- 17 priorities on how I would look at it.
- 18 MR. LLOYD: Great. Great, I appreciate
- 19 that. And Mayor Grant, you have no excuse. You
- 20 have a particular community that you can talk
- about, so access, affordability, adoption?
- 22 MR. GRANT: Well, I mean, if you -- and

1 I'm glad that Calvin went first. But really, if

- 2 you're speaking about our community, really at
- 3 this point in time, it's really about
- 4 affordability. We have access and it's already
- 5 adoption. I mean, I'm not from one of those
- 6 communities that are rural in the South or
- 7 something. I mean, we have access to two
- 8 broadband and Internet, so it's about
- 9 affordability.
- 10 MR. LLOYD: So, are you one of those
- 11 Marylanders who don't think you're in the South?
- 12 What content are local and state
- 13 governments providing for their constituents and
- what will they get when broadband becomes
- 15 available? And so, this is a question about what
- 16 comes first, the chicken or the egg, the content
- or the access. And so, what is the content that
- 18 local and state governments are providing to --
- 19 well, to spur adoption in local communities?
- 20 MR. STEELE: Well, from my point of view
- 21 in Cook County, it's so important that we provide
- 22 our citizenry and those who are in those

1 underprivileged and underserved communities

- 2 opportunity to access that information that is
- 3 best utilized and will improve their quality of
- 4 life. And so, the opportunity for employment, you
- 5 know, what kind of job availability do we have in
- 6 Cook County that can help individuals? We have
- 7 one of the largest zoos in the country that is
- 8 managed by Cook County. And so, folks can have
- 9 access to jobs at the zoo. We have one of the
- 10 largest gardens, a 40,000 acre garden that's one
- of the largest in the country where we have a
- variety of different jobs, seasonal jobs, so
- people can have access to that facility to learn a
- 14 different type of skill level.
- 15 And so, that access to information that
- 16 can really improve their quality of life somehow
- is most important that we can provide to those
- 18 residents.
- MR. LLOYD: So, we're getting to roughly
- about the time that I wanted to try and wrap up,
- 21 but I wanted to give each of the panelists an
- 22 opportunity to make a closing statement and

1 provide a final thought. If we've missed anything

- 2 that you want to make sure that you communicate to
- 3 the FCC, what would that be? Is there some
- 4 emphasis that you wanted to leave us with here?
- 5 And we don't have to start with Representative
- 6 Smyre.
- 7 MR. WEST: I just wanted to say a couple
- 8 of things to -- this is more directed at the local
- 9 leaders who are often in charge of our school
- 10 districts and so forth. I always look for ways to
- 11 try to get somebody on the Internet reason.
- 12 Sometimes if you give them a reason that they have
- 13 to be on then they'll get on. And, you know, I
- had an employee working for me and I said, hey, I
- 15 need your e-mail so you can get your check stub --
- 16 because she had a direct deposit -- and anyway, it
- gave her a reason to get an e-mail and try to get
- 18 on.
- One thing I thought that was very
- 20 interesting is we have in my son's class -- they
- 21 have a listserv and all the parents need to be on
- this listserv because if you're not on, then you

don't know what's happening with your child that

- day, you're not part of it. And I know that there
- 3 will be a few parents that may not get on that
- 4 listserv, but if you give them that reason -- so,
- 5 if the mayors and the ones that are in charge of
- 6 these school districts and so forth, if they could
- 7 ask each classroom, each teacher, to have a
- 8 listserv with all the parents on that particular
- 9 listserv and just stay in contact with what's
- 10 happening with their child, that could be
- interesting, it could be helpful.
- Just in closing message to the Federal
- 13 Communications Commission, you know, and I said
- 14 this -- we were having dinner last night, I said,
- 15 I know that the Federal Communications Commission
- 16 can walk and chew gum at the same time, but also
- 17 I've been in congressional testimony where you've
- 18 talked about the lack of resources, needing more
- 19 resources to perform the job that you -- it's only
- 20 again that earlier message that I had that the
- 21 focus should -- the primary focus, the wholly
- focus, if you will, is the digital divide and to

1 the extent that anything gets in that way, I

- 2 think, is detrimental to our community.
- 3 MR. LLOYD: Thank you. Appreciate that.
- 4 Commissioner Steele?
- 5 MR. STEELE: Well, I think it's quite
- 6 important that I share the message that these
- 7 individuals sitting to my left and to my right:
- 8 We are the dash. And what I mean by "we are the
- 9 dash" is broadband adoption started in 2009 and by
- 10 2010, that dash in between, because we are where
- 11 the rubber meets the road. We're the ones who
- 12 take the message back to the individuals in our
- 13 communities, and so we want to make sure that that
- dash does not have a closing side to it. We want
- to continue to work to make sure that we're
- bringing information back to our community that's
- going to be helpful to them.
- And on a much broader scale as computers
- 19 are getting smaller, they're two pounds now, and
- they're even ounces -- they're even ounces now --
- 21 we have to make sure our people that we represent,
- 22 have access. And that's what we're trying to do.

1 MR. LLOYD: Thank you, thank you. Mayor

- 2 Grant.
- 3 MR. GRANT: Well, just in closing,
- 4 again, thank you so very much on behalf of the
- 5 National Conference of Black Mayors, for allowing
- 6 us to participate. And I thank my colleagues as
- 7 well for their leadership and their service in
- 8 this effort and those who are in the audience.
- 9 If America is to be the great hope and
- 10 great promise that we know that it can be, it is
- important that the FCC's work move toward
- 12 inclusion of all of its citizenry, that its
- 13 efforts must make certain that as they move
- forward and work to have access for all Americans,
- 15 then America can be the strong and true beacon
- light of democracy, and hope, and freedom for the
- world.
- 18 If we leave anybody behind, we allow our
- 19 country to not realize its full potential. And
- so, as the FCC commissioners move forward with the
- 21 Broadband Plan, they must keep in the forefront of
- 22 their mind that all of America must be able to

- 1 have access.
- 2 MR. LLOYD: Representative Smyre, you'll
- 3 have the final words.
- 4 MR. SMYRE: Thank you very much, Mr.
- 5 Lloyd, for this opportunity for us to come as
- 6 elected officials, the only people in America that
- 7 set public policy are elected officials. The only
- 8 people in America that set public policy are
- 9 elected officials. The FCC implements public
- 10 policy. And so those of us who are elected, and
- 11 as members of the National Black Caucus of State
- 12 Legislators, as we -- and as the FCC implements
- 13 the National Broadband Plan, we just ask that you
- 14 adopt one that keeps all Americans in mind,
- 15 particularly those living in low-income, minority,
- 16 rural, tribal, and underserved communities.
- 17 I have 13 recommendations for the
- implementation that I didn't get a chance to talk
- about in our opening statement, but I just want to
- 20 mention three of them in pursuit of the
- 21 implementation and one is fund and conduct
- 22 quantitative and qualitative research focused

specifically on broadband connectivity, adoption,

- 2 and the use among people of color, particularly
- 3 those in un-served and underserved communities.
- 4 The second one is complete the
- 5 deployment of broadband networks to the
- 6 underserved areas including rural communities and
- 7 Native American tribal lands and link the network
- 8 to public institution and community based
- 9 organizations as supplements to home-based
- 10 service.
- 11 And the last one is address
- 12 affordability issues, through initiatives such as
- 13 federal general revenue, funding subsidies for
- 14 computing devices, and broadband Internet service,
- and public/private partnerships that can be
- leveraged to create greater access and adoption
- opportunities or other policies that overcome
- 18 price barriers. Affordability is a key component
- 19 with our constituencies.
- So, with that in mind, I again thank you
- 21 and the FCC for giving us this opportunity to be a
- voice and to be a participant in this issue of

Т	broadband technology. Thank you.
2	MR. LLOYD: Well, and I want to thank
3	all of the panelists for sharing your valuable
4	time. I know that you folks have got other things
5	to do, but it's very important that we have been
6	able to hear from you and gain your wisdom and
7	your insight as we construct this plan. And I
8	promise you, we will not lose focus. We're going
9	to make sure that we come up with a plan and get
10	it to Congress on our deadline.
11	So, again, and if the audience could
12	join me in thanking the panel, I really appreciate
13	your doing this. Thank you very much.
14	(Whereupon, at 11:30 a.m., the
15	PROCEEDINGS were adjourned.)
16	* * * *
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

1	CERTIFICATE OF NOTARY PUBLIC				
2	I, Carleton J. Anderson, III do hereby				
3	certify that the forgoing electronic file when				
4	originally transmitted was reduced to text at my				
5	direction; that said transcript is a true record				
6	of the proceedings therein referenced; that I am				
7	neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by				
8	any of the parties to the action in which these				
9	proceedings were taken; and, furthermore, that I				
10	am neither a relative or employee of any attorney				
11	or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor				
12	financially or otherwise interested in the outcome				
13	of this action.				
14	/s/Carleton J. Anderson, III				
15					
16					
17	Notary Public in and for the				
18	Commonwealth of Virginia				
19	Commission No. 351998				
20	Expires: November 30, 2012				
21					
22					