

Federal Trade Commission Staff Reports

The Residential Real Estate Brokerage Industry

Los Angeles Regional Office Staff Report:
Volumes I and II
and
The Butters Report

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

JUN 09 1983

LIBRARY

December, 1983

Federal Trade Commission
A Staff Report by the Los Angeles Regional Office

The Residential Real Estate Brokerage Industry

Volume I

December, 1983

Disclaimer: The views expressed in this document are those of individual staff members. They do not necessarily reflect the views either of the Federal Trade Commission, of any individual Commissioner, or of any Federal Trade Commission Bureau.

HD1382

.2

.25F4

1983b

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report, and the investigation which preceded it, are the results of a cooperative effort coordinated by the Los Angeles Regional Office and involving also staff from the Seattle Regional Office and the Bureau of Economics, under the joint sponsorship of the Bureau of Competition and Consumer Protection. In addition to FTC staff, major contributions were made by a number of outside consultants, whose works are frequently cited. Staff gratefully acknowledges the assistance of all those who contributed. While they share in the credit for completion of the project the Los Angeles Regional Office staff was responsible for the many compromises of the final report.

Los Angeles Regional Office staff:

Paul Roark, Co-coordinator
Tom Papageorge, Co-coordinator

Investigators:

Ann Guler
Jess Martinez
Chuck McGourty
Bret Smart

Seattle Regional Office staff:

Randall Bartlett
Rachel Garson
Michael Katz
David Pender
Stephan Phillips

FEDERAL TRADE
COMMISSION



LIBRARY

OCT 31 1988

TABLE OF CONTENTS
FOR VOLUME I

Library

	<u>Page</u>
INTRODUCTION	1
GLOSSARY OF TERMS	4
I. SUMMARY	7
A. Background: The Typical Residential Real Estate Sales Transactions	7
B. Summary of Chapter II: Residential Real Estate Brokerage: An Analytical Framework	9
1. The Brokerage Process: Selling Information and Service	9
2. Special Problems Which Can Arise in Brokering Information About Housing Which Is for Sale	10
3. The Pricing of Brokerage Services	11
C. Summary of Chapter III: Industry Performance	12
1. Prices, Costs, and Resource Utilization	12
2. Consumer Information and Service	13
D. Summary of Chapter IV: Analysis of Industry Structure and Practices	14
1. Trade Associations	15
2. State Law and Agencies	16
3. Multiple Listing Services	16
4. Residential Brokerage Firms	19
5. Alternative Brokers	20

	<u>Page</u>
6. Broker/Consumer Relationship	22
7. Fee Stabilization	24
II. RESIDENTIAL REAL ESTATE BROKERAGE: AN ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK	26
A. Brokerage Services	26
1. In General	26
2. Buyers' Demand for Brokerage	26
3. Sellers' Demand	27
a. The Selling Process: What is Required?	27
b. What Can a Broker Offer?	28
B. Problems in Marketing Housing Information	29
1. In General	29
2. The "Free Rider" Concern	29
3. The Need for Pooled Listings	31
C. The Pricing of Brokerage Services	32
1. The Apparent Paradox	32
2. Factors Facilitating Possible Coordination and Collusion	33
a. In General	33
b. Low Capital Intensity	34
c. Perceived Homogeneity of Services	34
d. Inelastic Industry Demand	35
e. Long-run Upward Movement in Housing Prices	35

	<u>Page</u>
f. Ease of Detection	35
3. Interdependence among Competitors	36
a. In General	36
b. Marketing Interdependence	37
(1) The Necessity of Cooperation	37
(2) Steering	38
c. Consumer Search Problems	41
(1) Overview	41
(2) Disparagement and Harassment	41
(3) Non-Price Competition	42
III. INDUSTRY PERFORMANCE	43
A. Prices, Costs, and Resource Utilization	43
1. Prices and Costs in Real Estate Brokerage	43
a. The Evidence on Uniformity of Commission Rates	44
(1) FTC Consumer Survey	45
(2) RESPA Samples	47
(3) MLS Listing Book Samples	52
(4) Analysis of Commission Rate Uniformity	54
b. Commission Per Sale -- Annual Rates of Growth	56
c. Comparison of Commission Growth Rates with Other Data	59
2. Implications of the Pricing of Brokerage Services for Performance	62

	<u>Page</u>
a. The Cost of Brokerage	62
b. Long-run Implications of the Level of Rates	63
(1) The Use of Brokers	63
(2) The Number of Brokers	63
3. Conclusions	64
B. Consumer Information and Services	64
1. Introduction	64
2. Information Regarding the Search for a Broker	65
a. Sellers	65
(1) Seller Knowledge of Fee Negotiability	66
(2) Seller Knowledge of the Role of the Broker	67
(3) Broker Role in Providing Information	67
b. Buyers	68
(1) Buyer Knowledge of Fee Negotiability	68
(2) Buyer Knowledge of the Role of the Broker	69
(3) Broker Role in Providing Information	69
c. Conclusions	70
3. Information and Service Regarding the Search for Homes or Buyers	70
a. The Market-Making Function	70

	<u>Page</u>
(1) Self-Dealing	73
(2) "Vest-Pocket" Listings	74
(3) Steering	74
b. Representation Function	76
(1) Advisory Function	76
(2) Negotiations	78
c. Conclusion	79
4. Conclusions	79
 IV. ANALYSIS OF INDUSTRY STRUCTURES AND PRACTICES	 80
A. Trade Associations	80
1. Introductory Description of the Trade Associations	80
a. National Association of Realtors (NAR)	80
b. State Associations of Realtors	82
c. Local Boards of Realtors	83
d. Non-Realtor Trade Associations	84
2. History of the Realtor Organizations and System of Brokerage	84
a. Introduction	84
b. Chronology	85
c. The Role of Cooperation	87
(1) Early Emphasis	87
(2) Standardization	88
d. Professionalism	88

	<u>Page</u>
(1) The Meaning of Professionalism	88
(2) Entry: The Example of California	89
(3) Defining Appropriate Relationships Among the Parties	91
3. Analysis of the Realtors' Current Structure and Practices	92
a. Introduction	92
b. Control of the MLS and Other Important Services	92
(1) MLS	92
(2) Other Services	93
c. Establishment and Enforcement of Standards of Practice	93
(1) Fees	93
(2) Broker/Consumer Relationship	94
(3) Ethics and Dispute Resolution	95
d. Political and Legal Action	97
e. Education and Training	99
4. Conclusions	99
a. Historical Role of the Realtors	99
b. Current Role of the Realtors	99
B. State Law and Agencies	101
1. Introduction	101
2. State Real Estate Laws	101

	<u>Page</u>
3. State Real Estate Agencies	102
4. State Regulation Issues	102
a. State Law Provisions	102
(1) Entry/Licensing Restrictions	102
(2) Advertising Restrictions	103
(3) Disclosure Requirements	104
(4) Codes of Ethics or Equivalents	104
(5) Forms	104
(6) Net Listing Provisions	104
(7) Anti-Rebating and Anti-Incentive Provisions	105
(8) Fiduciary Responsibilities	105
b. State Agencies	106
(1) Composition	106
(2) Practices	106
C. Multiple Listing Services	107
1. Introduction	107
2. History of the MLSs	107
a. Introduction	107
b. Chronology	108
c. The Original Reasons for and Effects of Multiple Listing	110
(1) Open Listing Competition	110
(a) In General	110
(b) Listing Broker Competition	110

	<u>Page</u>
(c) Seller Competition	111
(d) Duplication of Effort	111
(2) Making a Market	112
(3) Information on Housing Prices	113
(4) Commission Rates	114
(5) Advantages to the Board	115
(6) Cooperation and Ethics	115
d. Analysis of MLS History	116
3. MLS Structure and Operations	116
a. FTC Survey	116
b. MLS Ownership	117
c. Service Area	118
d. 1978 Sales and Membership Statistics	119
e. Format of Information Collection and Dissemination	120
f. Analysis of MLS Structure and Operations ..	121
4. Membership Requirements of MLSS	121
a. In General	12
b. Board of Realtors Membership	12
(1) Description of Condition	12
(2) Analysis of Condition	12
c. Real Estate License	12
(1) Description of Condition	12
(2) Analysis of Condition	12

- d. Submission of Disputes to Arbitration 125
 - (1) Description of Condition 125
 - (2) Analysis of Condition 126
- e. Initiation Fees 126
 - (1) Description of Condition 126
 - (2) Analysis of Condition 127
- f. Other Membership Requirements 127
- g. Conclusion 128
- 5. Listing Requirements 128
 - a. In General 128
 - b. Mandatory Submission of Listings 129
 - (1) Description of Requirement 129
 - (2) Analysis of Requirement 130
 - c. Required Use of Exclusive Listing Agreements 131
 - (1) Description of Requirement 131
 - (2) Analysis of Requirement 132
- 6. Commission Rate and Split Schedules 133
 - a. Past Prevalence 133
 - b. Relevance Today 135
- 7. Commission Split Uniformity 136
- 8. Data Dissemination 138
 - a. In General 138
 - b. Property Information 138

	<u>Page</u>
c. Seller Information	138
d. Listing Broker Information	139
e. Analysis of Data Dissemination	140
9. Selling Requirements	140
a. In General	140
b. Anti-Solicitation Rules	141
(1) Description of Requirement	141
(2) Analysis of Requirement	141
c. Subagency of Cooperating Brokers	142
D. Residential Real Estate Brokerage Firms	143
1. Firm Size and Industry Concentration	143
a. Traditional Predominance of Small Firms	143
b. Entry	145
c. Growth and Entry of Large Corporations and Franchises	145
2. Importance of the Individual Brokers	148
a. Nature of the Firms	148
b. Profile of the Typical Real Estate Broker	149
c. Entry	149
E. Alternative Brokers	150
1. Market Segment	150
a. Alternative Brokers Defined	150

- b. Prevalence of Alternative Brokers 151
- 2. Alternative Broker Firm Operations 151
 - a. In General 151
 - b. Non-MLS Alternatives 153
 - c. Multiple Listing Service Alternatives 154
- 3. Problems Reported By Alternative Brokers 155
 - a. FTC Survey 155
 - b. Most Frequent First Year Problems 156
 - (1) Disparagement 156
 - (2) Negotiability of Commission Rates 159
 - (3) Refusals to Show Homes 159
 - (4) Lost and Cancelled Listings 159
 - c. MLS and Non-MLS Alternatives Compared 160
 - (1) In General 160
 - (2) "Discriminatory" Splits 160
 - (3) Unfair Grievance Proceedings 160
 - (4) Refusals by Board of Realtors to Enforce Ethical Standards 161
 - (5) Lost or Cancelled Listings 161
 - d. Change in Frequency After First Year of Operation 161
 - (1) In General 161
 - (2) Problems Decreasing Significantly in Frequency 162

	<u>Page</u>
(3) Problems Showing Little or No Decline in Frequency	162
(4) Problems Increasing in Frequency	162
e. Problems Relating to Advertising	163
(1) Refusals by Media to Run Advertisements	163
(2) Denial of Governmental Approval	163
f. Consumers' Views of Discount Brokers	164
g. Analysis of Problems	164
(1) In General	164
(2) The Most Frequent Problems	164
(3) Problems More Frequent for MLS Alternative Brokers	164
(4) Change in the Frequency of Problems After the First Year of Operation	164
(5) Advertising Problems	164
(6) Consumers' Reasons For Not Listing with Discount Brokers	17
4. The Survivors	17
a. In General	17
b. Summary Statistics	17
c. Individual Statistics	17
5. Conclusion	17
F. Broker/Consumer Relationships	17
1. Overview	17

a.	Significance of the Relationships	173
b.	Legal and Ethical Duties	173
(1)	Agency Law	174
(2)	Real Estate Licensing Law	175
(3)	Realtor Code of Ethics	175
c.	Financial Incentives	175
d.	Conflicts in the Broker's Role	176
2.	Broker/Seller	177
a.	Formal Relationship	177
b.	Problems Areas	177
(1)	In General	177
(2)	Self-Dealing	177
(3)	"Vest-Pocket" Listing	179
(4)	Negotiations	179
3.	Broker/Buyer	180
a.	Formal Relationship	180
b.	Problems Areas	181
(1)	Subagency -- Industry View	181
(2)	Reliance of Consumers	182
(3)	Conduct of Brokers	184
c.	Analysis	185
(1)	Consumer Injury	185
(a)	In General	185

	<u>Page</u>
(b) Non-Disclosure	18
(c) Under-Representation	18
(d) Lack of Legal Liability or Remedy	18
(2) State Agency Law	18
(3) The Possibility of Buyer's Representation	18
(4) Dual Agency	19
(5) Brokerage versus Representation	19
G. Fee Stabilization	19
1. Introduction	19
2. Fee Schedules	19
a. History of Fee Schedules	19
b. Importance of Fee Schedules	19
c. Current Status of Fee Schedules	19
3. Covert Price-Fixing Conspiracies	19
4. Conclusions	20

TABLE OF CONTENTS
FOR VOLUME II

APPENDIX A:	INVESTIGATIONAL METHODOLOGY
APPENDIX B:	STATE LAW AND AGENCIES
APPENDIX C:	TRADE ASSOCIATIONS
APPENDIX D:	ALTERNATIVE BROKERS
APPENDIX E:	GREAT BRITAIN: A COMPARISON
EXHIBIT A:	CONSUMER SURVEY
	1. BUYER SURVEY
	2. SELLER SURVEY
EXHIBIT B:	MULTIPLE LISTING SERVICE SURVEY
EXHIBIT C:	ALTERNATIVE BROKER SURVEY