

The USDA logo features the letters "USDA" in a bold, serif font, positioned above a stylized graphic of a field with a horizon line.

United States
Department
of Agriculture

Economic
Information
Bulletin
Number 2

May 2005



A Report from the Economic Research Service

www.ers.usda.gov

Crop Genetic Resources

An Economic Appraisal

**Kelly Day Rubenstein, Paul Heisey,
Robbin Shoemaker, John Sullivan,
and George Frisvold**

Abstract: Crop genetic resources are the basis of agricultural production, and significant economic benefits have resulted from their conservation and use. However, crop genetic resources are largely public goods, so private incentives for genetic resource conservation may fall short of achieving public objectives. Within the U.S. germplasm system, certain crop collections lack sufficient diversity to reduce vulnerability to pests and diseases. Many such genetic resources lie outside the United States. This report examines the role of genetic resources, genetic diversity, and efforts to value genetic resources. The report also evaluates economic and institutional factors influencing the flow of genetic resources, including international agreements, and their significance for agricultural research and development in the United States.

Keywords: Genetic resources, genetic diversity, germplasm, R&D, international transfer of genetic resources, *in situ* conservation, *ex situ* conservation, gene banks, intellectual property.

Acknowledgments: The authors wish to thank Allan Stoner, Henry Shands, and Peter Bretting for their thoughtful reviews and their valuable comments. Thanks for reviews above and beyond the call of duty belong to June Blalock, whose patience and insight were critical to the production of this report. We also thank Joe Cooper who reviewed portions of the manuscripts. Keith Wiebe provided helpful guidance in the development of the final draft. We thank Dale Simms for his excellent editorial work and Susan DeGeorge for her help with graphics and layout.

Contents

Summary	iii
Introduction	1
Origins of Crop Genetic Diversity	2
Current Challenges	2
Economic Values of Crop Genetic Resources	5
Estimating the Benefits of Genetic Enhancement	5
Searching for Valuable Genetic Resources	9
Factors Influencing Trends in Crop Genetic Diversity	12
Habitat Loss	13
Displacement of Landraces by Scientifically Bred Varieties	14
Genetic Uniformity in Scientifically Bred Varieties	16
Conservation of Plant Genetic Resources	18
Basic Conservation Strategies	18
Policy Tools To Promote Genetic Resource Conservation	20
Multilateral Agreements Affecting Plant Genetic Resources	24
Financing International Conservation of Genetic Resources	26
References	29
Appendix: Measuring Crop Genetic Diversity	39

Summary

Half the yield gains in major U.S. cereal crops since the 1930s are attributed to genetic improvements. Demand for crops continues to grow, and environmental conditions change, so continued productivity growth—and the genetic diversity that helps sustain it—remains important. Genetic diversity can be conserved in farmers' fields, in ecosystems that contain wild relatives of cultivated varieties, and in national or international germplasm collections. It is difficult to determine the best mix of conservation strategies. Regardless, the use of genetic resources by one farmer or plant breeder does not preclude their use by another, so private incentives to sustain diverse genetic resources are low. This motivates public measures (and underlying research) to conserve genetic resources.

What Is the Issue?

Crop genetic resources are the basis from which all crop production stems. But habitat loss, the dominance of scientifically bred over farmer-developed varieties, and genetic uniformity are all threats to continued diversity. Plant breeders need diverse germplasm to sustain productivity growth. The U.S. system for genetic resource conservation may lack sufficient diversity to reduce some crops' vulnerability to pests and diseases. The genetic uniformity of many modern crop varieties has also raised concerns that crop yields and production will become more vulnerable to evolving pests and diseases. At the same time, genetic resource conservation is expensive, and both private incentives and public funding are limited.

Many sources of diverse genetic resources lie outside the United States. To slow or prevent loss of crop genetic diversity worldwide, international agreements have been designed to encourage preservation of genetic diversity and promote the exchange of germplasm. For example, the new International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture will govern the exchange of germplasm for crops like wheat, maize, and cotton. But implementation has been hampered by a lack of consensus among the treaty's parties on the value of particular genetic resources. Thus, many of the treaty's provisions, such as procedures for transferring germplasm, are still vague. U.S. policymakers and genetic resource managers will face new exchange terms and rules governing the sharing of benefits from commercialized products among the treaty's parties, so the time is right to examine of the costs and benefits of conserving genetic resources.

What Did the Study Find?

Since crop genetic resources are largely public goods, private returns to the holders of crop genetic resources are lower than their values to the world. Thus, private incentives for conservation are likely not sufficient to achieve a level of crop genetic diversity that is socially optimal. Significant economic benefits derive from conserving and using genetic resources. For example, a one-time, permanent yield increase from genetic improvements for five major U.S. crops has generated an estimated \$8.1-billion gain in economic welfare worldwide. The estimated stream of benefits from genetic enhancement activities exceeds the cost of investments in genetic resource preservation and use. Consumers in both the developed and developing world have benefited from

higher yields and lower world prices for food. Without continued genetic enhancement using diverse germplasm from both wild and modified sources, the gains in crop yields obtained over the past seven decades are not sustainable, and yields might eventually grow more slowly (or even decline). Agricultural production increasingly relies on “temporal diversity,” changing varieties more frequently to maintain resistance to pests and diseases.

Three factors contribute to loss of genetic diversity—habitat loss, conversion from landraces (farmer-developed varieties) to scientifically bred varieties, and genetic uniformity in scientifically bred varieties. The loss of wild relatives occurs mainly through habitat conversion for agricultural use. Habitat loss is particularly problematic in developing countries, which often face greater pressures for wild land conversion than do developed countries. Crop genetic diversity also has diminished as landraces are displaced by scientifically developed varieties. Studies show that far less area is planted to landraces worldwide than a century ago. Finally, crop genetic diversity may decline with reductions in total numbers of varieties, concentration of area planted in a few favored varieties, or reductions in the “genetic distance” between these varieties. Thus far, yields for many major crops have been relatively stable as a result, at least in part, of frequent changes in modern varieties and breeders’ continued access to diverse genetic resources.

This economic assessment suggests that crop genetic resources are essential to maintaining and improving agricultural productivity. However, a General Accounting Office (1997) study found that current conservation efforts may fall short of what scientists believe are necessary levels for future crop breeding needs, suggesting a role for public policy. Policy initiatives include broad-based programs of multilateral and bilateral financial assistance, stronger intellectual property rights, and international agreements for germplasm exchange. But institutional constraints may prevent these initiatives from achieving their stated goals.

How Was the Study Conducted?

This report examines the role of genetic resources and genetic diversity in agricultural production, and efforts to value genetic resources. From a review of published literature, the report addresses the value of genetic improvements over time and among regions of the world. Given the role of genetic diversity in minimizing pest and disease epidemics, the report explores how incentives for land conservation, the breeding process, and access to modern varieties can affect diversity in the field.

The report also evaluates economic and institutional factors influencing the flow of genetic resources—including international agreements such as the Convention on Biological Diversity and the International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture—and their significance for agricultural research and development in the United States. This report synthesizes existing literature to review three proposed policy tools to conserve plant genetic resources: (1) public investments in genetic resource preservation in their natural settings (*in situ* conservation) and of genetic resources saved in gene banks (*ex situ* conservation); (2) stronger intellectual property rights over genetic inventions, particularly in developing countries; and (3) agreements for transferring genetic materials among countries.